EU RESEARCH ON
SOCIAL SCIENCES AND HUMANITIES

*Students as Journeymen Between
Communities of Higher Education
and Work*

Journeymen

EUROPEAN COMMISSION

EU RESEARCH ON
SOCIAL SCIENCES AND HUMANITIES

Students as Journeymen Between Communities of Higher Education and Work

Journeymen

Final report

HPSE-CT-2001-00068

Funded under the Key Action
'Improving the Socio-economic Knowledge Base' of FP5

DG Research
European Commission

Issued in
June 2005

Coordinator of project:
Linköping University
Sweden
Lars Owe Dahlgren, Madeleine Abrandt Dahlgren, Håkan Hult, Helene Hård af Segerstad, Kristina Johansson

Partners:
University of Oslo, NO, Gunnar Handal, Berit Karseth, Kirsten Hofgaard Lycke, Tone Dyrdal Solbrekke
University of Duisburg-Essen, DE, Manfred Bayer, Tarek Lababidi, Peter Krumpholz
University of Gdansk, PL, Tomasz Szkudlarek, Malgorzata Cackowska, Lucyna Kopciewicz, Maria Mendel, Astrid Meczkowska, Ania Struzynska

LEGAL NOTICE

A great deal of additional information on the European Union is available on the Internet.
It can be accessed through the Europa server (http://europa.eu).

Cataloguing data can be found at the end of this publication.

Printed in Belgium

<u>**Preface**</u>

Within the Fifth Community RTD Framework Programme of the European Union (1998–2002), the Key Action 'Improving the Socio-economic Knowledge Base' had broad and ambitious objectives, namely: to improve our understanding of the structural changes taking place in European society, to identify ways of managing these changes and to promote the active involvement of European citizens in shaping their own futures. A further important aim was to mobilise the research communities in the social sciences and humanities at the European level and to provide scientific support to policies at various levels, with particular attention to EU policy fields.

This Key Action had a total budget of EUR 155 million and was implemented through three Calls for proposals. As a result, 185 projects involving more than 1 600 research teams from 38 countries have been selected for funding and have started their research between 1999 and 2002.

Most of these projects are now finalised and results are systematically published in the form of a Final Report.

The calls have addressed different but interrelated research themes which have contributed to the objectives outlined above. These themes can be grouped under a certain number of areas of policy relevance, each of which are addressed by a significant number of projects from a variety of perspectives.

These areas are the following:
- *Societal trends and structural change*

16 projects, total investment of EUR 14.6 million, 164 teams
- *Quality of life of European citizens*

5 projects, total investment of EUR 6.4 million, 36 teams
- *European socio-economic models and challenges*

9 projects, total investment of EUR 9.3 million, 91 teams
- *Social cohesion, migration and welfare*

30 projects, total investment of EUR 28 million, 249 teams
- *Employment and changes in work*

18 projects, total investment of EUR 17.5 million, 149 teams
- *Gender, participation and quality of life*

13 projects, total investment of EUR 12.3 million, 97 teams
- *Dynamics of knowledge, generation and use*

8 projects, total investment of EUR 6.1 million, 77 teams
- *Education, training and new forms of learning*

14 projects, total investment of EUR 12.9 million, 105 teams
- *Economic development and dynamics*

22 projects, total investment of EUR 15.3 million, 134 teams
- *Governance, democracy and citizenship*

28 projects; total investment of EUR 25.5 million, 233 teams
- *Challenges from European enlargement*

13 projects, total investment of EUR 12.8 million, 116 teams
- *Infrastructures to build the European research area*

9 projects, total investment of EUR 15.4 million, 74 teams

This publication contains the final report of the project 'Students as Journeymen Between Communities of Higher Education and Work', whose work has primarily contributed to the area 'Education and training, employment and work'.

The report contains information about the main scientific findings of Journeymen and their policy implications. The research was carried out by four teams over a period of three years, starting in September, 2001.

The abstract and executive summary presented in this edition offer the reader an overview of the main scientific and policy conclusions, before the main body of the research provided in the other chapters of this report.

As the results of the projects financed under the Key Action become available to the scientific and policy communities, Priority 7 'Citizens and Governance in a knowledge based society' of the Sixth Framework Programme is building on the progress already made and aims at making a further contribution to the development of a European Research Area in the social sciences and the humanities.

I hope readers find the information in this publication both interesting and useful as well as clear evidence of the importance attached by the European Union to fostering research in the field of social sciences and the humanities.

J.-M. BAER,

Director

Table of contents

Acknowledgements

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. General purpose and overall design

In this project the problems of adequacy of educational institutions to the demands of the life of work are addressed. It is done in a way that enables the researchers to investigate the "human dimension" of the "human capital" issue – from the perspective of a learning person. At stake here is not only *what education makes of people*, but also *what people make of education*, i.e. the perspective is that there is a mutual interplay between institutions of higher education and the students and teachers that populate them. Another assumption is that *the same* educational initiatives might bring *different* results in different cultures.

In this project, students in higher education are viewed as "journeymen" between the cultures of higher education and work life. By studying students as individuals and as members of a culture the aim is to gain a better understanding of the relationships between cultural, educational and work life contexts.

The main aim is to enhance the understanding of *learning strategies* that students and novices apply within and across different learning environments (education and work life). Our intention is to describe students' experiences of transitions from higher education to professional life in different European countries. A further purpose is to study the development of students' and novices' *values and worldviews.* A major focus will be on the cultural diversity of academic and work institutions in some countries in Europe. The final aim is to carry out a multilevel and critical analysis of the *relationship between the formulated policies for higher education and the way students and professional novices experience higher education*.

From the national, as well as the European point of view, it is of interest to find out how the higher education systems in different European Countries prepare individuals for work life. It is also of interest to describe how work life is prepared to make use of the graduates when they enter the work force.

The key issues are the following:

- How students from different countries and study programmes understand their university culture, envisaged work and the relationship between study and work.

- How students and novices conceive of themselves as professionals.

- How newly graduated view their university education, particularly related to their future jobs.

- To enhance better understanding of what contextual factors in the work place and at the university seem crucial in influencing the students.

- To discern a "European dimension" – as regards the relationship between higher learning and professional work.

The research is undertaken in a comparative context of four European countries: Sweden, represented by Linköpings Universitet (which is also coordinating the project), Norway, represented by the University of Oslo, Poland, where the University of Gdansk is involved and Germany represented by the University of Duisburg–Essen.

In–depth interviews make up the data bank for analysing cultural differences. Data are gathered among freshmen and seniors within psychology and political science. The senior students are also interviewed after their first year of work life experience. To supplement interview data also documents regarding the different programmes have been used. Besides psychology and political science each country has interviewed an additional group of students according to their own preference.

2. Theoretical framework

The interest of research on *the transition from higher education to employment,* increased in Europe in the 1970's at the same time, as this transition process became more complicated. Awareness grew that the intermediary institutions to a large extent followed their own logic and dynamics. Thus the employers' expectations and recruitment criteria became an important area for research. To a certain extent this provided useful information as help in setting priorities in higher education. Nevertheless, these efforts never became a regular feedback for adjustments between higher education and work life. Reasons like uncertainties about recruitment criteria and the lack of routines, imperfections in identifying applicants' competencies, tactical games between higher education and work, and fluctuations in the labour market itself, indicate the impediments in elaborating a well functioning feed back system.

Steering of the relationship between higher education and work is an important factor concerning the research area. The research primarily focuses on policies in individual countries. OECD–studies, however, have undertaken some comparisons of policies in the Western European countries. These show that the political steering was quite similar in the 1960's and 1970's. Planning was widespread in the 1960's, and the economic and social needs rationale was not considered as conflicting. In the 1970's though, pessimism

of planning and discouraging of expansion of higher education took over. In the 1980's and the early 1990's studies reveal greater diversity in higher education between the European countries. In those with the greatest expansion of education, it seems as if social demand factors have been just as important as the labour market factors in determining the steering policy.

Another tendency, far from suggesting any decline, notes on the contrary the "Enhanced role of the university" and suggest to study "Triple helix" of the relationships between university, industry, and government (Etzkowitz et al., 2000). As Etzkowitz et al. note,

> In a knowledge–based economy, the university becomes a key element of the innovation system both as human capital provider and seedbed of new firms. Three institutional spheres (public, private and academic), that formerly operated at arms length in laissez faire societies, are increasingly interwoven with a spiral pattern of linkages emerging at various stages of the innovation and industrial policy–making process" (ibid. p.315).

According to the demands from the outer world universities – on the one hand – give way and comply with requests from industry, government, etc. and – on the other – nourish their traditions. These mechanisms are obvious in the following observations:

European universities have to offer a two–stage structure of studies (BA degree + MA degree courses) in order to cut long–term studies and make it possible to prepare professionals in a shorter time period. It happened due to the unique EU obligation (1992) also turning universities into institutions of LL (lifelong learning) activities. Professional in–service training becomes more important than the pre– service counterparts. Basic rhetoric in these changes was taken from Jacques Delors' idea of learning societies that are constantly obtaining experiences and using knowledge (Delors, 1996; Teichler and Kehm, 1996; Mrówka, 1999; Auleytner, 1998). Poland, as a new member of the EU, is recently very much involved in increasing the scholar indicators, especially on the HE level. This country has obtained 40,8 percent scholar indicator value in 2000 (EU standard) mostly by the augmentation of the number of BA degree schools, of which a majority are private (Edukacja, 2001; Tadeusiewicz, 1997; Buchner–Jeziorska, 1996).

Universities redesigned their traditional concept of study organization based on the need to collaborate intensively with the workplaces. For example, some European universities (France, Hungary, and others) organize sandwich common courses including management and communication subjects. The purpose is to strengthen the co–

operation of the university and enterprise in high–level engineering education. The university (educator) and industrial (engineer) tutors organize the work of sandwich students. They make recommendations in the selection of the subjects, follow the educational and practical work, provide continuous technical consultation, and evaluate the student's activities (Dunai, Hufnagl, Ivanyi, 1998). Many recent projects focus on the same value: university and work in powerful synergies, e.g.: Education & Business Partnerships (Denmark, USA) designed to expose university teachers to new technologies in workplace, provide them with opportunities to interact with scientists and other technically trained professionals, and assist teachers in transferring work experiences into classrooms (Kubota, 1993); Workplace Literacy Program (US), in which worker is learner, learner is worker, employer meets educator, and all of them have opportunities for advantages through the linkage they provide (Inkster R., 1994). Some projects, especially in the US, are described in a context of the labour unions' performance. Labour education programs in co–operation with the universities have existed in the US since the 1960s. Recently, many universities have begun working with unions within their respective states to establish labour advisory boards to assist and advise labour unions and their labour canters (Naylor, 1985).

On the one hand, universities undergo the outer pressure and become servant organizations in order to submit "practice–oriented model" created by EU policy determined through the labour market economy. On the other, as analyzers note, in the inner organization they keep traditional form of performance that is known from the past (Teichler and Kehm, op.cit. Czezowski, 1994; Denek, 1998). OECD report (1993) presents HE institutions that "prefer loose connection between education and work, stating that preparation to more complicated professional tasks is possible to get in other ways" (Teichler and Kehm,op.cit.p. 66). In that context the pressure concerning labour market appears futile. HE institutions still produce the mass of unemployed people. Ulrich Teichler suggests that if this pressure is inverted and labour market undergoes universities goals, the consequences might be extremely good, e.g. universities could prepare innovative creators of new places of job. This seems more meaningful than self–employment issues (op.cit. p. 77).

3. Methodological considerations

Teichler (1996), in a review of the research on the transition between higher education and work life concludes that there is a shortage of longitudinal studies applying qualitative research methods. Most studies have rather been quantitative and emphasised issues such as employment, career patterns, identification of work tasks for novices and eventual mismatch between these and the education. These latter are,

however, quantitative studies applying pre–formulated response categories. Hence, there is a shortage of categories for describing the nature of the relationships between higher education and work life demands. Furthermore, there is a shortage of studies illuminating how students make use in work life of their skills and knowledge acquired during their studies (Teichle r 1999 a). Another shortage in previous studies on the impact of higher education on the students' subsequent career is that they often focus on a specific programme and thereby lack comparisons with other programmes, which jeopardises the gene ralisability of the conclusions (Teacher 1999 a).

The methodological approach applied in the project is chosen in order to avoid some of the shortcomings in previous research pointed out by Teichler (ibid.). Hence, there has been an endeavour to arrive at descriptive categories for characterising experiences made by the informants involved in the empirical studies rather than applying categories derived from previous work. The method of generating data preferred has been semi–structured interviews, i.e. interviews comprising a relatively small number of pre–formulated questions that develop according to the responses given by the informants.

Data have thereafter been analysed in two steps. The first step comprises a phenomenographic analysis of the interview data. Phenomenography is the empirical study of the qualitatively different ways in which various phenomena in, and aspects of, the world around us are experienced, conceptualised, understood, perceived, and apprehended (Marton, 1994) The words "experience", "perceive" and so on are used interchangeably. The point is to suggest that the limited number of ways in which a certain phenomenon appears to people can be found, for instance, regardless of whether they are embedded in immediate experience of the phenomenon or in reflected thought about the same phenomenon. The analyses were initially performed in order to obtain a description of the processes and outcomes of meaningful learning from the perspective of the learner. (C.f. Marton, Dahlgren, Svensson and Säljö, 1977).

The second step in the analysis is to carry out a discourse analysis, built on the content of the students' experiences as these appear from the phenomenographic analysis. Discourse analysis is a set of research procedures applied to interpret complex issues of language use in particular social situations. As Gee (1999), notes it is informed by a view of language that exceeds the traditionally communicative understanding of its function (i.e. that of exchanging information). For Gee, the main functions of language are *"... to scaffold the performance of social activities (...) and to scaffold human affiliation within cultures and social groups and institutions* (Gee 1999,p. 1). This is why, in this project, the linguistically expressed conceptions of educational issues can be understood as related to subjective activities (actual and planned), social (including professional)

identities, and cultural and institutional structures. This approach aims at analysing the cultures of institutions on the basis of individual narratives of people involved in their activities. Social organisations are in general *"produced, reproduced and transformed through the ongoing, interdependent and goal–oriented communication practices of its members* (Mumby 1997, p. 181). These practices, in turn, have "*implications for how social goods are or ought to be distributed*, which means that they are *political* in the generic (e.g. Aristotelian) sense of the word. (Gee 1999, p. 2).

The resulting analyses of the data have thereafter been subject to further comparative analyses on the one hand intra–nationally to compare different programmes, on the other hand internationally to compare the same programmes in different national contexts.

4. Summary of the results

As stated above, a short summary of major *Journeymen*–findings shall lay the foundation of the essential questions in how far the conclusions drawn from the project have enhanced the state of the art and what new research perspectives may be derived from *Journeymen*. This is the reason why – in the following – the results relevant for psychology and political sciences are summed up.

5. Psychology at four European universities

The main objects of our cross–national comparison, the four actual university programmes, are characterized by different ideas of education. Although they deal with the same subject they place different emphases according to their learning organisation and follow different pedagogies and conceptions of learning. These frame conditions may impact the learners` attitudes towards knowledge, competence and their work life expectations. Before differences and similarities are focussed, one should look at the various pedagogical approaches the four programmes obtain and, furthermore, try to identify possible consequences for the learners represented within the broad interview data. The most oppositional learning conceptions can be found in a comparison of the university programmes of Linköping and Gdansk. The Psychology programme in Linköping follows methods of problem–based learning which implement a strong focus on the confrontation with practical problems within the learning process. The idea behind this design of the programme is to bring about interplay between practical experience and theoretical reflection, on the one hand, and to provide the students with impressions about what the professional role is like on the other. As a contrast, learning within the psychology programme in Gdansk is mainly based on working with literature, i.e. psychological problems are rather dealt with by theoretical reflection than by practical

experiences or interplay between the two. The novices mirror the same differences in the work arrangements selected. A dominant majority of the graduates from Linköping are involved in the area of clinical psychology and starts to constitute its professional identity as therapists already at an early stage. The freshmen students from Gdansk, alike the Duisburg students, claimed to be enormously interested in clinical and social psychology, but have changed their minds during their studies. Since the courses deal with clinical issues only to a limited extent, the students do not feel prepared well enough for this kind of work later on. Consequently, the novices are engaged in various work life areas, especially in management activities. As the students in Duisburg mostly major in general psychology, methods, industrial psychology, and are particularly educated to run a teacher training programme, seminars in social and clinical psychology are only dealt with superficially. In the advanced study period the main area (besides teaching) is industrial psychology. This applied research area, however, is highly method–oriented. Consequently, most of the graduates either envisage a teacher career or involvement in research institutes. The Polish and German students distance themselves from the idea of their professional role as 'social helpers'. Due to the manifold jobs the novices are engaged in, especially in Gdansk, there seems to be no absolute favourite field of work. Very popular, however, are psychology of management and personnel training. The German students often decide to become psychology teachers and then acknowledge the social significance of their profession during the practical training period (after graduation). In Oslo the programme consists of a strong theoretical part in the beginning and a more practice–oriented period after the second year of studies. The professional programme is rooted in research–based and scientific knowledge and follows an academic tradition. The Norwegian students appreciate seminars given by external teachers who are seen as professional role models. This is the reason for a strong claim for better practical training often expressed at the end of studies. Social and practical problem solving competences are mentioned to be most important because relational and communicative skills are regarded as essential to good clinical psychologists.

5.1. Clinical psychologists in Linköping and Oslo

The novices from Linköping uttered explicitly how important the reflection of work life experiences is. Without self–reflection conflicting interests (client and colleague; client and relatives; client and children) could not be handled and private and professional life could not be balanced that easily. As professional fellowmen the novices develop a kind of "dual identity". This means that they must differentiate between personal involvement and empathy, the latter even for people they might personally dislike strongly. Regarding the differences between higher education and work life the novices clearly experienced a demarcation between work and leisure in their daily routine, which they appreciate in

form of clearly determined working hours. They do feel well prepared to meet the requirements of their jobs by the studies. The Norwegian psychologists appreciate the theoretical knowledge they have acquired during their studies which they regard as essential to master the professional challenges of a clinical psychologist. Similar to the experiences of the novices from Linköping they describe the dilemma in drawing a line between their helping role as professionals and as private persons. Though work life offers an apparent separation of private and professional life in terms of working hours and leisure time, the novices have distinct problems to differentiate between these domains emotionally. This may partly be connected to the high level of responsibility in their powerful position in relationships with clients. The main challenge for the novices seems to be the development of a professional distance. Additionally, the Oslo students underline the significance of active participation in the learning processes of the programme. Mere reproduction of knowledge – through listening, taking notes and learning by heart – is regarded as passive behaviour. Critical questioning and application of the acquired knowledge are seen as fundamental conditions of activity. Retrospectively, the Norwegian novices appreciate the practical education to a greater extent than the basic theoretical education of the first two years. Hence, they aim at a better preparation for professional demands.

The learner–focused understanding of active learning may be seen as a result of the structure of the Swedish psychology programme, which is predominantly centred on methods of problem–based–learning. The other way round it might be tempting to conclude that traditional forms of direct method teaching automatically subordinate the learners and push them into passivity. Alike, the Swedish application of problem–based learning may be understood as an alternative to classical learning situations, which may contribute to an increasing dependency of the learners.

5.2. Psychologists in Gdansk and Duisburg

While a professional orientation is quite apparent for young academics in Scandinavia, it is more difficult to classify the Polish graduates in their first year of work. From the perspective of most students, a fundamental critical attitude and a theoretical distance towards reality are often appreciated as a main effect of university education. The domains of psychology are observed from a theoretical perspective; interestingly enough, clinical psychology as a field of application is not included in that view. This does not meet the expectations of the study freshmen that cultivate an image of the psychologist as a social expert. Quite frequently, young academics avoid clinical psychology as a field of professional application and choose to work in the management area and in adult education. They feel that they do not necessarily have to work in clinical or social

environments in order to act psychologically and to help other people. In their eyes, their expert knowledge can be transferred to any work field. Some students continue to work in their side–jobs after graduation, for instance, even if that work field is not psychology–related.

The Duisburg graduates find transfer and application of their university knowledge mostly in two areas: school teaching and applied industrial psychology as research and counselling. Just like the Gdansk graduates they do not envisage clinical professions or jobs in social counselling. The focus of studies is predominantly on empirical–methodological affairs, such as industrial psychology. The high interest in social tasks, which is apparent within the freshmen group, seems to have vanished at the end of the study programme. It seems that the majority of the students have had to revise their former image of the psychologist as the good psychiatrist who is everybody's helper in the course of the studies. As a consequence, they have stopped to consider themselves as psychologists even though they know that psychologists work in almost every domain. As a hypothetical explanation one could draw the conclusion that the general public discourse is more effective than the psychological expert discourse. Those job novices who strive for a teacher career have nevertheless stressed the importance of social competences, which are elementary for their professional activities. Furthermore, they refer to the ethical responsibility they have as role models. Thus, the self–image of most Duisburg psychologists is that of a teacher even though they differ from their colleagues through the psychological expertise. This self–definition could hint at an essential identity–conflict: since they are not able to mediate between public discourse and expert opinion on the characteristics of psychologists, these novices steadily feel the need of a legitimating.

The often stated insecurity which many senior students feel concerning their future career choice should lead to the question why – in the end – so many have decided to enter the advanced teacher training programme. One chief cause certainly exists in the financial security of public servants. The unstable German job market seems to advise graduates a fundamental caution. Since they do not see themselves as "classic psychologists" anyway, it does not at all seem difficult for them to move to other professional fields. Jobs in industrial psychology are rarely chosen despite excellent previous knowledge. This, too, depends on the difficult access to project funds.

6. Political Science at four European universities

Contrary to Psychology, which is representative for professional programmes, Political Science is to be investigated as an example of liberal study programmes. Liberal in this sense includes that university education is regarded as a basic academic training, which does not necessarily prepare for clearly defined professions. Social, economic and political conditions are important for the evaluation of the professional development of the novices particularly because of this independency of professional qualifications. A glance at the Norwegian novices can tell that they have found work in study–related professions. About half the novices work in public administration, two out of nine are employed in journalism and media and only one graduate works in the private sector. Thus, the professional activities correspond to the contents of studies and the skills acquired at university. The graduates from Gdansk draw an opposite picture: the majority of them work in private economy. There lies a strong contradiction in the idealized view of the profession mentioned by many senior students and the real labour market situation. Indeed it seems as if knowledge and competence acquisition at university were irrelevant to the professional application following the studies. The job novices particularly appreciate the value of social and communicative competence and the ability of positive self–portrayal and assimilation in social contexts. Furthermore, organisation skills, flexibility and loyalty are looked upon as essentially important for work in companies. Specialised knowledge, on the contrary, seems to be subordinate to the named skills. This appreciation of practical key qualifications is particularly surprising since the Gdansk curriculum generally marginalises practical application. It is tempting to regard this distinctive feature as a paradox: the Gdansk students try to understand and discuss current politics without any real participation.

In conformity with the Swedish and Norwegian freshmen the students from Duisburg mention the significance of political science for democratic beliefs and values. Most students describe their function as mediators between politics and the citizens of a society. Having gained insight in complex interrelations between political sciences and current affairs the graduates feel selected to hand their expert knowledge on to others. This mirrors their intensive professional identification. It is also the frequently emphasised appreciation of critical–analytical and communicative competencies, which aims at this mediating function. Even though the German students are convinced that they are primarily endowed with theoretical knowledge, they can hardly manage to find a job to apply their knowledge and study–related competences. As a consequence, a certain disappointment can be determined among young academics following from the experienced lack of professional prospective. Strikingly, students with an immigrant

family background seem to have a more positive attitude towards the labour market than their German fellow graduate students. For them, the acquisition of a university diploma resembles "an entrance" to social ascension. Thus, they liberate themselves from the guest worker/migrant status. Furthermore, they show an extraordinarily strong social commitment.

In Linköping the freshmen students paradoxically display a more concrete idea of their scientific discipline than their older fellow students (though they still feel insecure about future fields of work), whereas the graduates in Duisburg claim to have acknowledged the significant relations of political science only a the end of their studies. This necessarily leads to the question in how far the study programme contributes to an increasing concealment of disciplinary self–conceptions. Identification with the study programme seems to be decreasing towards the end of studies, partly because the graduates cannot find suitable professional role models. While writing their masters theses the Swedish seniors start to identify with political scientists from the mass media. This turning away from academic role models is the end of a development from idealistic to realistic understanding of political sciences if one keeps in mind that for the first–year students cooperation, democratic values and idealistic attitudes were most important (watchdogs for democracy, global justice). The labour market novices at the end of this development would rather define themselves as empiric investigators and evaluators. Those novices who are employed in the public sector identify with the role of Political Scientists the strongest. Often, however, these novices feel intellectually unchallenged at work. Employees in the private sector claim not to identify with the professional conception of political scientists. Many graduates from Duisburg are either overqualified for their current jobs or are employed in professions with only little topical relevance to the study programme. Most of them are looking for a more appropriate job.

7. Policy implications and needs for further research

Part 4 of the report presents in a synthetic form the conclusions from the research, and takes up the issues of policy implications and further research perspectives. The summary of the results is restricted, in this part of the report, to the programmes of psychology and political science as the common sample in all participating countries. The issues particularly stressed here relate to the shift in professional interests in students in Gdansk and Duisburg from clinical psychology to other practical fields, in contrast to the Scandinavian experience of continuity of interests in this respect. The difference is partly explained by enrolment policies and job market prospects. In political science, a highlighted issue concerns the distinction between public and private sectors of employment of graduates, and the related issues of quasi–professional (identified as

'fake professionalism' in Gdansk) and liberal arts approach to learning. Not surprisingly, this field of studies seems to be marked with stronger diversity and often paradoxical relations between expectations, education and work.

A separate section of Chapter III. 3. is devoted to the contribution of *Journeymen* to contemporary research on higher education. The basis of the analysis here is the State of the Art (START) report written at the beginning of the project. As compared to the START report, the project seems to have been successful in providing for a more differentiated picture of learning and professional identity construction in higher education, and in providing for insight into the role of ethical issues in the construction of contemporary professions. Also, some interesting data has been provided as to the interactions between structural and material conditions of education (including socio–economic contexts) and its contents. A special contribution made by the project is describing the process of learning and identity construction as located *in between* academic institutions, work life experiences, individual life strategies and socio–political contexts. This means that *Journeymen* consider institutions of higher education as a *part* of the setting where professional learning takes place. Also, the authors believe that the research strategy developed in the project, combining phenomenography with discourse analysis and hermeneutics, has proven to be fruitful in building a shared understanding of complex social phenomena in Europe. This approach seems to fill in the deficiency of more qualitative, interpretative approaches identified in the START report.

Many topics that emerged in course of *Journeymen* interpretations have been identified as demanding further research. They include a more focused research into professional identity construction (with such issues as the role of „professional Others", different temporal dimensions in various professions, or the relation between personal and professional identities in professions demanding personal responsibilities), and professional ethics with its complex relation to material interests. Also, the very issue of knowledge has been problematical in a way asking for further investigations. This includes such topics as: the relations between the tendencies to maintain academic autonomy and to meet job market demands, with an ambivalent role played by the notion of "openness" of learning environments; the paradoxical construction of professionalism in mass education and the institutional strategies of resolving the paradox; and the issue of "institutional pacts" (tacit and overt) between higher education and professional corporations or other stakeholders in the social environment of the university. Finally, the notion of knowledge in what is called "knowledge–based society" invites for critical scrutiny itself. Some of the data we gathered suggest that there is a politically constructed difference between knowledge and competence, the former significant in the relations between academic institutions and business ("academic

capitalism" means that knowledge becomes a commodity and therefore is no longer freely transmitted in education), the latter constructing the field of learning for employment. It means that the discourse of competence that dominates the thinking of individual outcomes of HE may deter the students from seeking knowledge, and leave the field of knowledge unchallenged and free to be capitalised. A separate issue concerns the access of migrants to higher education. This topic has been addressed only marginally in the project, and some data show that the research strategy employed in *Journeymen* may provide for a new insight into this politically significant theme.

This leads to the issue of policy implications of the project. Apart from such themes as migration or the need to address gender stratifications in higher education and professional employment, the project has provided for numerous data important in the current debate on the implementation of the Bologna process. The transformation of higher education towards a greater mobility of workforce in Europe, seen in the light of the mass character of HE in Europe nowadays, poses fundamental challenges to educational programmes and policies. They can be better understood when looked upon from a perspective that combines individual, institutional, cultural, and socio–political levels of analysis, like the one employed in *Journeymen.*

II. BACKGROUND AND OBJECTIVES OF THE PROJECT

1. Context of the Research and the overall aim

Most governments across Europe have policies in place to increase the number of students entering higher education. This is based on the assumption that higher education can supply the skills and qualifications in terms of "human capital" required for a more complex and technological work life. In addition, European policy is also focused upon increasing workforce mobility between European countries.

However, underlying these broad policies are factors at play that might determine how successful such policies might be for preparing students for work life within different institutions, educational systems and cultures. One determining issue is what people make of education as well as how education moulds people. This would be through the mutual interplay between institutions of higher education, and the students and teachers that populate them. Another issue is that the same educational initiatives might bring different results in different cultures. Other factors will determine the possibilities and hindrances for increased work force mobility between European countries.

This project is aiming to enhance the understanding of learning strategies, values and "worldviews" that students and novices apply within and across different learning environments – both in education and in work life. It aims to gain an understanding of students' experiences of transitions from higher education to professional life in different European countries. In particular it is focusing on he cultural diversity of academic and work institutions in Europe.

The main problem addressed is formulated as: How do students and novices in the workplace construe their university studies and their vocations – and the relationship between them? The main analytical questions asked are as follows:

- What discourses can be discerned in education and work life as significant for the students and the novices in their constructions of studies and vocations?

- What structural/material/cultural conditions contribute to these discourses?

- What strategies do students and novices apply in order to cope with knowledge formation – learning – in studies and work?

The theoretical aims pursued in the project are to develop a conceptual framework for understanding learning strategies that students and novices apply in their trajectories within and across "communities of practice" (education and work life). Our intention is to

better describe transitions from higher education to professional life in different European countries and to explain the "travelling" of students and new professionals within and across these sectors.

In the project, students in higher education are viewed as "journeymen" between the cultures of higher education and work life. The focus is appropriate to gain a better understanding of the learners' conceptions of changing patterns in higher education as well as in work life By studying students as individuals and as members of a culture it is aimed to gain a better understanding of the relationships between cultural, educational and work life contexts.

2. Objectives

2.1. WP 1

1) To identify the way freshmen in the four programmes selected (two of which are common to all four countries), conceive of their study pr ogramme, their envisaged job and the relationship between study and work.

2) To compare a freshmen perspective on these issues with the conceptions and experiences of students in their final year and in their 'novice' year of work, looking for changes and context factors related to these changes.

3) To compare the conceptions and experiences on these issues between freshmen with and without (significant) work experience before entering their university programme.

4) To identify aspects of the context of higher education significant for the way the students experience their studies and see their future work.

5) To compare the findings on these issues between academic/disciplinary cultures, types of programmes (professional/liberal) as well as between countries.

2.2. WP 2

1) To identify and compare how senior students in their final year and newly graduated students in their first year of work life conceive of themselves as professionals.

2) To describe the learning strategies applied by the newly graduated in order to cope as novices in work life.

3) To identify aspects of the work life context that are significant for how novices are received as new professionals entering the work force.

4) To identify and compare senior students' and graduates' conceptions of the relationship between study and work, i.e. what aspects of higher education that are significant for the development of their professional roles.

5) To compare the perspectives held by senior and newly graduated students' perspectives on these issues with the conceptions and experiences of the freshmen students in WP1.

2.3. WP 3

1) To provide for a critical perspective to interpret interview data as grounded in social and cultural contexts.

2) To identify the discourses embedded in the institutions of learning and work that shape the students' perspectives on learning.

3) To identify the conditions (material, social, cultural) inside and outside the institutions that inform the institutional discourses of learning and work.

2.4. WP 4

1) To describe and compare the participating countries with regard to what discourses can be discerned in education and work life.

2) To describe and compare the structural, material and cultural conditions that may contribute to differences and similarities with regard to these discourses in the four countries.

3) To describe and compare strategies used by students and novices for coping with knowledge formation – learning – in studies and work in the participating countries.

2.5. WP 5

1) To make the results of the research work known among various groups in society on a national level

2) To make the outcome of the work known to various interest groups on a European level.

3) To prepare a comprehensive book reporting on the entire project.

III. SCIENTIFIC DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT RESULTS AND METHODOLOGY

1. Introduction

The idea and role of universities as educational institutions has under the recent decades been debated intensely in relation to societal change and changing demands of work life (Barnett, 1994). Medieval institutions educated an elite of professionals in clergy, medicine and law, and the professional fields had a clear identity. During the 20th century, there has been an increasing pressure on universities to incorporate a variety of professional or semi-professional programmes into higher education. The relationship between higher education and work life has, henceforth, become more complex and diffuse and thereby open for debate. Besides, the percentage enrolled in higher education has been multiplied several times during this period. The working forms in universities have also been debated and at times critiqued internally. This critique has also pertained to student influence and representation in university boards. The increasing interest in student centred pedagogy in higher education during the last three decades could be seen as an expression of the universities ways of responding to these demands. There is growing awareness that not only the content of educational programmes, but also their design and forms of delivery may contribute to students' learning. Moreover, quality in higher education has come to mean not only the impact of educational programmes on knowledge and generic skills among students, but also fulfilling demands of flexibility, ethnical pluralism and gender equality.

To add to this list, policies of the European Union emphasise the importance of mobility of professionals. These policies require, among many aspects, thorough research on diverse elements of competence cultivated in the institutions of higher education and of employment systems.

The chapter is structured according to four discourses discernible in the literature about higher education and worklife. The first discourse concerns the call for knowledge production as a joint enterprise between universities and the surrounding society. The second discourse comprises the call for new research perspectives on the relationship between higher education and work life. The third discourse concerns the call for contextualising the research on higher education within the experiences of the students. The fourth discourse constitutes the call for an alternative pedagogy of transition between higher education and work life. In a concluding section the present project is positioned in relationship to these analyses of previous research. Furthermore, we outline the theoretical perspectives that constitute the analytical framework of the project.

1.1. The call for knowledge production as a joint enterprise between universities and the surrounding society

Higher Education that is considered in a context of contemporary process of knowledge production brings many observations concerning its connections to the world of work. Two not opposite tendencies can be observed in that area. The first identifies heterogeneity as an important characteristic of the contemporary landscape of science production. Knowledge is no longer produced only in university settings but is also found increasingly in many different loci like government laboratories, industries, etc. As authors of that concept (Gibbons at al.) predicted the universities will comprise only a small part of the knowledge-producing sector (Godin & Gingras, 2000, p.273). The thesis of the diversification of the loci of scientific production is non-controversial in the light of the 1994-1996 studies (ibid. p.274).

The other tendency, far from suggesting any decline, notes on the contrary the "Enhanced role of the university" and suggest to study "Triple helix" of the relationships between university, industry, and government (Etzkowitz et al., 2000). As Etzkowitz et al. note, "in a knowledge-based economy, the university becomes a key element of the innovation system both as human capital provider and seed-bed of new firms. Three institutional spheres (public, private and academic), that formerly operated at arms length in laissez faire societies, are increasingly interwoven with a spiral pattern of linkages emerging at various stages of the innovation and industrial policy-making process" (ibid. p.315). Etzkowitz et al. present characteristic "Triple helix" linkages in several countries, e.g. in Germany. These changes brought many positive effects, although,

> "the German story is one of a mixture of redefining the university system to be both more active in regional development while being required to be prepared to generate higher levels of income through commercializing its teaching and research activity"; larger companies like Daimler-Chrysler or Bertelsmann are planning to set up their own universities in order to avoid a long and difficult innovation process in the co-operation with university administrators (ibid. p.323).

Canadian studies by Godin and Gingras (2000), confirm the above tendencies (heterogeneity and "Triple helix" as the important characteristic of the contemporary landscape of science production). As authors note universities still are at the heart of the system and that all other actors rely heavily on their expertise (Godin and Gingras, ibid.). Authors conclude that the diversification of research activities outside universities is done

in relationship with them and thus contributes to their development. The participation of a sector to the total number of scientific papers published in Canada, despite a real diversification of loci of production, the presence of universities does not diminish in time. New actors in the system of scientific production produce a large proportion of their papers in collaboration with the universities (covering sometimes major costs of such a co-operation. (Kubota, 1993).

The model that is developed by the authors embeds the university in a centre of a knowledge-production structure. According to the demands from the outer world universities - on the one hand - gives way and comply with requests from industry, government, etc. and - on the other -nourish their traditions. These mechanisms are obvious in the following observations:

European universities have to offer a two-stage structure of studies (BA degree + MA degree courses) in order to cut long-term studies and make it possible to prepare professionals in a shorter time period. It happened due to the unique EU obligation (1992) also turning universities into institutions of LL (lifelong learning) activities. Professional in-service training becomes more important than the pre-service counterparts. Basic rhetoric in these changes was taken from Jacques Delors' idea of learning societies that are constantly obtaining experiences and using knowledge (Delors, 1996; Teichler and Kehm, 1996; Mrówka, 1999; Auleytner, 1998). Poland, as a new member of the EU, is recently very much involved in increasing the scholar indicators, especially on the HE level. This country has obtained 40,8 per cent scholar indicator value in 2000 (EU standard) mostly by the augmentation of the number of BA degree schools, of which a majority are private (Edukacja, 2001; Tadeusiewicz, 1997; Buchner-Jeziorska, 1996).

Universities redesigned their traditional concept of study organization based on the need to collaborate intensively with the workplaces. For example, some European universities (France, Hungary, and others) organize sandwich common courses including management and communication subjects. The purpose is to strengthen the co-operation of the university and enterprise in high-level engineering education. The university (educator) and industrial (engineer) tutors organize the work of sandwich students. They make recommendations in the selection of the subjects, follow the educational and practical work, provide continuous technical consultation, and evaluate the student's activities (Dunai, Hufnagl, Ivanyi, 1998). Many recent projects focus on the same value: university and work in powerful synergies, e.g.: Education & Business Partnerships (Denmark, US) designed to expose university teachers to new technologies in workplace, provide them with opportunities to interact with scientists and other technically trained

professionals, and assist teachers in transferring work experiences into classrooms (Kubota, 1993); Workplace Literacy Program (US), in which worker is learner, learner is worker, employer meets educator, and all of them have opportunities for advantages through the linkage they provide (Inkster R., 1994). Some projects, especially in the US, are described in a context of the labour unions' performance. Labour education programs in co-operation with the universities have existed in the US since the 1960s. Recently, many universities have begun working with unions within their respective states to establish labour advisory boards to assist and advise labour unions and their labour centres (Naylor, 1985).

On the one hand, universities undergo the outer pressure and become servant organizations in order to submit "practice-oriented model" created by EU policy determined through the labour market economy. On the other, as analyzers note, in the inner organization they keep traditional form of performance that is known from the past (Teichler and Kehm, op.cit., Czezowski, 1994; Denek, 1998). OECD report (1993) presents HE institutions that "prefer loose connection between education and work, stating that preparation to more complicated professional tasks is possible to get in other ways" (Teichler and Kehm,op.cit.p. 66). In that context the pressure concerning labour market appears futile. HE institutions still produce the mass of unemployed people.

The call for the joint enterprise from the work life perspective implies some expectations on work life organizations and their relationship to higher education. Business needs university mediation in the acquirement of knowledge that is necessary in a built of reasonable complexes (instead of the isolated bites of experimental, experience knowledge). This need is increased in our changing world. The term *flexible specialization* connected with the other: *postfordism)* adequately express current striving of the business world to having staff that is easy-going in various adaptations aimed to produce changeable assortment applying to the consumers needs (Brown and Lauder 1991, after: Denek.op.cit, p.49). "Flexible worker" performance is highly appreciated by the employers nowadays, as Teichler noticed (Teichler and Kehm, op.cit., 78) and as local empirical study presented so (Poland: *Raport Kartuzy,* 2000).

Business and government spheres are very much involved in a process of the organizational, educational changes in the universities. They are ready to pay a lot for these changes. This is spectacularly shown in the highly expensive projects, such as *Education & Business Partnerships* (Kubota, op.cit.), in which major funding is going to the universities from the private sector under governmental policy umbrella.

The HE and work linkages emphasize the individual "human component of professional work" by new ways of management and increasing consciousness of human and cultural producing resources (*corporation cultures*) (Mrówka, op.cit; Teichler and Kehm, op.cit, p.76; OECD, 1993; Denek, op.cit, p.49; Bauman, 2000).

The companies face the fact that education and training become essential components of business development and that the constant need for updating knowledge and skills of the workforce makes learning **at** or **near** the workplace a necessity (Geldermann, 1999). Thus the LL idea is plaited into both university and work reality that is confirmed in the common projects on new forms of training near the workplace (ibid.).

Summarizing the above tendencies and changes, we could say that the call for a joint enterprise in knowledge production between universities and the surrounding societies on the global level challenges local practices of university everyday-life to move towards performance determined by the market economy rules.

1.2. The call for new research perspectives on the relationship between higher education and work life

The research on higher education and work life in Europe has since the 1960's concentrated on some major themes or topics. During the 1960's the focus was basically on investment in education and economic development. From the middle of the 1960's the focus of research changed to concern the expansion of higher education, educational opportunity and diversification. Since 1970 the research interest has shifted towards the processes of teaching and learning in higher education, with a particular emphasis on student-centred education, programme development. Other issues that interested researchers during the 1970's are graduates employment and professional identity among graduates. After 1980, issues as management, evaluation and quality control have become more prevalent as key research topics (ref.)

In general, much of the empirical research on higher education and work life complies with the classical approaches in the area, i.e. large-scale surveys applying questionnaires. Through these studies reliable information has been obtained about students' attitudes and their study situation. However, the possibilities of theory building generated within these studies seem limited. The predominant theoretical approach has been that of social sciences with a particular interest in the system of higher education as a subsystem in society with particular emphasis on structures in organisation, interaction and communication. (Webler, 1988).

Research on the transition from higher education to work life includes both texts on a system level, reporting enquires on the match between the output of higher education and the societal demands for academically trained manpower, as well as studies on the expediency of higher education as assessed retroactively by professional novices. The concurrent debate about research on higher education and work life emphasises the importance of the following; Firstly, the research cannot be properly described by referring to methods and theoretical frameworks from single disciplines, but is rather inter- and multi-disciplinary. Secondly, as a rule there are attempts made in the individual projects to link different thematic fields within research on higher education. This is done not only to avoid the narrowing down that may go with a disciplinary perspective but also to be able to link to different areas of practical application. Thirdly, there is an aim at a balance between theoretical and empirical orientation (Teichler, 1998).

Teichler (1999), in a review of the research on the transition between higher education and work life concludes that there is a shortage of longitudinal studies applying qualitative research methods. Most studies have rather been quantitative and emphasised issues such as employment, career patterns, identification of work tasks for novices and eventual mismatch between these and the education. These latter are, however, quantitative studies applying pre-formulated response categories. Hence, there is a shortage of categories for describing the nature of the relationships between higher education and work life demands. According to Brennan, Kogan & Teichler (1996), a growing theoretical eclecticism and pragmatism have accompanied growing awareness of the complex transition process between higher education and work. They argue that theories adhered to in the old days, seen as too simplistic, are not replaced by convincing theoretical conceptual frameworks. They ask if this is just a transitory stage, or if the research area combining several aspects of the relationship between higher education and work is bound to be pragmatic in drawing from the mix of conceptual frameworks and argue that studies must be provided about the substance of learning and the character of work tasks. Furthermore, there is a shortage of studies illuminating how students make use in work life of their skills and knowledge acquired during the studies. (Teichler, ibid). Another shortage in previous studies on the impact of higher education on the students' subsequent career is that they often focus on a specific programme and thereby lack comparisons with other programmes, which jeopardises the generalisability of the conclusions. Johnston (2003) points at the fact that there is still little information in the research literature on graduate employment from the graduates' perspective. As for the need for further research Kogan (1996) lists a number of topics as well as a suggested frame of reference for dealing with them; *Studies of curricula*: Not only the

nature of knowledge, but also control and power related aspects. *Studies of values:* A comparison between the dominant values of the academics and of the employment world. A large issue for academic inquiry; Will the changing demands for 'relevant' higher education cause a movement in academic values?

> "The final conclusion must be that we need fine-grained analyses of how far the curriculum and research has been affected by the emphasis on employment and the economy and how far this has led to morphogenesis, the structuration of institutional forms to make these movements the more secure installed". (Ibid.p.247)

Johnston argues that research on graduate employment so far has been predominantly focusing the 'powerful voices in the field' (p.419) such as large bodies or interest groups with possibilities to influence the government. She critiques some of the research on graduate employments for lacking in scholarship; with demote build up of explanatory theory and empirical evidence. There is a need for research focusing on experiences of graduates in their early employment years, she argues, particularly as regards their working conditions and culture. The relationships between their higher education and work, fulfilment issues such as the nature and extent of their job expectations, satisfaction and commitment, and relationships between employers explicit expectations and graduates' experienced expectations are other areas where research is sparse. Moreover, there is a need for longitudinal studies and a combination of methodologies to avoid the risk of over-interpreting the development of graduates' employment paths, Johnston claims. The need for a combination of methodologies in research on higher education has also been put forward by Delamont (1996). Delamont suggests that methods such as discourse analysis in combination with ethnography and ethno-methodology and a research focus on more unknown aspects of higher education would provide a more complex understanding of higher education and the transition to work life.

1.3. The call for contextualising the research on higher education within the experiences of the students

Much previous research on the impact of higher education on students has focussed on the development of individual abilities within students. A review of the previous research in the field displays some main perspectives on how educational impact may be understood.

An *evaluative perspective* on the impact of education pertains basically to the American tradition of studying the impact of college on students in terms of changes in attitudes,

values, political orientation, or acquisition of specific factual knowledge (Feldman & Newcomb, 1969; Pace, 1979; Pascarella & Terenzini, 1991). The impact is described in quantitative terms. It is argued that this constitutes consistent evidence that the college experience increases both general and specific knowledge (Pascarella & Terenzini, 1991).

Studies within a *developmental perspective* focus on the longitudinal development of structural aspects of thinking e.g. Perry's classical scheme of intellectual and ethical development in college students (1970). Perry's main finding is that there is a development from a dominating *dualistic* notion of knowledge i.e. a statements about the surrounding world are either true or false, via a *relativistic* notion i.e. there are different competing schools of thought to a stage of *commitment* i.e. the students take a standpoint of their own in these matters.

During the late 1970'ies the focus of the research on the impact of higher education shifted from the predominant focus on the psychological and structural aspects of learning, to the content of learning as an alternative paradigm applying a phenomenographic perspective. A number of studies show that the impact of higher education on students as regards their understanding of basic concepts in different disciplines such as e.g. Biology (Brumby, 1979), Economics (Dahlgren, 1978) or Physics (Johansson, Marton & Svensson 1985; Svensson 1989) is less impressive than indicated by the results pertaining to the evaluative perspective. Other examples of phenomenographic research are e.g. Hasselgren (1981), who studied the impact of formal education on pre-school student teachers' ways of apprehending children at play. The results showed that the students develop from either a *fragmentary* or *partiality* to a *chronological* apprehension and from a chronological to an *abstracting* apprehension during their education.

Dahlgren (1989) interviewed students of Business administration at the beginning and at the end of their education about their conceptions of economic phenomena. He found that the students to a large extent change from an initially held political, *distribution-oriented* perspective to a more seemingly de-politicised *efficiency-oriented* perspective.

Bendz (1995) interviewed nursing students at the beginning of their education, three times during their practical training and once after two and a half years of professional experience. Bendz found four different ways of identifying clinical situations among the students and a characteristic pattern of development. The characteristic pattern was a gradual development from an observational and detached role at the beginning to an engaged role at the end of the studies. Another example is the study by Abrandt (1997), describing and analysing the impact of formal education and professional experience on

physiotherapy students' ways of experiencing the interaction within a patient encounter. The results show a trend as regards direction of change in conceptions from separated to integrated perspectives on the communicative and problem-solving processes after the formal educational programme.

1.4. The call for an alternative pedagogy for the transition between higher education and work life

The debate about the contemporary higher education reveals that its scholastic traditions do not meet the requirements of the process of transition between higher education and work life.

A complicating factor when assessing the feasibility of study programmes with regard to requirements in work life is the lack of stable forecasts about the nature of future tasks in working-life and qualifications. The lack of stable forecasts about the nature of future tasks in work life and qualifications required to meet them has lead to an increasing emphasis on knowledge and skills that will make students capable to develop beyond their formal training (Rolf, 1998, Barnett 1994, 2000a). In a recent Swedish state survey about the new conditions for learning in higher education (SOU 2001:13), it is argued that work in qualified positions in contemporary work life requires a perspective on competence that besides specific knowledge and skills also includes abilities of independent learning as well as the ability of formulating, analysing and solving of problems. Flexibility in relationship to change, capacity for co-operation and communication as well as foreign language skills, and intercultural competence are other dimensions that should be included in the aims of higher education. The focus on generic skills represents a more generalised shift towards what has been called "instrumental progressivism". This includes an emphasis on accessibility, transferable skills, competency formation, modularization, student profiling and the development of reflective practitioners (Boud and Symes 2000, p. 16). Becoming professional includes engagement with a wider set of discourses, a responsibility that moves beyond the limits of a local professional-client transaction (Barnett 1997).

The shift within the perspective of understanding the problem of transition has brought about a number of new designs and pedagogical approaches within higher education, such as project oriented education and problem-based learning. In the last decade, there have been some attempts at collating the research on impact of problem-based learning through extensive literature reviews and meta-analyses. (Albanese & Mitchell 1993; Vernon & Blake 1993; Colliver 2000). Research on PBL, as well as on other teaching methods in higher education, has hitherto focused most on students' learning and the

internal process of higher education. Abrandt Dahlgren (2000, 2002, 2003) has also shown that ways of implementing student centred pedagogies are affected by specific contextual factors and conditions of different fields of knowledge in higher education. The review articles comprise mostly evaluations of medical programmes and are often comparisons with traditional curricula. A majority of the studies show that differences in learning outcome between traditional and PBL programmes are generally small. There is some evidence that PBL impacts on students' study strategies towards a deep approach to learning (Rahimi 1995, Abrandt Dahlgren & Öberg, 2001), but further research in this area is, however, needed to conclude whether PBL students achieve a better understanding of the learning task than their counterparts in conventional programmes.

Research on the impact of PBL on graduates' employment is still sparse, particularly in comparison with conventional education. Some studies available are focusing particularly on the field of medical education. The results suggest that PBL might impact positively on graduates' perceptions of communication and generally on the feeling of preparedness for medical practice (Hård af Segerstad, 1998, Antepohl, Domeij, Forsberg & Ludvigsson 2003; Jones, McArdle and O'Neill 2002; Willis, Jones and O'Neill 2003).

A recent study by Kaufman & Feldman (2004) applies a symbolic interactionist perspective in researching senior students' experiences as regards the development of identity formation in the college years. The authors conducted a large number of in-depth interviews with a randomly selected sample of college students. The results show that the experience of college plays an important constitutive role in forming the felt identities of students. This was particularly evident in three domains; intelligence and knowledgeability, occupation, and cosmopolitanism. Within the domain of occupation, the interaction with peers stood out as an important feature in forming felt occupational identities. Social networking and participation in distinctive events, such as hearing distinguished speakers, participation in internships or academic conferences, etc., are also put forward as functions of college that may form and reinforce students' self-perceived occupational identity. Kaufman and Feldman argue that college provides students the 'situational contexts within which a variety of identities may be negotiated, experienced, and ultimately constructed' (p.481). An interesting finding is also that the experience of college for some students constituted a symbolic entitlement for certain occupations and careers, they perceived themselves to deserve the better jobs because they were highly educated. Thereby they locate themselves within a particular social-structural reality and in a particular social group, the authors claim. Other contributors to emphasise the importance of the social and cultural context of learning are the seminal work by Wenger and Lave (1991), developed further by Wenger (1998). Within the situated perspective of Wenger and Lave, the transition from higher education to work

life could be considered as a trajectory from one community of practice with a particular set of boundaries and traditions to another community of practice with a different location and different boundaries, activities and traditions.

2. The Journeymen project: outline of the theoretical and analytical framework

So far, we have reviewed features of the literature in the field relevant to higher education and work life and we will now turn to the positioning of the present project in relation to this. The discourse of joint knowledge production underlines the importance of seeing higher education programmes not situated in 'ivory towers', but within a close-knit and dynamic relationship with the surrounding society with no clear-cut demand-supply relationship. The call for new research perspectives implies that the relationship between higher education and work life as learning environments has to be focussed if we are to understand better qualities of the relationship between the individual and work life requirements. Further, the call for contextualising the research on higher education within the experiences of the students' problematises the notion of effects of education as a set of abilities developed within the students. According to Svensson, (1996) competence is in the first place constituted as a relational and contextual phenomenon, i.e. competence is to a large extent determined by the way professionals conceive of their work and work tasks. Finally, the call for an alternative pedagogy of transition seen together with the previously described discourses points at the need for a theoretical framework that allows a simultaneous focus on the individual, the culture of the higher education institutions, the requirements of the work task and its broader contexts.

The Journeymen project takes as its point of departure a socio-cultural approach. It means that the transition from higher education to work life is viewed as a trajectory from one community with a particular set of boundaries and traditions to another community of practice with a different location and different boundaries, activities and traditions.

A community of practice is, according to Wenger (1998) characterised by a mutual engagement, a joint enterprise, and a shared repertoire between the participants in the community that newcomers to the community need to learn to master. The mutuality of engagement means that the newcomer in the negotiation of meaning develops certain expectations about how to engage in action with other people, a certain way of being. This contributes to the shaping of identity as a form of individuality with respect to a community. The accountability to an enterprise, Wenger claims, is to develop a certain focus, to understand certain conditions and possibilities; it is about shaping of identity as a perspective. Furthermore, the ability to interpret and make use of the history of the

practice as recognised in the artefacts, actions and language. In terms of identity, this translates to a personal set of events, references and memories that creates individual relations of negotiability with respect to a repertoire of a practice (p. 153). A central source of identity formation in the community of practice is participation; the identity is constituted through the recognition of mutuality in relations of participation. Another source complementary to participation is reification. Reification refers to the abstractions such as tools, symbols, terms, concepts produced by the community to reify something of this practice in a congealed form.

As is evident from the summary of research on the topic of the transition from higher education to work life, there still remains a lot of central questions to be dealt with. Our purpose is to – mainly by preserving the voices of the students as they report on their experiences of this transition – focus on how students construe their identity as students in higher education and as professional novices in a mutual interplay with institutions of higher education in the first case and with work places in different sectors in society in the second case. This does not imply that we in this study view higher education as something universal, nor do we conceive of identities in an essentialist way.

Universities, with all their diversity in disciplines and scientific perspectives could in themselves be viewed as hosting a number of communities of practices, 'academic cultures' (Snow 1959) and 'tribes and territories' (Becher, 1989) are some conceptual indicators of communities within academia available in the literature. In this study, we have chosen three different study programmes, building on the assumption that their characteristics as communities of practice in the university vary. More specifically, we are assuming that educational design; expectations of knowledge formation and identity building in students will vary among the programmes. Similarly, it is our assumption that the graduates will enter different sectors of work life that have different requirements on them as novices in work life that not necessarily match the presupposed outcome of the study programme.

Bauman (1991) claims that in the change to the modern functionally differentiated society, individual persons are no longer firmly rooted in one single location or subsystem of society, but rather must be regarded as socially displaced. There is no 'natural identity' that could be bestowed upon people, the creation of identity is individual and could never be securely and definitely possessed as it is under constant challenge and must be ever anew negotiated. Bauman points at a paradox in the sense that the individual needs to establish a stable and defensible identity to differentiate the self from the outer world, but at the same time needs the affirmation of social approval. 'The subjective world

which constitute the identity of the individual personality can only be sustained by inter-subjective exchange' (p. 201).

Wenger reasons along a similar line when describing the identity formation in a community of practice. Identity is here viewed as a nexus of multi-membership. As such a nexus an identity is not a coherent unity, nor is it simply fragmented. A nexus does not decompose our identity into distinct trajectories in each community, nor does it merge the different identities we construe in different contexts into one. In a nexus, multiple trajectories become part of each other, whether they are contradictory or reinforcing each other. Wenger claims that identities are at the same time one and multiple. The implications for this study are that we recognise that identities are *both* one and multiple. When we are describing the trajectories of emerging fragments of identities in informants as senior students and as novice workers, we are simultaneously aware that these identities are only partial and contextually situated to the realm of studies and work. Viewing identity building as trajectories means that they are seen as motions over time, not necessarily following a predestined course, but open to the interaction with and influence of a multitude of sources. The theoretical standpoints bring consequences for the methodological and empirical approach of the project, which we will elaborate on and clarify in the next section.

3. Design and methodology

In the following section an outline of the methodological considerations for the project as a whole will be provided. The design of the interviews as well as methods applied for the data analysis will be described.

3.1. Programmes selected

The framework for the first decisions made concerning the design of the project was already made in the project plan. All countries would focus on two programmes representing the same disciplines/professions and would in addition select one program according to national preferences. The result of the discussions came out like this:

Common programmes: Psychology (professional programme)

Political science (liberal programme)

Additional programmes:

Sweden   Engineering (professional programme)

Poland   ICT (professional programme)

Germany   Education (professional programme)

Norway   Law (professional programme)

3.2. The interview guide

The WP1 part of the project involves interviewing freshmen students concerning aspects relevant to the research questions asked in WP1. The form of interview used is a qualitative research interview with strong elements of a phenomenographic approach (see below).

The interview guide was developed in co–operation between the national teams and involved general discussions of domains to be included. This was established at a joint project meeting in Gdansk in 2001. The work continued in the national teams, by e–mail discussions as well as in smaller meetings. This concerned more specific discussions on ways to tap these domains in an interview, forms of questions to be asked and final decisions about the full interview guide. There were even conducted test interviews in some countries to test preliminary versions of the interview guide in practice. As the Norwegian team had the co–coordinating responsibility for WP1, this process was 'chaired' from Oslo. The Swedish team took on the corresponding responsibility for WP2. The process of deciding on the content and format of the WP1 interview was extensive but necessary as the decisions made here will also be decisive for the framework for the WP2: 1 interviews with senior students and partly for the WP2: 2 interviews with novices after their first year of working experience. In order to permit comparisons between the first panel wave for WP2 and the interviews conducted for WP2 a certain overlap exists between the interview schedules.

The final result was an interview guide with a core of common questions, formulated in the same way, to be used in all four countries and in all programs. In addition it was up to each team to add topics/questions of particular interest in their national context. The common version (which was written in English and translated and extended nationally) is appended to the report. The topics and domains that the interview with the freshmen in WP1 covered were the following:

- Introduction and questions concerning the reason for entering the programme.

- The teaching offered and the student's use of it.

- Learning.

- Knowledge.

- Competence.

- Participation.

- Expectations and motivation.

- Personal and moral dilemmas.

As for the interviews with the senior students in WP2:1 these domains were essentially preserved and in addition some other areas were covered as well:

- Prospects for the future work.

- The professional role.

- The studies in retrospect.

The interviews in the second panel wave, WP2:2, preserved most of the areas covered in the WP2:1 interviews and in addition to that questions pertaining to the following domains:

- Reception in work life.

- The work.

- The profession.

3.3. Selection of informants

Although the selection process had to be conducted somewhat differently in the different countries for practical/organisational reasons, the principles behind the selection were:

"Freshmen' were defined as students in their second half of their first year programme (and who preferably has not studied at any other programmes at the university before this one).

The sample of approximately 15 students per programme should be randomly selected from the population of students registered for an actually participating in the programme in that term.

The sample should seek a proportional representation of gender according to the composition of the population in each programme.

Students selected for interviews should express an intention to continue their studies towards a Master degree level within the field of the programme on which they have started.

3.4. Conducting the interview

National research team members split the actual interviewing between them in Sweden and Norway, while the task was given to other interviewers – trained for the task by the teams – in Poland and Germany.

Students were informed about their right to refrain from participating in the interview, about how their anonymity was secured and how the data would be used. They also signed a declaration stating that they had been informed about this and were willing to participate.

Interviews were taped and subsequently transcribed for analysis. The duration of an interview varied between 45 to 90 minutes.

3.5. Analysis of interview data

In order to be able to compare data across national teams and programmes, it was important to identify common procedures and categories for data analysis, while at the same time providing for variation between these. The preliminary work on this was started already when the interview guide was developed. After the interviews had been carried out, an initial version of a guide for analysis was distributed, discussed and decided upon in a process involving discussion in national teams, e– mail exchange and a meeting (in Vadstena, Sweden in May 2002) between members of each national team. For this meeting each group brought a sample interview translated into English and representing both common programmes for trying out the suggested guide for analysis. The guide was modified as a result of these exercises and a final version established which include the following phenomena/domains for phenomenographically inspired analysis:

- Learning.

- Knowledge.

- Competence.

- Moral responsibility.

- Societal function/responsibility to the professional group.

- In addition a more descriptive analysis was carried out concerning:

- Motivation (related to studies and future work).

- Expectations (related to the student role and the future professional role).

Finally a simplified Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) has been carried out (see description below).

As a basis for further calibration of the national activities of analysis, this was one of the main topics at the annual international meeting of project teams in Oslo in September 2002. The task of carrying out preliminary analyses of different 'phenomena'/aspects was distributed between teams in advance and the results of these were presented and discussed as a basis for further national work. As a result of the meeting an outline for the content and organisation of the national WP1 reports was decided and distributed together with a plan and deadlines for finalising the national reports.

3.6. A brief outline of phenomenography

Phenomenography is the empirical study of the qualitatively different ways in which various phenomena in, and aspects of, the world around us are experienced, conceptualised, understood, perceived, and apprehended (Marton, 1994) The words "experience", "perceive" and so on are used interchangeably. The point is to suggest that the limited number of ways in which a certain phenomenon appears to people can be found, for instance, regardless of whether they are embedded in immediate experience of the phenomenon or in reflected thought about the same phenomenon. Marton, Dahlgren, Svensson and Säljö at the University of Gothenburg in a series of studies of learning in higher education carried out in the early 1970s developed Phenomenography. The analyses were initially performed in order to obtain a description of the processes and outcomes of meaningful learning from the perspective of the learner. As regards the processes of learning, these were later interpreted as indicating the existence of a surface and a deep–level approach connected, respectively, to an atomistic and a holistic

approach. These approaches could be described as a referential dimension as regards the focus of attention and a structural dimension as regards the organisation of the learning material during the learning process. (Säljö, 1975; Svensson, 1976; Marton et al., 1977) The dominating method of data collection has been semi–structured interviews. A basic assumption is that individuals vary with regard to how they understand different phenomena in the surrounding world, and that describing the variation as an outcome space is a valuable research enterprise (Marton, 1981). A key issue in phenomenography is the nature and ontological status of *conceptions*, which is the object of the research. Marton claims that,

> The basic unit of phenomenography is experiential, non–dualistic, and internal personal person–world relationship, a stripped depiction of capability and constraint, non–psychological, collective but individually and culturally distributed, a reflection of the collective anatomy of awareness, inherent in a particular perspective. (Marton, 1995, p.171).

The experiential ontology of conceptions means that there is no other world to us humans than the experienced one. Human experience is also characterised by our discernment of what is figural in a situation and what constitutes the ground in which this figure is embedded. The individual not only conceives of different aspects or parts of isolated phenomena, but also organises and relates what is conceived to constitute a whole. This could be described as the structural aspect of the experience. Closely linked to the structural aspect is the referential aspect, the meaning; when we discern the parts and the whole and their relationship, we also see the meaning. The delimitation from and relating to a context make up the "e xternal horizon" of the phenomenon, like the shape of a piece of a jig–saw puzzle that remains when it is removed from the puzzle as a whole. The delimitation and relating of parts make up the "internal horizon" of the phenomenon, like when you describe the missing piece in its component parts. The external and internal horizons together make up the structural aspect of the experience. There is a corresponding referential aspect in the meaning inherent in the experience (Marton, 1994). A non–dualistic and internal person–world relationship means that both subject and object constitute each other; i.e. neither the subject nor the object would be the same without the relation between them. In this way, the subject and object are not independent; they form a unity that reflects both the experienced phenomenon and the experiencing subject. The essence of the non–dualistic stand-point is that we cannot describe a world that is independent of our descriptions or of us as describers (Marton, 1995, p.173).

Marton & Booth (1997 have recently elaborated the phenomenographic perspective of learning. In this study, we build on their thoughts, but we have interpreted the phenomenographic approach freely and, thus, do not follow the model of procedure slavishly. In phenomenographic studies in the context of learning, the structural aspect of the experience could also be described as the *'what'–aspect of learning*. What is it that the learner discerns from the content to be learned, what is it that is conceived figural? This makes up the *direct object of learning* for the learner. In our study, the direct object of learning is the content of psychology or political science and the knowledge and competence needed to become a psychologist or political scientist. When we as researchers identify what is discerned, we can also see more clearly how the internal horizon, i.e. how the relationships between the component parts discerned is structured and organised. When we see how the conception is structured, we simultaneously see more clearly the referential aspect of experience, i.e. the meaning that the learner ascribes to the aspects of the phenomenon discerned. In the following, we will present an example from the Swedish analyses of the interviews conducted with the psychology students to show more concretely how the phenomenographic approach has been applied in the project.

3.6.1. Phenomenography in the Journeymen project: an illustrative example

The phenomenographic analysis comprises several steps, which lead to the forming of descriptive categories that denote the variation in conceptions of the phenomena under study. The primary analysis of interview data in this study is inspired by the rigorous procedure of phenomenography as a first step on the way towards understanding socially (institutionally) and culturally situated and constructed meanings. In our study, the categories obtained through the primary analysis are thus seen as provisional. Dahlgren and Fallsberg (1991) have made an attempt at describing and labelling the steps in the process;

1) *Familiarisation*. In this initial phase, the researcher reads the transcriptions carefully with the aim of getting acquainted with the texts in detail. This is also necessary in order to make any corrections or amplifications.

2) *Condensation.* The most significant statements are selected to give a short version of the entire dialogue concerning the phenomenon under study. In finding the core statements in the answers, the researcher again has to be aware of his/her own preconceptions in order to ensure that the condensation really focuses on what the interviewee brings into the discussion.

3) *Comparison.* The next step is to compare the selected significant dialogue excerpts in order to find sources of variation or agreement. Steps 2 and 3 also require the researcher's attention both as regards the variations of what aspects of the phenomenon are brought into the discussion and as regards the variation in how these aspects are dealt with.

4) *Grouping.* Bearing the result of the previous steps in mind, the next feature of the analysis is to group answers, which appeared to have similarities. Based on this grouping, the categories that form the result are developed in the next step.

5) *Articulating.* The essence of the similarities within each group of answers was preliminary described. Steps 4 and 5 are revised several times before the analysis is considered satisfactory.

6) *Labelling.* Constructing a suitable linguistic expression that captures the essence of the articulation denotes the various categories. The analysis this far yields a description of the different ways of experiencing the phenomena under study, which in phenomenographic terminology is called the outcome space.

7) *Contrasting.* The categories obtained are compared with regard to similarities and differences at a meta level.

The psychologist as a 'helper' or a 'social engineer'

The psychologist as a helper

There is a strong conviction that the psychologist as a person is the working instrument and therefore, there is a need for self-knowledge, self-confidence and self-reflection. A psychologist needs also to be open-minded, flexible, and to have the capability to engage in other people. It is a personal way of being. There is also a worry about the capability to manage in the professional role, a worry about not to cope with the burden of carrying the problems of clients.

> I think a good psychologist is good at being yourself (.) and to have genuine engagement in people, and enjoy being with other people (.) (What makes me motivated) is a feeling to be there for another person (.) The same feeling as someone else might feel when solving a difficult mathematical problem. To help someone who has not have the same conditions in life as myself. (.) It is important not to get stuck, to take over the clients' problem. I don't think you manage the work then. (Psy 6).

The psychologist as a social engineer

Students holding this conception of the role of the psychologist separate the theoretical knowledge base with the professional activity and have a focus on what actions to take to solve the problems. The psychologist's role is the expert observer who understands and can describe people's behaviour through analyses of hidden layers of the personality.

> A good psychologist has a good empathic ability and deep knowledge in the subject, through which you can analyse problems and solve them. That is a good psychologist (Psy2)

> A good psychologist should be able to interpret the undertext and to see the real problems and knows what ought to be done and when. He should also have distance towards his role and realise what he can do to help the patient (Psy4)

> Psychologists should not only help people, but they should make explicit what it is that really takes place. The psychologist can put words to things that seem self-evident (Psy 16)

3.6.2. A Brief outline of Critical Discourse Analysis

Discourse analysis is a set of research procedures applied to interpret complex issues of language use in particular social situations. As J.P. Gee notes, it is informed by a view of language that exceeds the traditionally communicative understanding of its function (i.e. that of exchanging information). For Gee, the main functions of language are *"… to scaffold the performance of social activities (…) and to scaffold human affiliation within cultures and social groups and institutions* (Gee 1999,1). This is why, in this project, the linguistically expressed conceptions of educational issues can be understood as related to subjective activities (actual and planned), social (including professional) identities, and cultural and institutional structures. This approach aims at analysing the cultures of institutions on the basis of individual narratives of people involved in their activities. Social organisations are in general *"produced, reproduced and transformed through the ongoing, interdependent and goal–oriented communication practices of its members* (Mumby 1997, 181). These practices, in turn, have "*implications for how social goods are or ought to be distributed*, which means that they are *political* in the generic (e.g. Aristotelian) sense of the word. (Gee 1999, p. 2).

As language is a complex and multidimensional universe, the research on language is equally complex. Procedures generally referred to as discourse analysis are diverse, and there are numerous debates and polemics-taking place within this area of studies (for

presentation of the diversity of approaches see van Dijk, 1998, 1998a). Here, a debate on (and around) the *critical discourse analysis* approach is important to bring forth.

Critical discourse analysis (referred to as CDA in the rest of this text) is not a uniform research strategy. The main common feature of numerous approaches in this field (see Van Dijk 1998) seems to be at least a partial focus on power relations permeating the speech acts. Fairclough (1993) defines this methodology in the following way:

By 'critical' discourse analysis we mean analysis which aims to systematically explore often opaque relationships of causality and determination between (a) discursive practices, events and texts, and (b) wider social and cultural structures, relations and processes; to investigate how such practices, events and texts arise of and are ideologically shaped by relations of power and struggles over power; and to explore how the opacity of these relationships between discourse and society is itself a factor securing power and hegemony (1993, 135; quoted after Mumby 1997, 183).

As it has been presented in the theoretical introduction to this report, the issues of power relations (especially those related to economy) are relevant in the analysis of how higher education nowadays shapes the opportunities of learning and knowledge production. This is the main reason why we tend to incline towards the *critical* variety of discourse analysis.

Power in text analysis is usually traced through institutionalised discursive formations, or orders of discourse that shape what is, can, and cannot be said in given circumstances. Following is one of the typical descriptions of the procedure:

CDA's explanatory ambitions aimed at covering all relevant strata of analysis: from (micro) 'text–in–situation' through the (meso) 'institutional' to the wider (macro) 'socio–cultural' – moving correspondingly from the analysis of text through the study of processes of text production, consumption and distribution to an explanatory assessment of discourse as socio-cultural practice. (Slembrouck 2001, p.38). Gee (ibid.) distinguishes between discourses, with both a small and a capital D.

There is one feature of CDA, however, that is not being directly present in our research strategy. CDA is often employed not to merely describe and analyse discursive practices, but also to *change* particular institutions, usually through raising the critical awareness of the people who are subject to such research. To some extent, such a "partisan" epistemology, in which positions and interests of the subjects are taken as the positions from which the whole discursive area is being read, is also present in our project. This will be mostly provided by the phenomenographic approach to interviewing – the

discourses we will try to deal with will be constructed from the perspective of the "life–worlds" of the subjects. From there, we will try to proceed towards institutional and – in general – cultural formations. What will be of lesser importance here, however, are claims to emancipatory validity of the project that are typical of many CDA approaches, i.e. attempts at the research results being significant *for* the subjects, helping them in dealing with *their* particular problems. Our research is not directly oriented towards "institutional intervention aimed at changing concrete environments so that the interests of our subjects are better recognised. It does not mean, however, that it cannot be significant for the students involved. Interviewing students on their conceptions of learning and work, we do intervene in their ways of seeing their lives. It may help them name as well as critically distance themselves from, particular narratives that shape their lives, and may inspire them to develop strategies they may use to re–shape them. This, however, is not a result that will be in directly controlled by us.

As we are not intending to "act for the students we are interviewing, we need to delimit our approach as *partly* consistent with the goals usually adopted by CDA researchers. This is why Gee's approach to the study of discourse, collapsing the difference between critical and uncritical (if such is possible) discourse analysis, is adopted here. In his account, *every* discourse analysis – while reaching towards social contexts – is critical.

3.6.3. How discursive formations are traced: The link between phenomenography and discourse analysis

The analytical procedure applied in the project is multi–layered. We are interested not only in individual constructions of various aspects of education expressed by the students, but also in what shapes discernible "academic cultures". The passage between individual and social constructions in data interpretation is secured by a procedure designed on the basis of the methodologies of discourse analysis (DA) and critical discourse analysis (CDA). The results of such analyses will lead towards a hermeneutic and comparative interpretation of cultures within which our investigations take place.

Interview data – as any other text – can be used as material for discourse analysis. A very good (and clearly reported) example of such an interpretative procedure can be found in Talja, 1999. In her account, discourse analysis of the interview data incorporates three stages:

> The first phase consists of the analysis of inconsistencies and internal contradictions in the answers of one participant. The second phase consists of the identification of regular patterns in the variability of accounts: repeatedly occurring descriptions, explanations, and

arguments, in different participants' talk. [...] The third phase consists of identifying the basic assumptions and starting points (in Foucauldian language, 'statements') that underlie a particular way of talking about a phenomenon. (Talja 1999, 466)

A very similar outline for identifying discourses constitutes the methodological guideline for the first stage of discourse analysis in *Journeymen*. Later stages – involving more complex analyses of various 'levels' of discourse and the dynamics of its production, distribution and re–production – follow after the completion of phenomenographic data and their comparative analysis. This delay results from our experience that the operation of discursive structures sometimes becomes overt when *different* narratives are compared. Technically speaking, the more detailed analyses – designed in order to describe structural complexities of educational discourses – are undertaken when discourses identified at the first stage of analyses in all participating countries and in all researched programmes are juxtaposed and scrutinised for similarities and differences. This leads to a number of procedures designed to describe institutions in the instances of production, distribution, and reproduction of discourses on the levels of language usage, structures (classifications, omissions, exclusions, etc), legitimacy, and power. The whole analysis is concluded with broad hermeneutic interpretations of academic cultures, making use of the results of phenomenography and discourse analysis, and involving insiders' perspectives of the researchers – this time as members of the researched communities themselves (all authors of the reports are employees of the institutions where data are collected). In the following, we will present an example from the Polish analyses of the interviews conducted with the students in Political Sciences to show more concretely how discourse analysis has been applied in the project.

3.6.4. Discourse analysis in the Journeymen project: An illustrative example

The scope of analyses is limited to the institutional construction of the discourses of education and work *in the Academe*: the report – the analysed pattern comes from - is based on the data gathered from freshmen and senior students and it does not include the data from novice workers. Apart from the interview material, the interpretation of institutional conditions and power relations also employs other data accessible to the researchers (syllabi, course descriptions, etc., as well as the "hot" knowledge of the researchers as insiders). We are concentrating here on the *structural* aspect of discourse, paying less attention to its *dynamic* (narrative) dimensions. While reading the whole report one should remember that in all the above mentioned "areas" (topics, structures, power) we can try to see where and how discourses are "produced", how they are

"distributed" and "reproduced" by our informants (their utterances are *reactive* to some institutional/cultural experiences we evoke by our questions). This dimension, even though not aimed at in the process of analysis as the most important, will occasionally appear in the presentation of particular discourses.

Labelling 'The Discourse of the Incompleteness of Education'

The meaning of 'incompleteness' used for labelling this discursive formation relates to the insufficiency of official curricula for meeting the subjects' expectations towards an adequate preparation to future professional roles. The logic of the discourse involves the following topics discernible in the interviews:

Ideas on 'incompleteness' of academic education

Exemplary statements, which reveal the logic of the discourse, include:

- Critical opinions regarding the quality of the learning process and its content that disclose insufficiency of its orientation towards acquiring professional competence:

    I got a taste of everything: a bit of psychology, a touch of sociology, something on law. A little on every subject matter, not much. That's why I may say: I was learning everything and I can do nothing. (Pol,PS,Wp2;3)

- Opinions that reveal the inability of the academic institution to provide conceptual, organisational, and material conditions for education to be successful in its professional aspect:

    It was called 'methods and techniques of work organisation' - a completely nonsensical subject where I learnt that a manager is a person responsible for management. (Pol,PS,Wp2;2)

Ideas on and practices of informal learning strategies developed by the students in order to compensate for the incompleteness

Exemplary statements, which reveal the logic of the discourse, include:

- Descriptions of extra-curricular strategies of learning independently developed by students

    The most important thing is what we managed to do outside the institute building, beyond the official curricula: that we remained a good

team of people who could get fun as well as learn together when discussing different topics. (Pol,PS,Wp2;2)

- Depictions of extra–curricular sources of knowledge explored to acquire professional competence

My favourite way of learning is reading newspapers, watching TV, listening to the radio. I visit web pages and I look for different definitions, interesting and special subjects. (Pol,PS,WP1;16)

***Relations between the issues mentioned above and the visions of future profession**, mostly in the aspect of professional knowledge and skills.*

Exemplary statements, which reveal the logic of the discourse, include:

- Conceptions of professional competence that require supplementing by means of extra-curricular knowledge and learning strategies

A political scientist must be familiar with current political events. Therefore you don't need to read fat books. Newspapers are good enough. (Pol,PS,Wp2;3)

When you go to work they don't ask you what you have learnt but what you can do. They are not going to ask me for example about all the American doctrines I know but if I can negotiate. The latter one is important, not the theory of negotiations. (Pol,PS,Wp2;1).

The logic of this discourse is organised accordingly to disparate visions of future professional competence seen from the theoretical perspective as well as generated by a pragmatic *practical* logic[1]. As such, it constitutes the *logic of inclusion* oriented towards the completion of an "educational vacuum". Such logic evokes re-shaping/recontextualising of the learning process and provokes changes in its content. As its *material consequence* we witness a displacement within the structure of learning process, resulting in the experience of 'patchwork learning' that might be characterised in terms of:

- Developing differentiated extra-curricular strategies of learning independently created by students;

---

[1] The distinction between theoretical and practical logic follows the idea of P.Bourdieu: Bourdieu P.: Raisons pratiques. Sur la théorie de l'action, Editions du Seuil, Paris 1994.

- Translocation of learning from institutional to the *life world* context (media coverage, workplace culture and academic culture)

  Multiplying sources of knowledge that embrace: academic transmission, common sense knowledge, and the media, practical experience acquired at the workplace.

Power that constitutes the discourse of education as incomplete seems to be influenced by contradictory drives:

1) The liberal construction of the curricula and the lack of tradition of liberal education (in its academic sense) in education of political scientists at the University of Gdansk, which results in a "conceptual perforation" of academic curricula (see also: The Discourse of Jamboree Academism)

2) A misleading emphasis put on claimed professionalism as a result of academic education in political science (such visions of professionalism seem to be created by different sources: some academic teachers, the media, market forces, political culture etc.). (See also: The Discourse of Elitism)

The discourse of 'incompleteness of education' gives rise to the vision of transition between higher education and work that grounds in the logic of professional development through competence – oriented 'patchwork learning'.

4. Results. Structural and cultural conditions of higher education

4.1. Educational context – general description

4.1.1. Sweden

The government has set objectives of 50 per cent of a cohort of young people attending institutions of higher education and providing more study places in higher education for the natural sciences and engineering. The number of students increased from 16 000 in 1950 to over 330 000 in 1999. The reform of higher education in 1977 extended the definition of higher education and the number of students increased further. In the year 2001- 2002 the registered students were 354 619 and the number of degrees awarded was 31 800.

There are about fifty institutions of higher education run either by the government, regional authorities or private organisers (National agency for Higher Education, The Changing Face of Higher Education in Sweden). The institutions themselves decide the

internal organisation of institutions in higher education. Certain guidelines are laid down in the Higher Education Act and the Higher Education Ordinance.

When the students enter and register for studies within the university, the university obtains 40% of the assigned sum of money from the government. When they have passed their final course of the semester, the university receives the remaining 60% of the student money. Therefore it is important for the university to attract students to the programmes, but also to make sure they pass them.

4.1.2. **Norway**

The Ministry of Education and Research is responsible for all education in Norway, including higher education. In 2002 a total of 179 000 students were registered at institutions of higher education with 158 300 at state-run institutions and 21 300 in private institutions, which constitutes just above 40% of the cohort. There are 4 universities, 6 specialised universities, 26 state colleges and 29 private institutions of higher education.

Higher education in Norway is as a rule free and students pay a small sum per term to their student union. Most of higher education is public, state run and state financed. Even private higher education institutions receive a large percentage of their budget from the State.

Money is allocated to each public institution directly from the Ministry according to a budget. There are three main parts in the allocation of money:

- The basic funding – allocated according to the size and scope of the institution. Very much based on previous budgets.

- The educational funding – allocated according to the 'production'/output of students the previous year (number of degrees and credit points gained by the students at the institution).

- The research funding – allocated according to research 'production' previous year (a part where the criteria are under constant revision and negotiation).

4.1.3. Poland

On the basis of a law on higher education adopted in 1990 higher education institutions were granted institutional autonomy, including a large degree of independence from the state administration and of academic freedom (freedom in teaching and research), and internal self-governance was developed. The new legislation made possible the establishment of non-state higher education institutions. In Poland there are 227 schools of higher education, which operate on the basis of the Act Schools of Higher Education (including 137 non-state ones).

In the academic year 2001/2002 a total of 1 699 389 students (43,6 % of the cohort) were registered at institutions of higher education (state and non-state). It means that about 4,5 % of the population are students. The highest number of students was enrolled in universities - around 523 300 students. The non-state schools of higher education catered for 432 900 students (2002/03).

Since 1991 (since the introduction of new acts on higher education and on the State Committee for Scientific Research) the public financing of higher education is based on the following parts of the state budget:

- "Higher Education" - financial means directed to teaching (including teacher's remuneration), in-service training for teachers, financial support to students and to investments. The Ministry of National Education and Sport is in charge of this subsidy (together with other supervising ministries). Higher education institutions can also receive funds from local self-governments' budgets as well as from donations including those from abroad.

- "Research" - financial means directed to research activities. The State Committee for Scientific Research is in charge of this subsidy.

The funds are not sufficient to fulfil all the needs of HE institutions, which means that many schools feel scarcity of resources. Not only the private, but also state-run schools develop commercially oriented courses. For instance, they increase the number of extramural students who have to pay tuition fees.

4.1.4. Germany

In 2002 1.98 million students were registered at institutions of higher education. In other words: almost 2,5 % of the German population are students.

The university receives the main budget funds from the Ministry of Science in North Rhine-Westphalia (NRW) and newly can decide autonomously about the distribution of the money to each faculty. This revised national funding system starts serious competition among the 37 universities (and 20 licensed private universities) in NRW. Altogether the universities receive 251,3 mill. EURO for higher education and research, indeed the resources are allocated to the criteria of performance and students capacities. Since 2000 there has been another budget source the universities can generate money from: with the innovation fund a future-oriented reorganisation and internationalisation of the higher education system should be enforced.

4.2. Institutional level – characteristics of universities

4.2.1. Linköping University (Sweden)

Linköping university, with a staff of approx. 3 000, 24 000 students and 1 400 postgraduate students, is a young university established 1975. The students are young (60% under 25 years), recruited nationwide and approx. 50% men and 50% women. The university has 3 faculties: Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Institute of Technology and Faculty of Health Sciences. The departments, all in all 22, are polydisciplinary with several related disciplines included within one and the same department.

4.2.2. University of Oslo (Norway)

The University of Oslo, founded in 1811, is Norway's largest and oldest university. It has approximately 32 000 students and it has a permanent academic staff of approximately 2 500. It consists of 8 faculties and over 70 departments; as well as a number of clinics, research centres and museums.

4.2.3. University of Gdansk (Poland)

The University of Gdansk was created by decree of the Ministerial Council on 20th March 1970 that linked the Higher Educational School in Gdansk and the Higher School of Economics in Sopot. This is one of the largest universities in Pomeranian region. It has 33 000 students in 9 faculties. The university, with academic staff of 1 600, offers possibility of education in twenty-six disciplines in range of 106 specializations.

4.2.4. University of Duisburg-Essen (Germany)

The University of Duisburg-Essen, with a staff of approx. 1.800 and 15.000 (41% female) students, was established in 1972. The university consists of 11 faculties and 15 departments (including 9 affiliated) institutes. Most of the research institutes are either integrated in or affiliated to the university.

In 2000/2001 a newly founded Institute, called, has replaced the psychology faculty: Institute for Cognition and Communication. The new programme "Applied Communication and Media Science *(Kommedia)"* mainly places emphases on human science in the context of media and technology (interdisciplinary approach with other academic disciplines). It means that the original psychology programme is not offered for new students in the University of Duisburg any longer. The respondents of the "freshmen group" have been the last student cohort in the psychology programme.

4.3. Structural and pedagogical conditions of the Psychology programme

4.3.1. Aims and profile of the programme

Sweden

The education programme is resting on the notion of psychology as a science. The subject matter studies have a research perspective that actualises the theories, methods and problems within the field of psychology. Critical reflections are stimulated, mostly through science and/or reasoning from the perspective of theory of science and philosophy of science and through a problem based working method. An approach to problem-solving and experience-related training is characteristic of the whole programme.

Norway

The graduate professional program represents the educational basis for approval of status as a psychologist. The Law of health regulates professional psychological work. The programme rests on psychology as a science. The aim of the professional program is to offer solid and broad knowledge about the different fields of psychology and their scientific basis. The students should acquire general knowledge of the most important theories, research methods and result applicable to professional work. The programme is heavily theoretically oriented in the first part and a combination of theoretical studies and practical/clinical-oriented work in the second part.

Poland

The main purpose of the studies is to give students knowledge and practical skills connected with work as psychologists in the medical service, education and private psychological practices. Graduates of psychology are prepared to care for and conduct a professional rehabilitation with sensorically and motorically disabled persons and mentally handicapped ones (children, youths and adults). Students also get information, which will be of use in personnel, and training departments, advisory companies, employment agencies and educational centres.

Germany

In Duisburg the study of Psychology is offered for state examination for the lectureship at secondary schools and has to be combined with one of the following subjects: Chemistry, German, English, French, Geography, History, Informatics, Mathematics, Physics and Social Sciences. Additionally it is obligatory to study Educational Sciences.

4.3.2. Selection procedures and enrolment

Sweden

24 students each semester. 2/3 of them become students after interviews and 1/3 becomes students on their prior grades from the secondary upper school. There are 3-4 students that drop out from each class.

Norway

Approximately, 40 students are accepted to the professional programme. Only students with excellent grades (3 to 4 %) from the written exam of the foundation level are accepted. Low drop-out rates in the professional programme.

Poland

Approximately 100 students. Prospective first-year students are accepted into the Psychology Department under recruitment procedure based on written entrance examination results or on 'new matura' (state examination on the leave from secondary school system) results. Applicants who have a 'new matura' certificate will be exempt from the entrance examination on condition that they scored the required number of points in Polish, history and biology.

Germany

The entrance qualification would be the *Abitur* or a degree from a technical college *(Fachoberschulabschluss)*. There is an internal numerous clausus as the number of applicants exceeds the number of students to be accepted. Final school grades determine the selection. About 30 freshmen students, number of seniors 10. Many psychology students change to the pedagogy programme before the end of the studies.

4.3.3. The structure and pedagogy of the programme

Sweden

The study is a full time study of five years. After graduation the student have to do a PPT (one year of mentor guided practice before certification). The programme is organised as problem-based learning by five blocks. The students have good access to the teachers since they all are engaged in teaching at the institution. When it comes to grading, the programme only uses 2 steps – pass or fail (approved or not approved). The students have practical training periods as parts of every block. During the programme the students have practical training altogether 16 weeks. The practical training is organised as follows; 6 weeks during semester three and 10 weeks in semester nine. They also attend to ego therapy during their education.

Norway

The study is a full time six years study (included the fundamental level) with organised mandatory lectures, courses, seminars and practical training. Colloquium groups are institutionally organised but followed up and supplemented by the students themselves. The students develop a relatively close relation to teachers and external mentors.

The curriculum is strongly structured. The Department provides up-to-date lists of prescribed reading, and the syllabus is clearly defined. It is possible to substitute some of the titles if approved by a special Department Committee. The programme is divided into two parts: part one, 2 ½ years, is purely theoretically oriented. Part two, ½ years, is more professionally oriented and includes a period of practical training. The internship period is normally 28 hours a week in 6 months in an external institution and normally starts after one year in the second part. The students receive guidance and feedback from an internship counsellor. The students are evaluated by oral and written examinations and through the whole programme. Additionally they are evaluated through master thesis and practical training

Poland

The programme is a full time study of five years. The programme is strongly structured. Classes take different forms: lectures, lessons, and seminars. During the fist two years there is no specialisation. The programme for the two first years is common to all students. Courses including foundations of psychology (obligatory) are offered during the first five semesters. Specialised courses designed to deepen the knowledge in a chosen area of psychology and/or teach practical skills are offered to students from VI semester. Taking specialisation is not obligatory but it is recommended. There are only written exams (no oral exams).

Visits to external institutions (nursery schools, sanatoriums etc.) to show students the practical aspects of psychological work are offered, but no practical training is required.

The Director of the Psychology Department issued the following announcement regarding students in day and evening courses: *successful completion of the studies does not necessitate participation in a practical training programme.* Nevertheless it is recommended that students attend external courses and professional training to improve skills useful in future work.

Germany

The programme is a full time study of six years. The programme is divided into two parts: a fundamental course and an advanced period. During the foundation course (four semesters) the students join lectures, seminars, tutorials, and practical training in experimental-psychology. Additionally students organise themselves in smaller learning groups. The accessibility of teachers varies. Students of other programmes within the humanities join psychology courses. The psychology students are also enrolled in a second subject of their choice.

Most of the psychology seminars target at the improvement of methodological and theoretical knowledge, personal training-courses for students are rather seldom. The experimental-psychological-training is part of the foundation course (methodological education). In addition there are two obligatory practical trainings at school with duration of about four weeks.

4.4. Structural and pedagogical conditions of Political Science programme

4.4.1. Aims and profile of the programme

Sweden

The purpose of the programme in Political Science and Economics is to provide the students with a broad knowledge of the social sciences. The programme includes international politics, institutional theory and scientific conflicts etc. The critical approach to various political and economical theories is an important criterion of the programme. It is also possible for the students to add courses in such areas as social sciences and languages.

Norway

The programme is described as a liberal programme with heavy emphasis on developing academically oriented independency and analytical skills. The fundamental course in Political Science aims – according to the curriculum – to provide a general introduction to the four major areas of political theory, international politics, comparative politics, public politics and administration and research methods and statistics. The expected profile of competence is related to the emphasis placed on independent academic understanding, scientific analysis and the capacity for systematic argumentation. The latter part of the programme that leads to a masters' degree opens to some specialisation.

Poland

Political studies can be described as a general (liberal) programme with a humanistic profile. The main purpose of political studies is to offer the students practical skills connected with professional work in national administration, self-government council organisations, political parties, economic and social organisations, education and international institutions. The emphasis is on providing general political knowledge as well as theoretical and practical specialisation knowledge.

Germany

The study of Political Sciences is embedded in the course of the studies of Social Sciences (2.200 students), called *Integrierter Diplomstudiengang Sozialwissenschaften*, together with the studies of "Social Work and Education" and "Sociology". An important aim is to give fundamental knowledge in the technique of scientific work, and – with a great accent – the methods of Social Science. Another aim is the qualification of the students

to get employed outside university, for example, through offering so-called practice-seminars in different branches, enterprises or in the administration.

4.4.2. Selection procedures and enrolment

Sweden

The common selection procedure is that the students apply and the central administration selects. In order to become a master student, you have to pass the under-graduate levels and if the programme receives too many applicants they select the individuals from the quality of their thesis. The number of students is approximately 100 on the undergraduate level and approximately 20-30 on the master student level. The number of dropouts on the undergraduate level is relatively high but on the master level relatively low.

Norway

The selection procedure is based on ranking of grades. In order to become a master student your examination score on the fundamental level or the intermediate level must be 2,7 or better (the grading scale used in 2002). The majority of students get this score. Very few of the students finish their master degree on time. The total number of registered students on the undergraduate and graduate level is 1340 of which approximately 532 students are registered as master students (2002). Almost 100 students signed up for the finishing their master degree.

Poland

Prospective first-year students are accepted into the department under recruitment procedure based on written entrance test results. Applicants who have a 'new matura' certificate will be exempt from the entrance examination on condition that they score the required number of points in history and social education. Grades do not serve a selective function, they are not rigorous, faculty members adopt a superficial approach to information about grades imparted to students (grades are not significant, they do not determine a level of knowledge), they are conventional, relative, assessment methods can be questioned, they are subject to negotiation.

The number of undergraduates in 2002 was 74 and the number of master students was 156 students.

Germany

When needed there is an internal numerus clausus depending on the number of applicants, so that the school grades become decisive factors for the acceptance of students. Normally, the criteria for the enrolment are not very demanding. The drop-out rate is almost 70 percent.

At the end of the foundation course the students have to pass the statistic course in order to acquire the pre-degree and to start the advanced study periods. Between 60 and 70 percent of the students fail this written test at their first trial. Students who failed the third trial mostly end with the programme. A lot of students quit the programme before their graduation. As they spend more time on working than on studying they seem to have an emotional distance to the university studies.

4.4.3. The structure and pedagogy of the programme

Sweden

The study is a full time four years programme. The programme is organised in form of conventional lectures, seminars and tutoring of the main thesis. The exams cover many different areas within political science and economics and are organised as written examinations and essays. During the last two years, the students may choose between two fields of specialization: political science and economics.

The students read several subjects in parallel, which may effect that the students don't finish in time. There is not much mandatory teaching and the students can choose from the curricula within the university or travel abroad to study. The students can choose to have some practical training in 20 weeks or 10 weeks in the 7th semester. It's not mandatory, the students organise this and the department approves.

Norway

The study is a full time six years programme. The content is relatively fixed but leaves room for choices in the work with main thesis. No mandatory teaching attendance required. The programme is organised in forms of lectures, seminars and actuality symposia with profiled guest lectures. Colloquium groups are not mandatory but highly recommended. Low accessibility of the teachers on the undergraduate level but for the master students there is individual supervisions and higher accessibility of the teacher. There are separate written exams in each topic of the discipline and one exam in

methods and statistics. A separate grading is given for each of the units. No practical training is offered during the educational programme.

Poland

Studies last five years. The programme is divided into three blocks of courses: general knowledge, basic subjects and specialist subjects. Courses take different forms: lectures, lessons and seminars. Visits to the Sejm (Polish Parliament) and meetings with politicians are organised in order to show students the practical aspects of political work.

There is not much mandatory teaching. It is not possible to choose an individual education scheme except for specialization in Political and self-government systems, The development of civilisation and International political relations.

Only students who attend a pedagogical course have to complete a practical training period. There is no requirement to complete such a training period during the studies for other students but most of them strive for attending to such practical activity. Only the best students can expect help and recommendation of their professors in searching for practical training.

Germany

The recommended duration of studies is 9 semesters ("Regelstudienzeit" - regular time). The programme is divided into two parts: a fundamental course and an advanced period. The programme is organised in form of lectures and seminars. Literature-based learning is the most common way of learning. The students have a variety of courses to choose from, although this choice is restricted by compulsory lectures.

The accessibility of the teachers varies. Practical training is not obligatory. Internships in economical companies and public administration are voluntary.

5. Results. Freshmen and senior students' conceptions of education and work

The findings reported here are based on data from the interviews with freshmen and senior students as well as on our reading of curriculum guidelines for the two programmes and other relevant texts at the faculty/department level. Notice that these data represent a cross-sectional research design. Data from the third (nationally decided) programme is not presented in this chapter.

The two research questions in focus here are;

1) How do students perceive their educational program?

2) How do students perceive their future profession?

The first research question is retrospective, looking back on experiences as a student in a liberal or professional program. The second one is prospective, looking ahead on expectations for the future as a professional.

In this chapter we will first present brief national summaries of the findings concerning the students' conceptions of their educational programmes and of their future professions. These will be presented in texts where the two aspects are integrated. We will then compare the national findings focusing on similarities and differences across countries and programmes. Finally we will present the different discourses that are identified as characteristic for the two programmes in the different countries, followed even here by a comparison across nations and programmes.

5.1. National summaries

5.1.1. Sweden

Political science students

These Swedish political science freshmen seem to have a fairly good notion of what political science is as a field of study, an insight that is even stronger among seniors. The latter report that writing a master thesis ha s helped them a lot to understand what political science is about. The conception of the political scientist as a professional position is, however, rather vague among freshmen and even among the seniors. One could say that the absence of clear role models is the foremost reason for the uncertainty. If any role models are mentioned at all by the freshmen they most often mention their own teachers, whereas some seniors also mention political scientists that appear frequently in mass media. For the average student, however, these are rather unrealistic role models. Senior students do above all mention a set of generic skills characteristic of professionals in the field, such as being able to formulate, analyse and solve problems and furthermore to document and report their analyses and solutions. In all likelihood they are heavily influenced by their experiences during the work with their master theses. It is, however, worth mentioning that senior students emphasise individual rather than social generic skills. This is perhaps the most obvious difference between freshmen and seniors. Among the former a majority emphasise the importance of being able to collaborate with others. The ability to collaborate with others and the

need for empathy or for taking other peoples' perspectives are rarely mentioned by seniors.

The most striking difference between freshmen and seniors is that the latter appear to have acquired a kind of investigator's/evaluator's identity. Such an identity is not as obvious among the freshmen that rather emphasise the task of political scientists as a kind of watchdog for democracy and global justice.

Psychology students

Freshmen in the Swedish psychology programme have a relatively clear notion of what psychology is as a field of knowledge. This notion is from the outset affected by their relatively clear picture of the professional role of psychologists and is fairly well established at the end. One should bear in mind that the psychology programme is a problem based learning programme, with an explicit ambition to integrate basic and applied parts of the studies already from the beginning. This is also indicated by the fact that the freshmen often talk about the various parts of the field in terms of applied areas.

A characteristic feature of psychology as a field of knowledge is the existence of a set of schools according to which man is conceived of in different ways, pertaining both to motives, functions and aims of human thought and actions. The students are fully aware of this fact already at an early stage in their studies. They do, however, relate to it in different ways. To some the solution is a kind of pluralism

i.e. they acquire insights and subsequent diagnostic and therapeutic skills according to different schools to be able to handle patients with different problems differently. To others the solution is the construction of a kind of subjective eclectic perspective i.e. they construe a kind of personal psychological theory comprising elements from different schools in the field. Another difference in conceptions, established quite early, and still present at the end of their education, concerns the role of the psychologist and the client in diagnostic work. To some the psychologist is the expert who, based on the information provided by the client, is able to come up with a correct diagnosis and suggest an effective therapy. To others the awareness about the problem is to be found within the client and if the psychologist is a good listener and mentor it may result in the patient's clear understanding of the problem and also how to deal with it. This is also the main difference between a cognitive and a psychodynamic school in psychology.

Conceptions of psychology as a field of knowledge are, however, more vague than conceptions of the professional role of the psychologists among freshmen and even more so among seniors. This somewhat paradoxical fact may possibly be understood if the

frequent periods of professional experience from the outset of the program are taken into account. The seniors' experience of what it is like to work, as a professional is so rich that their doubts about what the professional role means is gradually eliminated. Another explanation may be that the problem-based programme contributes to conceiving knowledge as functional in relation to situations in professional practice rather than in relation to a disciplinary knowledge structure.

Both freshmen and senior students stress heavily the importance of social generic skills. These comprise above all the empathic abilities as a necessary skill for a professional psychologist.

5.1.2. Norway

Political science students

Norwegian freshmen and senior students of political science conceive their programme as having a strong academic orientation and fostering a dedication to the existing knowledge structure. These aspects, together with the emphasis on intellectual independence, are the main pillars of the conceptions of the programme for both groups of students. They even think it ought to be like this.

As this corresponds with the intentions of the programme the students are quite satisfied with the programme as a means to becoming a professional. Whether you have the needed competence for professional work when finishing the programme depends, according to the students' conception, mostly on your own individual efforts. Some students voice a critical comment about the missing contact with teachers. However since the students see this as "normal" within a liberal programme, they accept it.

Another aspect of the conception of the programme is the emphasis on neutrality and objectivity. A line is drawn between the politician's field of action and the researcher's field of analysis. Consequently to present neutral statements is seen as an important qualification in order to act professionally. For many students, even among the seniors, neutrality is linked to being critical.

While the freshmen express idealistic expectations and dreams about future professional work, the seniors have developed a more realistic conception. This also includes being strategic in relation to career decisions. To some extent this difference in career prospects can be understood as resulting from exposure to an educational programme, which has made them more aware of their job possibilities.

The political science programme does not prepare students for any particular type of jobs although some of the students underline the heavy emphasis on the public sector in the programme. For most of the students this "uncertainty" concerning the future scope of realistic professional jobs, is valued positively both among freshmen and seniors. Students who chose to study Political science may be aware of the lack of a particular professional field and therefore are not surprised. At least they do not define this as an obstacle. Having/getting a higher degree in social science from a university, whatever the subject, is seen as a security and consequently as an advantage.

Psychology students

All the Norwegian psychology students underscore the need for possessing fundamental theoretical and research–based knowledge. This intellectual capital is the hallmark of a *professional* psychology. It defines the crucial distinction between trustworthy authoritative knowledge and common sense knowledge. Both freshmen and seniors in our sample appreciate this kind of knowledge, which is seen as fundamental for a good psychologist. Nevertheless, this is not sufficient regarding professional skills. A psychologist must be able to apply the theoretical knowledge to diverse and complex life–world situation. He/she must possess social and practical problem solving competence must be good at building relations and showing empathy and humbleness the students maintain. This is seen as a moral base of professional competence.

When comparing freshmen and seniors, it seems that there have been no striking and *fundamental* changes in their conceptions of the professional role. However, there has been an elaboration of their conceptions. The most noticeable differences are that the seniors demonstrate a more mature and sophisticated understanding of the professional role than freshmen. They reveal a complex notion of the tasks of a psychologist that we do not find among the freshmen.

Even though the majority of the students are rather satisfied with their time as students, quite a few criticise the structure of the programme, especially the separation between institutional teaching and practical training. When complaining about this, they often compare with other programmes they know about where practical training is better integrated in the programme. The students' dissatisfaction may also be seen in light of their preconceptions. The majority of the psychology students expected the study programme to be a professional education qualifying for a job as a clinical psychologist. A few of the seniors are dissatisfied by the strong domination of academic values. They believe that only students heading for a career within the academic institution are content with this.

Some of the senior students also comment on the limited co-operation among teachers. External teachers, with close connection to practical professional life, are to some extent seen as more "credible" than the faculty teachers. Hence, learning situations linked to practice, are particularly welcomed. The students get more feedback in practice on what they see as essential in order to become a good psychologist; namely the relational and communicative competence. They feel that they are more "seen" by the practitioners off campus than by the academic staff at the institution. This may explain why many of the students refer to professional role models outside the institution. During practice periods they have experienced to be treated as equal partners. This has meant a lot to their notion of a professional identity. Off-campus training periods may impact the students' future professional/vocational identities to a greater extent than their institutional teaching.

Even though most of the freshmen argue for a more clinically oriented introduction to the study, they seem to accept that mastery of conceptual structures and modes of arguments are necessary before introduction to practice. The majority of the freshmen are satisfied and believe that their education will help them become good psychologists. The seniors are more sceptical. They particularly miss training in the role as a therapist. The limited feedback (except from examination marks and in connection with thesis work) is also underlined. Hence, the majority of the seniors argue for introducing practice at an earlier stage in the study programme.

The picture, however, is more complex. At the same time as quite a few seniors claim that there has been too much stress on acquisition of theoretical, de-contextualised knowledge and too little integration with practical knowledge, others are perfectly content with the structure of the programme; theory first and then practical training.

Most students have not tried to influence the study programme in one way or another. As most of them have families and/or are working part time, they do not find time for more this type of engagement. They seem to expose a kind of pragmatic attitude and prefer to be active participants in the programme rather than critical about it. Some of the seniors, however, maintain that they have tried to argue for alternatives, but that changes within the institution take time!

5.1.3. Poland

Political science students

Polish political science freshmen as well as senior students conceive of political science as a broad but at the same time rather vague field of knowledge accumulating knowledge from other disciplinary fields. Part of this is descriptive knowledge of the world and another part is practical (procedural) knowledge which is an instrument used to achieve aims related to power. This goes together with a conception of the role, or mission of the professional in this field, as someone who will be telling people the truth about political issues, influencing the general public as well as politicians. Among senior students this role is somewhat more differentiated into quite different expert roles such as ideologist, impartial counsellor, educator and activist, but also as demagogue or missionary. Altogether the students conceive of the role of the professional political scientist as societally active and influential, but more by talking than by acting. For this role they will need social skills like self-presentation, communicative, relational or social skills in addition to the knowledge mentioned above.

Particularly the senior students look back on their studies as a pleasant, rather relaxed period. They consider 'practical knowledge' (about current political and social issues) most useful and often disregard 'theoretical knowledge' (academic knowledge about disciplinary theories). They are dissatisfied with the very limited practical skill training of the programme and they seem to get an important part of their knowledge from the media rather than from the books – which, by the way, is consistent with what their teachers describe as valuable learning.

Psychology students

Polish psychology students at both levels (freshmen and seniors) conceive psychology as combining theoretical knowledge and practical knowledge. By theoretical knowledge they mean descriptive, declarative, academic knowledge - like knowledge of 'mechanisms' of human behaviour, emotions and social relations. The seniors see theory more often as 'operative' – theory in action - where it is transformed in a way that makes it useful in practice in private and professional life. They are concerned that the programme contributes inadequately to these applied or operational aspects of theories taught, and sometimes use the word 'theoretical' in a derogative way. Practical knowledge is conceived as procedural know-how enabling students to recognise and deal with psychological phenomena in professional practice.

The profession of psychology is seen – particularly by freshmen – as one of providing help to individual people as well as to a "sick society", and also as instrument to manipulate or control people, and to increase awareness and broadening people's horizons (a pedagogical role). The manipulating/controlling function is seen as one of understanding social behaviour, predicting human actions and preventing unacceptable ones. The seniors distinguish between two main professional 'missions': *treatment* and *management*. The first relates to working in the 'helping' sector as a clinical psychologist, which is not considered a popular (but respected) professional role. The other one refers to different types of social, organisational or educational functions which seem to be considered more realistic and possibly also more popular.

The psychology students are dissatisfied with a very limited amount of practical training in their programme and realise they have to learn such aspects of professional life outside (and possibly after) their university studies. Their conception of future professional work is coloured with feelings of anxiety, mostly related to the insecurity of finding employment, but also of being able to live up to the responsibilities of professional work. Some of this is related to perceived inadequacies of their university education.

5.1.4. Germany

Political science students

German freshmen's conceptions of political science are knowledge oriented and focus on theoretical and methodological knowledge. The theoretical knowledge relates to structures and institutions of society, constitutions and political ideas. The general view is that political science is primarily an academically oriented programme. Methodological knowledge concerns analytical and critical abilities and they feel that the programme will provide them with these.

They see the function of political scientists in society as being able to analyse and reflect on political conditions, solve problems in community affairs and contribute to societal change. Altogether they conceive of the political scientist as someone who should have an active part in shaping society.

Despite the dominant orientation towards theoretical knowledge, there is a parallel view that the programme offers too little in terms of practical courses.

A significant group of seniors, particularly from immigrant families see their studies as a means of social advancement but have chosen this particular programme out of personal interest in political affairs. The political scientist is conceived as having an obligation to

preserve the values of a democratic society, acting as an intermediator between different parts in society and giving political advice or doing research. Among the senior students there is an even stronger emphasis on the broad analytical competence that is the hallmark of professional competence in the political scientist. The methodological competence mentioned even by the freshmen is here extended to include rhetorical skills, competence for taking part in (public) discussions in order to gain influence. Professional work should be based on broad theoretical knowledge – which the programme offers – but the students maintain that the motivation and driving force for such societal activities is rather a personal element than contributed by the programme. At this final stage of the programme students say that they need more knowledge of current political affairs than what they get from the programme and which they consequently try to get from the media.

Psychology students

In order to understand the conceptions of psychology among the German students, it is important to keep in mind that this program prepares students for work as teachers of psychology in secondary schools and not for professional practice as clinical or social psychologists. Freshmen's conceptions of psychology as a field of knowledge includes general psychology, statistics and methodology seen as means to deal with professional challenges of understanding people, dealing with them and doing research. The particular emphasis is on knowledge of communication processes. This is followed up by the senior students who subordinate theoretical and methodological competence to social and communicative competence as important for professional psychologists. Elements of such competence are didactical skills such as being able to explain by applying knowledge to practical examples and ability to communicate with authorities and pupils/parents.

Students conceive psychology as experienced in the program as an academic discipline rather than as qualification for professional work. They are to a large extent critical to what they see as a very theoretical orientation of the program, which particularly the freshmen had expected to be more problem oriented. They find that the program contains too few practical courses and miss more training to become teachers. However, they gradually be come positive to the requirements for obligatory homework assignments as they conceive them as fruitful for learning. The same goes even for the examination period and the communication among peer students.

5.2. Main issues across national reports

In the text below we summarise the findings across nations, first within programmes and then across programmes and nations in order to identify significant similarities and differences.

5.2.1. Political Science Students' Visions

On comparison we find that both *Swedish* and *Norwegian* students of political science have clear notions of the field of study. Their approach to their studies is individual and is seen to generate generic skills (strategic, analytical and problem– solving) that are necessary in their future work. The students in these two programs have rather vague conceptions of their future professional role. This does not appear to bother them, but is an aspect they are familiar with and take for granted. The *Polish* students' perception of their programme and future professional role is rather mixed. They emphasise the professional status of political science knowledge and competence with a relatively elitist view of their future role in society. However, the educational programme is regarded as "non–professional" and does not enable them to occupy positions that demand advanced skills and knowledge. *German* students see their future professional role as experts who can contribute to solving problems in the community. It is striking that German political science students is the only group who see their future role as an individual vocation rather than as a usual occupation.

5.2.2. Psychology Students' Visions

Students in all four programmes value social generic skills when considering competence that they will need in their future professions, although they to a varying degree find that they develop this competence as a result of participating in their respective programmes.

Disciplinary knowledge ("theory") is of particular concern to psychology students in the *Swedish* and *Norwegian* programmes. *Swedish* students express vagueness about what are the core theoretical perspectives and shift between pluralistic and eclectic perspectives on their knowledge base. They see a need to integrate their basic theoretical knowledge with applied knowledge and experience in their studies and as future psychologists. *Norwegian* students perceive their theoretical knowledge as vital to their professional practice and continuously develop and elaborate their understanding. Polish and German students on the other hand have rather different conceptions. *Polish* students are concerned with theory to the extent they conceive it as useful, applicable ("operative") knowledge. *German* students, however, often find the approach to knowledge in their program too academic.

Swedish and *Norwegian* students, freshmen and seniors, have fairly clear conceptions of their future profession, mainly as clinical or organisational psychologists. These conceptions are developed and elaborated further through the clinical practice periods and training/skills development parts of their program. *Polish* students, however, change their perceptions over the course of their studies. The freshmen emphasise the psychologists' clinical helping role, whereas the senior students see their future role as more managerial in response to societal needs. The *German* psychology students for their part have more difficulties than the other student groups in perceiving their future professional role. The German educational program appears to have deficits and in the current labour market make it more likely that the students will become teachers, rather than the practicing psychologists many of them would probably rather be.

5.3. Some comments on themes across programmes

Analysis of conceptions across the two programmes can be divided into conceptions about the programme of studies and of the future professional role.

As regards the conceptions across programmes, the role of *disciplinary knowledge* has a very different standing among the student groups. Swedish and Norwegian students express few objections to the strong academic/theoretical focus of the *political science* program whereas the Polish students – while they emphasise the status of political science as a disciplinary field – do not find that the program in fact provides the advanced knowledge expected.

Swedish and Norwegian *psychology* students, however, differ in their conceptions of disciplinary knowledge. Swedish students have a vague conception of the disciplinary field and are mostly concerned with the applied aspects of this knowledge – a view mirrored by the Polish students. In comparison the Norwegian students have a clearer conception of the disciplinary knowledge and a positive view of the emphasis on theoretical knowledge because they regard this as a prerequisite for professional practice. The German psychology students however dismiss the disciplinary knowledge as being too academic for their purpose, but Polish students envisage a rather elitist role.

Turning to the students' conceptions of their *future professional role*, Swedish and Norwegian *political science* students have rather vague conceptions. Their studies have few applied components and their role models are far removed from what their work as novices will be like. Polish and German students have a notion of a future expert role.

In comparison of conceptions of the future role, Swedish and Norwegian *psychology* students have fairly clear ideas – ideas that are confirmed and developed during the

course of studies. The conceptions of the Polish students on their hand indicate a noticeable change from the traditional "helping role" of the psychologist to a more managerial role. The conceptions of the German students on their hand appear contradictory; there seems to be dilemmas between the programme they have chosen (teaching psychology), the profession they would prefer (clinical psychology) and the possibilities they will have for either in the present labour market.

5.4. Discursive Construction of Educational Programmes

5.4.1. Political Science

Sweden

The following three discourses among the students in Political Science were identified:

The discourse of balancing subjectivity and objectivity

The discourse in Political science comprises the strong notion of learning about politics and not to be deeply involved in politics. Studies in Political science are a balance between, on the one hand, an open mind towards ideas and impressions and to be engaged in political issues, and on the other hand to have a critical attitude, be objective and to distance oneself.

This is a rather traditional way of thinking about knowledge and learning. The system/teachers have all the answers and "give" them to the students. In this context the staff are the owners of the learning process, they only support the students with their expert knowledge. The intensity of the studies is increasing as well as the experienced relevance and the students' engagement in the studies. The masters' thesis can be seen as a turning point for the students.

Broad entry and vague exit

There seems to be two different reasons for choosing a broad entry by many students of Political science. One is that it is an opportunity to postpone decisions about future studies and work, and another reason is the feeling of being free and not pushed into a track. Students study the subject mostly as part of a Bildung project; they want to understand the surrounding society rather than prepare for a profession (they are carriers of the original idea of liberal arts studies).

Uncertainty regarding role and mandate

The discourse is characterized by uncertainty about what role and mandate a political scientist may have as a professional. As social scientists, they are supposed to be "used" as instruments for the political power but may also work as guides for the common people. It seems as if the students throughout the programme struggle with this opposition. The great variation in possible workplaces for a social scientist together with the lack of role models leaves the students with their uncertainty. At the University the emphasis is more on research–based abilities as methods for analysing politics. The opposition between being a tool for the power and a guide for the people can be understood as the students' way of analysing coming demands from society/work places as professionals.

Norway

The following three discourses are identified among the Norwegian students of Political Science:

The discourse of educating bureaucrats for public management

The public system is the main client, and the political scientist should assist the system through reporting in a neutral way. While most of the freshmen want to work in international organisations, most of the seniors see public administration (especially the ministries) as a likely place for their future jobs. The educational programme does not prepare the students for any particular type of job although some of the students underline the heavy emphasis on the public sphere in the programme.

While political science lacks a clearly defined professional field, the history and the curricular structure emphasis education towards public administration and the question of employability towards public sector is valued as important. Hence, when we compare political science with programmes like sociology and anthropology, the professional aspect becomes visible within political science.

The discourse of learning as independent although within a given text

As a liberal programme, political science rests upon tradition, emphasising a culture of independent studies. The expectation held by the students underlines that whether you will be successful or not, primarily depends on your individual efforts. Implied in the rhetoric of political science being independent is being critical to how political science is to be understood. To some extend the moral order follows the traditional Humboldtian

view of university, stresses the importance of internal motivation for studies, theoretical work, critical thinking and intellectual growth. Paula Ensor (2002) categories two main discourses in graduate liberal programmes; the disciplinary discourse and the credit accumulation discourse. We find her description of the disciplinary discourse helpful in order to clarify the curricular discourse in Political Science in Norway. The disciplinary discourse following Ensor is expressed by academics arguing that education should be an apprenticeship into powerful way of knowing. Mastery of conceptual structures and modes of arguments are emphasised.

Although the moral order in political science rhetorically emphasises academic freedom and intellectual independence, we will argue as Ensor that the pedagogic relations are vertical and certainly the content and evaluation is controlled by the academics.

Another topic that underlines this discourse is what the students' value as important in order to be a good student. The seniors' journey show that you will be awarded if you are well prepared for exams, do the reading and write the assignments. The experiences from exams, assignments and scores impact their identity as students.

The discourse of the primacy of scientific knowledge

Academic knowledge, including general disciplinary knowledge, knowledge about the main theories, knowledge about political systems, structures and how they work, and factual knowledge, is what both freshmen and seniors conceptualise as important knowledge in order to become a professional. Within this framework, analytical competence in political science means to act in a neutral and objective way. To be critical means the ability to view problems from different perspectives and to discuss through pro contra arguments. To take a stand is not valued in the institutional discourse and ethical and moral questions (except within issues of scientific procedures and methods) are not central in the programme.

The "forces" or "powers" that influence most clearly the discourses in the political science programme. In very general terms there seem to be two: the power of the academy and the power of the professional bureaucracy.

Poland

The following five discourses among the students in Political Science were identified:

The discourse of the incompleteness of education

The meaning of 'incompleteness' used for labeling this discursive formation relates to the insufficiency of official curricula for meeting the subjects' expectations towards the adequate preparation to future professional roles.

The logic of this discourse constitutes the logic of inclusion oriented towards the completion of "educational vacuum". Such logic evokes reshaping/recontextualising the learning process and provokes changes in its content. As its material consequence we see displacements within the structure of learning process, resulting in the experience of 'patchwork learning' (with extra–curricular strategies of learning and search for multiple sources of knowledge). Power that constitutes the discourse of education as incomplete seems to be influenced by the liberal construction of the curricula with the simultaneous lack of tradition of liberal education (in its academic sense) in education of political scientists at the University of Gdansk, and by misleading emphasis on professionalism put by the teachers in the programme.

The discourse of elitism

This discourse pertains to elitist attributions ascribed to political scientists as well as to the students in political science. Attributions related to the students' visions of a political science professional involve: omnipotent and elitist social role, high– ranking professional competence, and thorough and objective knowledge. The structure of the discourse is organised through mechanisms of positioning social elites vs. the masses.

The claims for elitist status of political scientists' role, competence, and knowledge – in the light of this discourse – are legitimated by their meta–discursive position (they are seen as situated above the discourse of politics) rather than by merits. This results in the problem of 'simulated profession' that is disclosed by our respondents.

Here the claimed professionalism of the political scientist (including the professional status of knowledge and competence) seems to depend on 'natural' predestination (the logic of gift) rather then on competence–oriented learning process involving a Bildung project.

The powers that run the discourse seem to be generated within the context of academic culture and mediated by teachers. In a broader socio–cultural perspective we could also refer to Polish history of the status of nobles and intelligentsia during the past centuries.

The discourse of 'jamboree academism'

This discourse relates to the institutional culture described in terms of social entertainment and ease of studying/teaching, and reveals its nature when contrasted with the claims to liberal education in the curricula and to the statements on the professional and elitist nature of academic education expressed by the students. The logic of the discourse of 'jamboree academism' neglects traditional academic values of theory, learning effort, self–discipline, and moral responsibility for the work done. Its is driven by 'minimum effort – maximum profits' rationale which reshapes the idea of liberal education from humanistic Bildung project to a 'CV Building Project', often created by strictly practical logic of quick common sense judgment.

The scene of the discursive practices seems to be constructed by two types of interests of its actors, teachers and students. Questioning traditional academic values within the institution appears to resemble 'the culture of apparent work', typical of Polish political reality under the Communist rule. Another possible link could be made to the idea of "leisure class" (Veblen 1998), of which many aspects of the institutional culture at political science in Gdansk strongly resemble.

The Discourse of Vague Future

The topic of that discourse concerns the visions of future regarding job prospects, which reveal senior students' problematic attitude towards the competence acquired in academic education and – as a consequence – chances of getting jobs. Our respondents present such visions from their personal perspective provoked by the question about their plans for the coming years. The logic of elitism breaks down when it encounters the real problem of future employment.

The discourse of professional cynicism (coterie culture)

This discourse pertains to the visions of the work environment as a coterie culture. Such visions, which represent and reflect a broader portrait of the Polish political scene, influence the field of discursive practices that take place within the academia.

The discourse of professional cynicism generates Machiavellian strategies of reaching personal aims related to social domination, which is accompanied by cynical attitudes assumed by its actors. Being involved in the field of that discourse means taking part in

power games. Such a position demands from its players developing skills and strategies that include influencing people, creating personal image, applying strategic ploys, etc

The vision of transition between higher education and work, which is exhibited by that discourse, involves the logic of benefiting from profitable relationships ("social capital" in its narrow sense) established during the period of their studies.

Germany

Regarding the vague job perspective of professional political scientists it is not astonishing that some of the graduates are afraid of entering work life. The pragmatic attitudes towards professional occupations seem to support a tendency to leisure culture and a 'laissez–faire way of living' without political responsibilities in recent years.

The following four discourses are identified among the German students of political sciences:

The discourse of emancipation and persona l maturation (Humanistic Bildung)

Within the discourse of emancipation and personal maturation there is less emphasis on the immediate academic knowledge offered through the programme of studies.

The vision of the transition process from the students' point of view is characterised by individual maturity through humanistic Bildung in the context of political sciences. The students recognise the side effects of their studies and inherent experiences as crucial elements for becoming self–confident, emancipated, and successful in their later career.

The discourse of knowledge–based democratisation

Similar to the discourse above, the central aspect for students is knowledge mediacy as their main task concerning formal as well as informal areas of political sciences. The statements of junior and senior students have demonstrated their historical awareness of the inherent logic of the political programme: That is to say they envisage German and European history as basic elements for professional acting and involvement. Thus, the constructive process of acquiring historical knowledge and contemporary political issues is the basis of their professional identity. Especially senior students have expressed that knowledge mediacy has provided them with a professional identification beyond their formal qualification represented by the academic degree. That discourse also includes students' engagement in international and intercultural relations and they firm belief in taking political responsibility

The vision of transition HE–W means for representative students of this discourse field to become democratic reformers as well in terms of the societal norms and values as concerning their future perspectives by getting involved in international relations.

The discourse of professional mediation with migrant minorities

For some graduates the biographical circumstances – derived from their migrant background – are significant for their high expectations on their own social integration and insofar on their political activities within the political system of Germany. They differ from other respondents regarding the evaluation of their studies. Mostly, they perceive social advancement and furthermore they express high confidence on their ability to play an essential role in their work life. They want to be respected as equal social partners in their new environment and within professional activities. That discourse also includes students' perceptions of being confirmed in the opinion of affirmative advancement by the chance to study political sciences and ideas of becoming useful partners in voluntary services for migrants' integration

It belongs to the essential vision of transition HE–W for this discourse that migrant students distinguish a high aspiration of social advancement. Hence, the societal appreciation of their academic career plays a dominant role in the transition process from HE to work – not only as a consequence of the personal experience of migration but also due to their responsibility in voluntary services for human relations with the migrant population.

The discourse of political career building in regional and European contexts

The professional career and a high standard of living play a dominant role for the motivation to study political sciences. A few students concentrate their efforts on European Policy and international relationships, while others are more locally oriented regarding their political or journalistic career. Astonishingly, the senior students seldom mention the discourse of political career building. Thus, this seems to be a special issue for the younger group.

This is patterned by students' ideas of becoming political experts, they different sources of knowledge and professional ambitions and students, financial motivation.

5.4.1. Psychology

Sweden

The following discourses among the students in Psychology were identified:

The primacy of theory

The topics that are possible to discern in the interviews comprise the relationship between theory and professional practice, the relationship between the professional and the private self and the approach to learning professional knowledge. In structural terms, the ways of describing their relationships is either as separate or integrated. In the discourse that may be labeled the primacy of theory these are seen as separated, dichotomous entities. Hence, psychological theory is viewed as basically separate from clinical practice, the professional self is separate from the private and professional knowledge is rather pluralistic than eclectic, i.e. its task is to accomplish a repertoire of different psychological perspectives for different clinical purposes. This is the way freshmen generally anticipate their coming professional role.

The primacy of practice

The topics in the discourse primacy of practice are identical to those above mentioned but the structure is different. Rather than conceiving of these as separated they are understood as being integrated. This is expressed in the interviews by talking about integrating theory and practice through periods of practicing under supervision; about themselves being the instrument; and taking an eclectic approach to professional knowledge. Such an approach means constructing their own subjective body of knowledge through combining elements from different perspectives and the various contemporary schools of clinical psychology. This is the way seniors generally describe their notions of the professional role. Since this latter discourse is dominating among seniors it may also be understood to constitute a major impact of the education. Hence, the primacy of practice appears to be super ordinate to the discourse of theory.

To sum up, as the "power" or "forces" that influence the discourses there is the program of psychology and its organisation characterised. The students who enter the program are encouraged to identify themselves as professional Psychologists from the very outset. In Sweden as a whole psychology programmes are numerous clausus programmes and it is relatively difficult to be admitted. The professional association of psychologists in Sweden exercises a strong influence over the syllabus of psychology programs, even though this influence is indirect via the state– regulated education of psychotherapists.

The professional education for psychologists may be characterised as heavily influenced by a corporate association. There is also an influence on the labour market and the further training and legitimisation of psychologists from the part of this corporate association. The programme reminds more of the counterparts in medical or nursing education. The rather high costs of educating psychologists have also meant that the number of students admitted has been kept at a low level.

The students of Psychology seem to take place a kind of mandatory socialisation to a certain professional personality. A possible reason for these differences is that the Psychology programme is subject to substantial influence from the professional association

Norway

There were the following four overlapping discourses identified among the students of Psychology:

The discourse of the primacy of theoretical/academic knowledge.

Learning to become a psychologist involves having a strong knowledge base rooted in science and research. As the main reasons given for this are that (particularly) a discipline like psychology needs to be strong in solid scientific knowledge in order to be seen as a professional one and not be disregarded as 'common sense'. The students accept what the disciplinary discourse maintains that this is important for the discipline as well as for the individual professional psychologist to be seen as reliable. The academic "capital" that this knowledge base provides contributes also to legitimating the social status and the power of the profession. As psychology is a relatively "new" discipline and study programme within a traditional university it has been important to be accepted as a science and the model chosen for this seems to have been inherited from natural science and particularly from medicine.

The discourse of "the two worlds".

The discourse is characterised by two different forms of logic: one representing an academic study of the scientific knowledge base and the other representing the "practical wisdom" of the profession at work. The formal teaching by the permanent staff of the department is to a large extent related to the teaching of the theoretical sub disciplines while the more or less "external" teachers to a higher degree represent the practical, professional aspects.

The discourse among the students favours the second of these positions and regrets the lack of integration between the "two worlds".

The dualism between "two worlds" manifests itself also in relation to the professional role, which the programme aims to educate for. The faculty themselves work in positions as researchers and have an interest in educating and recruiting excellent students for this type of work. At the same time the programme has explicit obligations for educating professionals for work as psychologists outside the university.

The discourse of the therapist in service of the individual.

A prevalent discourse of the individual (understand as an emphasis on seeing the individual not merely as patients with pathological diseases, but also as persons struggling with "normal" life problems) is seen in the material. As psychologists they are primarily committed to serve the individuals in society, and this vision is mainly linked to the role of the therapist. This professional model seems to remain relatively unchanged throughout the whole programme. Themes related to aspects of treatment of a patient, a therapist interacting with a patient, occur within and across several of the domains in the interviews. Valuable learning outcomes, knowledge as well as competence are mostly related to the image of this dyadic therapist – client relation. Moral responsibility is strongly associated with elements in the discourse(s) of professional ethics related to the relationship between the psychologist and the client on an individual level. The rhetoric of professional secrecy, the importance of empathy, humbleness, and respecting individuality as well as the rhetoric of being aware of one's own capabilities and limitations as a psychologist, are also mirrored in the students' narratives.

The heavy emphasis on theory and science, links the qualifications of a therapist to the identification of psychology as an academic discipline (see the two first discourses). This seems to harmonise with the rhetoric in the curriculum. The text of psychology is strongly academic and theoretically oriented as well as specifically focusing the individuals' needs.

The academic faculty is aware of how the discourse of "practitioners" are a "threat" to the discourse of the "academics" Despite the power of the academic orientation of the programme, the "forces of practice" and "vocational/practical oriented values" seem to most strongly influence the students' discourses in shaping their images of professional roles.

The discourse of membership in the "selected and privileged" group

The psychology students want to distance themselves from a "discourse of the egocentric student" and strongly emphasis the collective group as important to them. The discourse of peer students taking care of each other is dominating. This reminds the notion of a "community of practice" (Wenger 1998) supporting each other as peer students.

Further, the students see themselves as privileged students with relatively high status as students and future professionals. An important factor contributing to this discourse is the entrance requirements to the professional programme the selection process confirm that they are "theoretically skilled" group.

The students are told that they belong to a kind of academic "elite" (however this 'elitism' is relatively weak). At the same time, some of the students emphasise that their future status as professional psychologists, is relative and relational. They place themselves in a hierarchy between medical doctors and groups like sociologists and pedagogues.

Psychology students are confident that the general/broad education typical of the Norwegian psychology programme opens to a variety of jobs. They possess a unique knowledge and competence needed in order to help individuals with psychological problems. They see themselves as members of an expert group indispensable in a western society.

The "forces" or "powers" that influence most clearly the discourses in the psychology programme. In very general terms there seem to be two: the power of the academy and the power of the professional practice.

Poland

The discourses discerned in the Polish material comprise two, mutually related, major issues: the construction of professionalism, and the construction of identity. The professional discourse works as a "master discourse", providing for a framework within which other themes are grounded and gain their meaning. The students speak of professionalism as problematic; therefore it has been labeled as discourse of "limited professionalism". The other issues addressed here will be: the disappearance of clinical orientation, the role of professional jargon, elitism, and professional identity.

Limited professionalism

This professional discourse comprises the perceived lack of practice and the prevalence of "pure" theory dispersed in the programme. The ways of making theoretical knowledge practically applicable are: through contextualisation into the life– world experience, within scarcely organised field classes, and through self–organised practical work (usually voluntary). Another option is training in commercially organised schools and courses, advertised at the university billboards but not officially linked to the programme.

Theory is opposed to practice here, but the "too little practice" does not necessarily imply "too much theory" This asymmetry in theory/practice relations seems to point to the power of academic tradition that lies behind the programme. It is rooted in the history of training psychologists in Poland. The tolerated presence of the supplementary offer of practical training (courses run by independent companies or individuals) brings about the question of a possible "structural alliance" between the domination of theoretical training (which postpones professional preparation to the stage of graduate apprenticeship and at the same time builds strong reasons for the university not to be directly engaged in a "workshop culture" of practical psychology) and its commercial supplementation. This suggestion will be developed in the concluding chapter of the report (see the notion of "institutional pacts").

To be or not to be a therapist

The initial identification of the professional role of psychologist with clinical work disappears in course of the studies. Both freshmen and seniors started their studies with an imagined professional identity of a clinical psychologist, which – at the end of the studies – seems to be atrophic. Most of them shift their interest to personnel management and education

The resistance to clinical work is, on the one hand, empowering to the students, while on the other it is consistent with the institutionally constructed framework of tracking the students into jobs other than clinical work. Such ambivalence has been identified as characteristic of many acts of educational resistance (Giroux 1983).

Psychological jargon as the marker of professionalism

Students put emphasis on the development of specific communication skills. They stress the importance of the ability to use the "psychological language". This specific form of communication and language is a distinguishing feature of psychological professionalism.

It is more than a mere technical skill, it has a strong scent of identity forming phenomenon

Elitism of psychological profession

Students in psychology (especially freshmen) seem to create distance from laymen. They find themselves as different from others – they place themselves "above" the lay community. They feel that psychological knowledge gives them power over lay people which results in an elitist position.

The ability to use professional jargon gives psychologists the power of understanding the phenomena and the power of labeling them (the "magic" function of language). Descriptions of the ways of perceiving the functions of psychological language seem very coherent. The main force supporting the discourse of 'Psychological jargon' is the professional status of psychology and psychological education (professional programme). The acquisition of fluency in using psychological language is necessary to fulfill the academic staff's requirements (institutional power) and the employers' expectations in the workplaces. Also, the strength of this phenomenon as an identity factor may relate to the troubles with acquiring professional identity in other that linguistic ways.

Personal and professional identity

Professional identification seems to be complex in the light of the shift from clinical to managerial orientations, and of the unclear professional status of graduates who had not been able to gain sufficient practical experience in course of their studies.

Most students are not satisfied with their professional competence, which may be the reason why they accept the perspective of being dependent on mentors and supervisors as novices. They represent an adaptive approach to the job market's requirements because they have to start working as quickly as possible to start living on their own. At the same time they realise that to help people, they need a lot of experience in life.

The combination of uncertainties cutting through the personal and professional levels explains the more than technical role ascribed to the professional jargon: its labeling potential helps to master the vagueness of the world, covers the lack of lived experience, and its exclusiveness helps to create links within the professional community that can help dealing with insecurity.

It is possible to identify institutional conditions that – according to our understanding – shape the discourse of limited professionalism in psychology. Mass enrollment that exceeds the possibility of finding work in clinical practice, treating knowledge as

commodity (an interviewee spoke of a teacher who refused to present more details of a topic saying that 'she would be selling her knowledge too cheap'), and possible personal and economic links between public and private institutions of psychological education may contribute to this phenomenon.

Those powers evoke several strategies that students take up in reaction to them. They are: apotheosis of the role of clinical therapist as a professional model; escaping to the outer world of practical experiences in search for professional experience, and resistance to the stereotype of clinical work as a synonym for psychology.

Germany

The following discourses among the German students in Psychology were identified:

University as a service provider

Higher education is being reduced to a single segment on the path to work life. One has to pass through university. The value of higher education appears to be subordinated to the value of work life. Higher education operates by order of economy and policy. Similarly to other parts of the service sector, university has to serve a certain purpose, for instance competitiveness. The dominating vision could be described as: The university as a service provider should deliver Transition.

The students see the university as a part of the service sector. The students' expectations of practical orientation and their economic attitude towards higher education (learning, knowledge, competence). Discontentment with institutional offers, organisation and personnel/staff. The students think that their studies should qualify them for their specific profession. There is disappointment concerning the academic offer. The expectations of learning are build on school time experiences. At school they learnt the principle 'to learn on demand' (according to the will of the teacher). Politicians and economists support the type of short–time students by financial sanctions punishing long–time students. The ideas of the "performance society" have come to the students mind and entered the academic life.

The demand on personal efficiency control and on more feedback, the idea that the university has to offer more practical jobs and to bridge theory and its applications into work life. Behind these statements appears a more or less economical attitude: With a minimum of efforts to get the best possible outcome. Many students are conscience–stricken, as they fear to be too old for the labour market after completing their studies.

As the "power" or 'forces" the institutional, political, economical, cultural and biological conditions involved in processes of discourse production/distribution/re-construction are described and characterised in separate section. Every form of media and in usual communication distributes these conditions. In the light of public opinion polls, young German children are most afraid of unemployment and poverty. This issue was never stressed in such an extent before.

The relationship between practice and theory – three faces of the practice–term

Among the psychology students there are some different 'channels' concerning the practice discourse. Based upon the question how the students are able to find access to the field of practice, there are three conceptions:

    1) Practice as a part of the programme's offer (without voluntary commitment)

    2) Practice as a matter of additional scientific work (e.g. students assistant job)

    3) Practice as a matter of external jobs (e.g. experiences in teaching)

Approach to practice at the University presents high professional orientation on the one hand – in this sense it places emphasis on practical training. On the other many students say that they miss practical application/offers in their programme.

The programme by practical training understands The Experimental Psychological Training aims at the improvement of scientific competence and constructive mode of learning and the practical courses at school (Schulpraktische Studien).

The disappearing of clinical psychology: From subject and knowledge based to formal conceptions of transitions

The junior students are much more interested in aspects of clinical psychology than the senior students are. The senior students almost did not mentioned clinical psychology within the interviews.

Generally, the students' choices and visions of their later profession are broadly based. The junior students often hint their intentions on becoming a therapist or to be engaged in social affairs. In order to achieve these aims they are convinced that psychological knowledge is necessary to establish the basis for further acting.

Summarising, the students' vision of transition seems to be no longer guided by the subject himself. The university, characterised in economical terms as a service provider, should deliver transition. It is the role of the university mainly to function as a provider

for qualifying certificates. Hence, the vision of transition is shifted from a subject and knowledge based to a formal conception of passage.

5.5. Summing up the discourses – across nations and programmes

Looking across the discourses presented above, the dominant picture is their distinctive heterogeneity. Depending on cultural, structural and material conditions, the programmes in the different countries present rather different types of discourses. Some are related to the purposes, functions and results of the educational programmes, others to the type of knowledge that they favour, others again to the degree of direction or vagueness in the programmes in relation to further jobs and carreers.

Nevertheless there seem to be some themes, sometimes tensions or dilemmas, that can be identified as running through these discourses that capture some common elements without by any means integrating all of them. These are presented below:

5.5.1. The theory – practice dimension.

This theme is recurrent in many of the national and programme discourses. On the one hand theoretical knowledge is seen as constitutive of an academic programme whether it is liberal or professional – something that for instance contributes to distinguishing professional psychology from common sense thinking and practice. On the other hand there is a demand for practical knowledge that can only be acquired through engagement in practical professional work. In between these more extreme positions lies the understanding of theoretical knowledge as disciplinarily organised and delivered or as applied to problems encountered in professional work. The discourses relate to how the instutions of education should position themselves in relation to this dilemma.

This dilemma is most apparant in the discourses related to the programmes of psychology – as discussed below – although it is present in the discourses of political science as well.

In the psychology programmes in Sweden and Norway there is a pragmatic attitute to balancing theory and practice in the curriculum. It is taken for granted that there should be significant elements of each, and the discussions deal with (a) how *much* of each and (b) in which *order* or *degree of intergration*. In Sweden the programme has gone far in the direction of intgrating them in a problem-based curriculum, while the programme in Norway is more divided with theoretical knowledge seen as a necessary prerequisite for benefitting from practical experience. In Germany and Poland, however, one might rather talk about a lack of balance where practice is not (or to a very limited degree) incorporated in the programmes. The programmes are consequently experienced as

inadequate or incomplete. In Poland the students get a formal qualification for clinical and management work but experience they need to complete this with further practical training (mostly offered by private institutions at high cost). In Germany the programme does not provide formal qualifications for 'proper' professional work as pyschologist. Graduates may teach psychology in schools but will need further formal education to be allowed into work as professional psychologists (also at additional cost to the students).

The discourses illustrate four different ways of dealing with this dilemma where there is no final 'correct' solution. However we see it as informative to the continuing discussions and decisions on programme designs to clarify these potential positions.

5.5.2. Learning (processes and outcomes)

There seems to be an *underlying* discourse of ways to conceive of teaching and learning in the discourses presented. One dimension that runs through this may be described as from a constructivist and apprenticeship orientation to a delivery/reception orientation. The first position is illustrated by Swedish psychology students who are expected to 'construct their own body of knowledge' through participation in different academic and professional contexts. Norwegian political science students are expected to undergo an 'apprenticeship into powerful ways of knowing'. German psychology students on the other hand follow their shool time experiences 'to learn on demand according to the will of the teacher'.

Another dimension is this discourse relates to the students' relationship to the knowledge they encounter. In the Scandinavian countries there is a distinct engagement in the disciplinary knowledge with an ideal of a personal – and at the same time critical – relationship to this knowledge. The students' engagement increases during the course of the programmes. In Poland in case of political science students we see a more detached relationship to the knowledge of the programme as something you will have to learn in order to comply with the requirements for the degree (*mastery* in Wenger's terms) but don't have to engage in personally (*appropriation*) and can relate to with 'an easy minimum effort strategy'.

5.5.3. Professional programmes for professional jobs?

It would be reasonable to expect that professional programmes would lead to professional roles and jobs. For liberal programmes on the other hand it might be reasonable to expect that they would not have the same clear-cut direction towards defined jobs in society.

The discourses identified in this project, however, do not support this picture. Some professional programmes (in this case psycholgy) have a clear intention of leading towards a reasonably well defined set of professional roles (in Norway and particularly Sweden) and more or less live up to this intention by providing students with relevant qualification for these. Swedish psychology students seem to take part in 'a mandatory socialisation to a certain professional personality'.

In other programmes of psychology (Germany, Poland) this not the case to the same extent. In these contexts concepts like 'limited professionalism' and 'vagueness of future job opportunities' are characteristic. In Germany the programme has to some extent invited students to potential roles as professional psychologists, an outcome which turns out to be open to only a few at high cost. Others are channeled into teaching in schools, but according to the students' experiences, the programme does not prepare sufficiently for a teaching career either. In Poland the students expect the programme to provide entry to professionsl (and somehow elitist) positions in society. Such positions, however, turn out to be available to only very few of the graduates.

Consequently it is reasonable to conclude that the provision of a 'profesional' programme does not 'guarantee' a professional training towards a reasonabley well defined set of professional roles and jobs. This 'promise' needs to be considered in each and every case and must be seen in relation to programme content and structure as well as to enrollment policies and the situation on the labour market.

Political science – as the project's example of a liberal programme – may illustrate the same point, the other way around. As expected these also lead to uncertain and vague futures in terms of jobs as well as uncertainty concerning professional roles and mandates. On the other hand there seems to be in some of the programmes clear, although tacit, directions of career paths for graduates from such programmes (like in Norway towards the public bureaucracy). These are just as clear-cut (or diffuse) as the comparable directions of programmes declared as 'professional'.

In addition we would like to draw attention to the interplay between macro – meso – micro levels in the example above. The Swedish psychology programme is designed – at the institutional or meso level – to favour an independent and self-regulated student role where the individual student constructs his/her professional knowledge in relation to different sources of knowledge encountered in the programme. This is in line with the theory of the discipline when it comes to ways of understanding knowledge and learning. On the other hand there is a strong macro level influence on the curriculum from professional organisations of practicing psychologist (mediated by state regulated

education of psychoterapists). This appears to result in a programme that aims simultaneously at 'a mandatory socialisation to a certain professional personality' and the somewhat contradictory aim of 'the selfregulated, independent learner'. It may be profitable to explore the interplay between these levels further in future research.

6. Results. Understanding the transition from higher education to work life

The presentation of the results follows a thematic structure in which national findings are summarised.

6.1. Sweden

6.1.1. The content novice worker - experiencing a new time/space order of life

The overall impression is that the novices seem to be satisfied with their work – or rather with their lives as novices. The work tasks for all novices show a considerable variation. The political science novices feel that they are more qualified then their job requires. To a majority of these novices their jobs are relatively uncomplicated, even less demanding than their studies. The psychologists have work tasks, which they were expecting to meet in their coming work life and it seems that their study programme was preparing for these tasks. The novices express that they feel like competent psychologists during their first year at work and they experience also that their colleagues have the same opinion about their competence. If we compare the situation with the political scientists there is a quite different working environment. Many of them feel they are more qualified than their work requires. Several novices point out that a major difference between being a senior student and a professional novice is the fact that being a student is a state that lasts 24 hours a day. As a student you always identify as a student no matter in what circumstances. The novice workers live a life that is more segmented in time between work and leisure. Hence they take on different identities during work and leisure respectively.

6.1.2. Trajectories in terms of identity formation

The political science programme could be claimed to prepare not for a specific professional activity, but for an academic way of being, developing a *homo academicus* as the outcome of the educational programme. When it comes to the question of whether they have an identity as a political scientist it is interesting to notice that they have their strongest experiences of having an identity as a political scie tist when reading political articles in newspapers or when involved in private discussions on political matters. The

95

novices working within the public sector say that they are defined as political scientists through their work tasks. Yet, they have a vague professional identity.

The trajectory into work life for some of the political scientists could be described as becoming positioned as responsible interpreters of legislative texts. Being such an interpreter is a typical trait of political scientists in community, regional and state authorities. Political science as a discipline is basically about power; how power is allocated and what mechanisms and institutions democratic societies develop to make sure that every citizen has a possibility to – directly or indirectly – influence political decisions. The situated identity as an interpreter could also be understood as being squeezed between conflicting interests between the individual and the public sector authorities within the community of work life. Few of the novices conceive of themselves in a position of power in relationship to the political decision making arena. This could reflect either unawareness of the political dimension of the role of the political scientist, or indicate differences in exercising power in different organisations.

As a result of work life experience a new role and situated identity of the political scientist as a negotiator and a mediator is crystallising as the awareness of the responsibility to be the advocate of the individual citizen is increasing. The novices' answers are generally pointing out generic skills, both when asked what kind of knowledge they acquired through their education and what is required in their present work. This also constitutes the answer to the more general question about the knowledge required for being recognised as a good political scientist. The political science programme could be claimed to prepare not for a specific professional activity, but for an academic way of being. This could be interpreted as the classical liberal art heritage. The model is that of the agora as the space and the dialogue as the method for learning, this leads to a vague identity as an independent investigator or civil servant at the end of the programme.

There seems to be a lack of contextualisation, and meta–reflection throughout the educational programme. The programme concerns the study *of politics*, rather than *in politics*, emphasizing academic features of politics rather than encouraging students to acquire a particular political standpoint. This could explain the experience of a *vague exit* from the programme as well as the difficulty to put themselves in a decentred position in relation to their own practice.

The psychology programme could be claimed to prepare for the requirements of clinical work. During the trajectory of the programme, the psychology students compose a kind of professional fellow being, comprising elements both from the private and professional

spheres. The concept comprises the meaning of the helper and the social engineer capable of moderating people's behaviour. The experienced periods of clinical internships have made it necessary to separate the private and the professional. The discourses in work life about the professional role of a psychologist concern the ability of reflection, both on the individual and the collective level. On the individual level, reflection constitutes both a way to synthesise and understand the client's problems and a way of scrutinising the psychologist's own thoughts and feelings. Reflection also stands out as a hallmark of a good psychologist at the collective level. Some statements in the interviews indicate that the ability to contribute valuable reflections to a discussion between the team or between colleagues gives a feeling of being professional. The feeling of being put to test leads to a legitimate participation in the professional community shortly after the entrance into work-life, indicating a close power/knowledge relationship.

There are differences between the two programmes regarding to which degree they feel professionally competent. The psychologists claim they feel competent in various clinical situations, which leads to a strong professional identity. The political scientists are found at the other extreme, they have a broad working field and this makes it complicated to develop professional identity. During their studies they have struggled to find role models and as novices they still have problems to find their professional role and identity.

6.1.3. The trajectory in terms of knowledge formation

For the political scientists the transition can be described as a process of detailing in a transformation from generic academic skills to the requirements for solving authentic work life problems. The transformation requires the capacity to read and write academic texts in combination with the ability to formulate and solve problems. Analytical and communicative skills are the most frequently mentioned abilities. Moreover, it means to be knowledgeable about the political systems and the institutions of democracy. A thorough understanding of the structure and functions of the Swedish civil society is, mentioned as a significant element of professional competence. Finally, a critical attitude is mentioned as desirable, not the least when assessing data gathered for investigative or evaluative purposes.

Among the psychologists two ways of relating to the theoretical body of knowledge are discernible. The *eclectic mode* means that elements of knowledge from different theoretical schools are collated to fit a specific case. The *pluralistic mode* means the access to a repertoire of perspectives from which the professional selects a specific standpoint and subsequent method of intervention to fit clients with a particular kind of problem. The awareness of pluralism, i.e. the existence of competing theoretical schools

of psychology and the application of these in clinical practice stands out as the most important feature of the novices' answers to the questions about what kind of knowledge is acquired through the educational programme.

The generic skills acquired within the programme, besides the substantive knowledge, could be described as the capability of working independently, taking on professional responsibility, to host and manage difficult personal problems of clients without compromising their own psychological welfare. Novice psychologists´ experiences of the relationship between the psychology programme and work life can be described as being closer than expected by them as students. Against the backdrop of the observations above the trajectory from the educational programme to work life may be characterised by *continuity and confirmation* of the knowledge base achieved during the educational process.

6.1.4. Preparing for professional work: ritual or rational way?

The relationships between education and work could also be described in a more abstract way. It is reasonable to assume that all educational programmes include knowledge and skills that are *rational* in character with regard to their relationship to work life, in that they are preparing for a specific field of knowledge or professional field of work, emphasising the utility value of knowledge. It is also reasonable to assume that programmes include knowledge and skills that are rather *ritual* in character, where the connection to a specific context of application is lacking and the most important feature is instead the exchange value of knowledge. The impact of education could be claimed to encompass *substantive skills* that are content specific and contextually situated. On the other hand the impact of education may also comprise *generic skills*, which are transferable between different contexts. Such skills may likewise be acquired in various contexts and developed through different contents.

For the political scientists the relationship between higher education and work life could be described as rational, emphasising generic skills. The content of the studies appears as relevant to the presumptive area of professional work for the graduates. Typically, the generic knowledge needs to be transformed and contextualised in order to be applicable in the individual case. Knowledge and skills of ritual character seem to play a minor role in the educational programme.

In the case of the psychologists, the relationship between higher education and work life appears differently. A similarity is that the content of the programme is mainly rational, but the emphasis is high on generic skills, e.g. the capability of communicating and interacting with clients. In addition there is a high emphasis on substantive knowledge as

well. The substantive knowledge here refers to the competing schools of knowledge within psychology and the meaning of their key concepts.

6.2. Norway

The following themes describe the transition from studies to work and the professional identity formation of the Norwegian seniors/novices.

6.2.1. A coherent journey?

When comparing the data from the seniors and novices it seems as if there are no fundamental changes in the informants' views about learning, knowledge, competence and moral and societal responsibility from the time they were interviewed as senior students to the time of the interviews with them as novice workers.

In *political science* the novices share an understanding of the profession as open and not well defined. This is what traditionally characterises a liberal programme in contrast to a professional programme. Writing a thesis is viewed as an in–depth learning process among the seniors who underscore the importance of the reconstruction of knowledge. Even for the novices the thesis is an important hallmark in order to describe their competence and their professional identity. The aim is not to produce specific skills and competences; rather the purpose is to offer a general academic "bildung".

Academic content knowledge, including general disciplinary knowledge, knowledge about the main theories, knowledge about political systems, structures and how they work, and factual knowledge and analytical knowledge, is what the informants as seniors as well as novices conceptualise as important knowledge in order to become a professional. For the seniors professional competence includes theoretical/conceptual competence and analytical competence. Analytical competence is explained as the ability to look at a case from different angles and viewpoints. For the novices there are no critical moments that change this perspective, although the focus on generic skills ha s become more articulated.

Like the seniors, the novices do not support a conception of the political scientist, as a person with a greater moral or ethical responsibility than common morality requires of everyone. They argue that this moral requirement is equal for all persons. However, both groups also underline the importance of societal responsibility and of being "diplomatic and neutral" in order to handle ethical dilemmas in a professional way. Having gained the unique knowledge of political science and having learned the analytical method in order to rationally analyse social and political structures and systems, implies taking a societal

responsibility. This responsibility is based on their knowledge as academics and on an academic attitude.

In *psychology* the senior students as well as novice psychologists express an understanding of knowledge and competence, with emphasis on the client or the individual patient. The integration of theoretical comprehensive knowledge, which is linked to the academic discipline, and knowledge about human relations and therapeutic work make up the core of professional competence. It seems as throughout the journey most of the informants give a very positive picture of the time they were students. This positive memory relates strongly to the students' experiences in the practical part of the study. It also seems that for the psychologist the meaning of professional responsibility has become more real and challenging as they move into professional work.

Most of the informants in both interviews emphasise the moral aspects of the profession. Both as seniors and novices they express tensions between what they see as the right moral code of the profession and what they experience as the unacceptable moral practice of some professional practitioners in the society. They consequently may experience some uncertainty about their own moral values and whether these are too idealistic.

To sum up, none of the groups seem to change their perspectives fundamentally in the transition from senior students to novice workers. They are mostly positive to their new positions in work life and the preparation for it that they have got through their study programmes and many of them show an increased self– confidence. Hence, expectations as seniors seem to be adequate in relation to what they experience as novices. Neither of the two groups describes a noteworthy 'practice shock'.

6.2.2. Professional identity – what does it mean?

The influence of the educational programme on the novices' professional identity seems to differ between the programmes. The novices in psychology to a greater extent than the other groups seem to define themselves as part of a professional community. They become psychologists through participating within a relatively defined and exclusive educational programme. The professional identity also appears to gain strength in the encounter with other professional groups (for instance teachers, social workers, medical doctors).

On the other extreme we can place the political scientists who as seniors articulate that the social role of the profession is highly linked to having a higher university degree within the broad category of social science. They see themselves as being graduates.

Interestingly, however, as novices it seems that the development of a professional identity as a political scientist can be understood as a need to define yourself in contrast to other groups such as economists and lawyers. You need a label in order to show your environment that you are not.

In order to analyse the transition between education and work and the development of professional identity we need a broad analytical approach that links the life stories of individuals to socio-cultural structures and institutional regulations. The differences between the programmes are not established by coincidence nor can some "natural development process" explain them.

The process seems to be one of interaction between the attraction and selection of individuals to the different programmes, the structures and processes offered in each programme, the different contexts where they start working and the way that each individual – with their individual life stories – adjust to and adapt the programmes offered and their communities of practice.

6.2.3. The content novice worker

A general outcome from the interviews with the novices – across programmes – is that they express very positive feelings about having got a job and started working (in Norway the great majority of the senior students are actually employed in 'jobs relevant to their educational background' one year after graduation). This positive evaluation of their situation in work life seems primarily to be a feeling of *relief*. Three aspects seem to be combined in this feeling:

- The relief from a situation as a student where there was a never–ending feeling of 'bad conscience' for not studying enough – or even more.

- The experience of a better situation economically.

- The experience that they can actually cope with the work they are asked to do, that they have a competence that 'works' and that is wanted.

6.2.4. Are all programmes "professional"?

Psychology was selected as a clear–cut professional programme. It aims at a professional role within a relatively well–defined area of occupation, where the majority of jobs are related to clinical work within the health sector (broadly speaking). The programme leads to authorisation as a psychologist, which is a title protected by law, and there is a strong professional association of psychologist, which it is important to belong to. The

programme leading to this qualification is, however, quite academic and theoretical. In this aspect we might consider the programme of psychology to some extent as a liberal programme in the sense of stimulating personal 'bildung'. Being exposed to the application of this knowledge and the practical wisdom of the practice of psychology – including the social and ethical competence of dealing with people (clients and colleagues) – is a strong part in the last half of the programme, which may be seen as more oriented towards preparation for a professional role. This training is staged partly in supervised practice periods outside the university, partly by including practitioners from 'outside' as part time teachers in courses at the university. The work on the thesis – which is also a part of the last half of the programme – may be seen as a way of keeping the 'scientific' part of the image of the psychologist alive and strong.

Political science was selected as a clear–cut liberal programme with the dominant role of academic/theoretical knowledge". It is explicitly scientific in character, aiming for analytic competence based on theory but does not present itself as solution-oriented. Disciplinary knowledge of theories, systems and structures in society are central in the content of the programme. The programme is explicitly not meant as training for politicians. An attitude of neutrality and objectivity is encouraged rather than taking a stand in relation to current political issues. The thesis is seen as an important part of the programme and is considered by the students as a piece of research of crucial importance for their qualification as political scientists. Nevertheless, this programme may also be seen as a professional programme for training personnel for the public bureaucracy. It might be possible to say that the political science discourse presents the programme as a liberal one but that it still has a *tacit* but distinct professional aim of educating professionally trained *critical analysts* for a number of different positions in society where an understanding of societal systems, structures and processes is relevant – and necessary.

6.2.5. The novice as apprentice or competent practitioner

The novices coming from the *psychology* programme are expected to walk more or less directly into their jobs and start practicing as competent practitioners. A candidate from this programme is expected to be able to perform competently in a professional role. Many of these novices become quite self–confident and assertive during their first year at work. As newcomers they relate to the local discourse and produce their own meanings of it when forming a negotiated role for themselves in their new context.

For the *political science* novices the discourse of their role at work is somewhat different. The main discourse – as the novices perceive it – puts the novice more in the traditional role of an *apprentice*. They are expected to learn to deal with new tasks with experience

and by watching models in a 'legitimate peripheral position'. The work environment doesn't have sufficient knowledge about their competencies and see them as trainees who will have to prove themselves competent for the new tasks. We may picture this group of people as being in a position of 'postponed' or 'latent' professionalism where their real professional competence is provisionally 'put within brackets'. In the meantime they exercise it more in private when watching the news or reading the papers or when discussing with friends with a political science background. They rely on other "communities of practice" to maintain or support their identity as well–qualifies intellectuals.

The discourses of the role of the novice at work present themselves differently depending on to the type of programme they graduate from: a professional or a liberal one. However, it may also be seen as a consequence of coming to 'your own people' compared to 'being among strangers'. Psychologists go to work in environments where their educational background and competence is better known to – and trusted – by a larger proportion of their colleagues. The competence of the Political scientist is not as well known in their work contexts and consequently not as trusted, although it might be just a relevant and useful if put to work with proper tasks.

6.2.6. The discourse of professional responsibility

Our main finding is that there are no evident and fundamental changes in the way the seniors and novices talk about their responsibilities. Despite the fact that we find no *obvious* changes in this respect, we notice that some personal values are challenged when facing the complexity of some real work life situations.

Although there are no significant changes from senior to novice *within* each programme there are some differences *between* programmes when it comes to the notions of professional responsibility found in the discourses.

The discourse on *psychology* clearly is one where the 'mission' of the psychologist is considered to empower *individuals* to cope with their life in better ways and realise their potentials. The chief client is the individual patient and the professional responsibility of the psychologist is towards this person. The typical role of the professional is cast in the form of the clinical psychologist. The *societal* responsibility is however vague and concerns – when articulated – an obligation to inform and make their knowledge available in favor of a (more) humane society.

The discourse on *political science* is more related to the *ideal* responsibility of the professional and it pictures the professional as a neutral, intellectual watchdog in society

who should use his/her competence in the interest of society. Their chief client consequently is society as well as the general public (rather than the individual citizen) but their responsibility is to both sides (individual – society). Ethically they should be seen as trustworthy and neutral.

Differences between the discourses described above consequently seem to be more related to differences in types of practice and the professional tasks that practitioners in the different professions are engaged in.

6.2.7. The institutional 'pact' between higher education and external stakeholders

These two programmes are linked to some important external stakeholders. This relationship can be analysed as an "institutional pact" that plays an important role in order to understand the profile of the programme, its stability and how changes in the wider society or reforms in the higher education sector disturb this pact and creates a need for negotiations.

In the case of the *political science* programme the alliance between higher education and public bureaucracy could be investigated. For *psychology* it is an "invisible agreement" between the educational institution and the professional field. The essential element in this pact is the agreement about how to regulate the profession through education and certification.

6.2.8. A national identity?

In a situation where the EU promotes mobility it is noteworthy that whereas freshmen political students had vague visions of future international postings, senior students and novice workers expressed little interest in professional engagements outside of Norway. Their professional identity seemed to be constructed in relation to the national context and did not include aspects that might prepare them for mobility in an international community. The Bologna process with its emphasis on internationalization, however, has had substantial influence on higher education in Norway in recent years. The national focus may therefore be weakened considerably in the years to come.

6.3. Poland

The following themes describe the transition from studies to work and the professional identity formation of the Polish seniors/novices.

6.3.1. Trajectories of transition: Pilgrims and Nomads[2]

Polish students travel towards the world of work in different modes. It seems that the differentiating factor here is whether they are in professional or liberal programmes. Clinical psychologists, whose education is perceived as lacking practice (cf. discourse of limited professionalism) construe themselves in their way to work as pilgrims. They are aware of their limited competence and are ready to take the role of apprentices in professional worlds. They know they will reach full competence after many years of supervised practice. Their notion of time is linear, marked with progress in gaining professional competence, but their present condition is marked with overwhelming fear of responsibility. Some of them do not dare to take up clinical practice and engage in other fields of work instead.

Those graduates who took other specialisations (and they are in majority) have more diversified paths of transition to work. For them, more clearly than for clinical psychologists, work is a source of satisfaction. They usually feel competent, or even superior to other professionals working in their respective institutions. An example of this can be found in cases of work in public schools. Graduates from Germany speak in this situation of „learning new identities", they perceive themselves as being „on the way to become professional pedagogues". In contrast, those from Poland who entered work in schools see themselves as better equipped theoretically and more competent than other members of their communities of practice. This attitude related to the very strong role psychological (theoretical) knowledge plays in the construction of professional identities of psychologists in Poland, and how it relates to the "missionary" approach to the professional role.

Another difference we may notice between Polish graduates of psychology and their colleagues from other countries is that the former do not speak of support from the members of professional communities they enter. Their „pilgrimage" is mostly a lonely experience. This feature may have to do either with a tense labour market in Poland (a newcomer may often be perceived as threat to older members of staff), or with specific

---

[2] The categories of „pilgrims" and „nomads" are borrowed from Zygmunt Bauman's numerous texts on postmodern ethics.

work cultures in the institutions they enter. Another explanation may refer to a clearly elitist attitude that students in ps chology develop at the University of Gdansk (they enter the programme with a conviction that they gain a kind of „secret knowledge" and present distance to laymen). Such an attitude may impair their ability to become integrated members of communities of work, for instance in schools.

Still, both groups (clinical and non-clinical psychologists) have a very clear notion of professional identity. They have deeply internalised the notion of „being psychologists". This role enters the domain of the self. Even those who work in non-psychological environments (e.g. one of our respondents is a bar tender) speak of themselves as psychologists and see themselves as those whose role is to help other people – even if they do it aside their work duties.

Political science graduates seem to adopt a vision of themselves as *nomads* in the world of work. They miss their academic years and feel that their best times are over. When they speak of their studies, they seem to remember themselves as professionals being able to critically interpret the world of politics during university seminars. In this respect they resemble the Swedish graduates who "feel professional" when they read papers and comment political issues. The world of work lacks order and predictability, and they do not see a clear path to a conceivable future before them. They concentrate on a „here and now" dimension taking up jobs they can get that do not construe a clear pattern of career. This is largely due to the fact that the job market in Poland does not foresee a role of „political scientist"; the institutions that could be a working environment for them and that were referred to as their future employers in the years of studies (like the media or local governments) are not interested in them. The positions that would require their competence are occupied. A striking difference between the Polish sample and the other ones we analysed in the project is that the former one lacks an international perspective in thinking of professional employment opportunities. Other political science graduates speak of local, national and international settings of their possible activities. The „nomadic future" of Polish political science graduates is therefore somehow restricted to the homeland territory. In this respect they are also different from ICT engineers from Poland, who see the whole planet as a possible territory of their work. Their narratives of identity are, then, broken. „Being a political scientist" relates to the time of studies, and the time after graduation is perceived in terms of provisionality, and their experiments with new identities and forms and employment provide for a prolonged moratorium.

However, there is some consistency within this group of graduates that may reveal a „hidden curriculum" of their academic preparation. Most of them (6 out of 10) work as salespersons. Their somehow cynical approach to academic values (cf discourse of

„jamboree academism") made them base their education on general knowledge of current affairs combined with extensive use of social and rhetoric skills. Thus they gained good competence to work on service markets.

The employment in services does not affect at all the previous idealistic conception of the role of political scientist („politologyst"). The latter is not being challenged by, or confronted with the reality of work, and maintains its idealistic function in identity construction. They still feel political scientists, but locate their identity in the past, associating it with vigorous debates at the university.

They experience the transition from studies to work also in terms of changing organisation of time ("no more free days in the week"), maturity ("confrontation with hard reality"), changing social life (new personal contacts), and changing the way of thinking (realism and pragmatism instead of irresponsible idealism). Speaking of their work, they do not use reference to "professionalism" at all – except for one person who works for local administration, where his knowledge of European Union structural funds is useful. Instead, they identify their position in companies in terms of loyalty vs. independence from superiors – with stress on the first of these two possibilities.

Those two cultures (psychologists and political scientists) are clearly different from the one we identified in ICT engineers, who feel that their employment possibilities have no geographical borders, but they are rapidly growing old: their professional competence was at its peak while they were still at the university. They fear the future, feeling the breath of their younger colleagues on their backs.

6.3.2. Are all sampled programmes professional?

This question has been formed in relation to the Norwegian material. In the Polish one, it keeps its relevance. Paradoxically, traditional composition and loose atmosphere of the political science programme fits very well the demands of market economy. Students are trained in social and generic skills, especially in managing social interactions. They learn how to position themselves in the institution and how to use their assets to their gains. As discussion of current affairs is a frequent educational experience, they learn to be skilled in using different rhetoric tools in argumentation. They also learn how to operate with "broad and superficial" scope of knowledge (their studies were not demanding in this respect) without making impression of being ignorant. Learned eloquence and communicative skills make them perfect candidates for employment in trade and commerce.

This phenomenon seems to be part of a larger problem we identified as institutional pacts between HE and professional corporations. Academic capitalism builds restrictions in the distribution of professional, research-based knowledge. On the other hand, tough competition on the job market and the post-industrial character of economy privilege skills over knowledge in students' perception of their preparation for the job markets. In consequence, it is possible to consider liberal programmes as a kind of vocational education for the service sector of the economy. Such vocational orientation towards the service sector is overtly adopted in non-clinical specializations of psychological studies. The notion of professional responsibility in the programme of clinical psychology, with its often paralysing effect on the students' feeling of competence, may be considered in this context as a „discursive switch" making most of the candidates divert from clinical to service-oriented specialisations.

6.4. Germany

The start into professional life shows different faces among the novices of the selected study programmes. Generally, all of them are challenged with the limited availability of attractive jobs. Particularly with regard to these circumstances the students of liberal programmes have to handle for the most part with rather unspecified job-opportunities. In this context both the job perspectives and the material/structural conditions impact on the learning strategies of students. In other words: the two groups have developed different educational approaches since knowledge is ascribed to unequal functions:

- Psychologists refer to empiric knowledge in order to explain processes of human intra- and interaction.

- Political scientists favour academic knowledge in order to understand and reflect the world.

The following themes describe the transition from studies to work and the professional identity formation of the German seniors/novices.

6.4.1. Novice workers between professional identity and opportunity

Political Science - The majority is not satisfied with their job situation. Since attractive alternatives are missing many novices are employed in part-time jobs or in non-relevant arrangements. The transition from HE to WL seems to be not proceeded yet as the two outstanding study motifs are transferred to only to little extent. The main idea can be described:

On the macro-level as

    -To understand and reflect the world and its policies *(worldview)*

On the micro-level as

    -To share knowledge in order to support democratic values and to mediate in conflicts

While the freshmen students particularly stress the global aspects of political science, the senior students often "reduce" their idealistic commitment and deal with another part of reality (on local or regional levels). The occasions to work according to those aims or to become engaged in large social projects are lowly perceived. The novices are often employed in jobs they are overqualified for and/or intellectually unchallenged. In respect of such discrepancy and of missing opportunities some novices expressed sarcasm and disappointment (see "B"). Otherwise, novices with a migrant background view their academic degree in the light of social enhancement and use it for ambitious work arrangements that targets at better integration of migrants.

Psychology -The most outstanding conclusion for this group can be pointed on a *circular motion* due to the re-evaluation process concerning their professional identity. The novice workers originally headed - as freshmen students – for psychology as a therapeutically vocation. But from the middle to the end of their studies they changed their professional motivation since they acquired a taste for the teaching opportunity. This adoption process is mainly based on two discursive aspects:

The senior students learn to focus their study activities on scientific issues while the opportunity to get clinical knowledge was only small. This is why most of the lecturers in the programme follow a strong empirical understanding of knowledge.

The teaching profession in the public sector promises financial and professional security.

The security aspects have the strongest influence on student's decision-making because the access to a scientific career is limited and employments in research institutes are only temporary appointments. Instead of changing the study programme or selecting additional offers in clinical education the students transformed their interests. The question whether the novices are content with their vocational choice from a long-time perspective cannot be answered at present. But surprisingly, the social commitment a teacher can attain by educating young people is viewed as the most important factor for professional satisfaction and identification. Accordingly, after the first year of work experiences the self-concepts seem to be changed once again. In other words: The

psychologists see themselves much more than only teachers. When emphasizing this social function *(helping other people)* obviously they return to their strong psychological motivation they formerly signalised at the first year of studies. Strikingly, this development can be seen as a result of personal justification. Since they perceive their professional choice still as a compromise they conduct a kind of cognitive substitution. This new vision could help them to achieve a balance between identity and opportunity. Finally, they want to see themselves as better qualified than a teacher.

6.4.2. Novice workers between professional identity and disappointment

Political Science - The negotiation of professional identity and disappointment is most striking among the political scientists. When they enter the job-market they are either at advanced age or they compete with a large number of social scientists and novices from other programmes, such as economics and law. They also compete with pedagogues in the field of adult education. Since the political conditions do not forward the employment of political scientists in the public sector the novices can hardly constitute a professional identity based on real work life experiences. One of the most favoured work arrangements is an employment at a research institute -but these opportunities are very rare. Those novices who were able to connect their wide theoretical knowledge with both "applicable" personal competence and relevant work experience seem to be better prepared to cope with the initial disappointment in the beginning.

Psychology - As already described above (see "A") many novice workers choose the teaching profession because of the supposed social and financial advantages. However, a few of them mentioned to prepare a PhD-project in order to have another option in case they become unhappy with being a teacher. There is evidence that some of the psychologists who started to work as teachers cast doubt on their previous decision.

6.4.3. Novice workers between professional identity and individual niches

Political Science -As mentioned before novices with a migrant background have fewer problems to master the transition between HE and WL. This positive situation is mainly based on two assumptions:

Compared to other students they can revert to more practical work experiences as they had to finance most of their studies by themselves (social background).

They connect their education with their personal background to a greater extent than other students and identify themselves with a concrete academic role in society.

The work motivation of students with a migrant background is mostly associated with to special life experiences. Moreover, they believe to be able to precede intercultural mediation. Thus, they see themselves in a kind of expert role, which causes a stronger identification with the new professional and social role.

Psychology - A few senior students changed to the liberal pedagogy programme in order to enjoy more freedom of action. In these cases the students are already involved in individual work projects or in research. As pedagogues they are viewed not so sceptical from the non-academic society: psychologists are considered to be headshrinkers, pedagogues to be teachers.

6.5. Constructing professional identity

This section describes the process of professional identity construction in three phases, reflecting the initial imaginary constructions of freshmen starting their journey towards professionalism („projected identity"), the changes they undergo in course of academic education under the influence of learning experiences („educated identity"), and, finally, the outcomes of the confrontation between the former two constructions and the experience of work („confronted identity"). The layout follows the experiences within the *programmes* (political science and psychology) rather than countries. This is due to the implied cohesion within professions – despite national differences, the fields of academic cultures and professions seem to be important factors in determining professional identities.

6.5.1. Political science

'Projected' identity

Students of this programme in all four countries perceive political sciences in terms of reflexive attitude towards social and political issues rather than as a possible source of clearly defined profession. In Sweden, Norway and Germany occur strong emphasis on the role of personal Bildung projects in the process of constructing students' identities. In Sweden, Poland and Germany political science as a discipline is conceived of as moulding a particular attitude towards political and social phenomena rather than providing for a certain professional identity. The Polish group seems to mostly conceive of political science as instrumental in preparing for a future career. But most students do not have any clear notions about their future professional roles despite they are aware of the borders of the professional territory, which is the public space on the local, national, or international levels as well as the civic society and its institutions.

'Educated' identity

The official study programmes in Political Science are academically oriented, which means that the official curriculum does not imply any particular type of work or specific kind of professional competencies. This basically non–professional character of official national curricula sometimes produces the hidden conviction that the true idea of professionalism needs to be determined by the subject in the future.

The three general elements of a political science discourse that have potential influence on reshaping students' identities were discerned:

The balance between the subjective and the objective. The 'open' nature of political science as representing a broad entry in the educational system may imply a hesitation to take any definite decisions about plans for the future.

The uncertainty regarding the role and mandate of political scientists: to populate the power structures in society or to educate people about the political system and to act as watchdogs for democracy? (The Nordic case).

The university education in many cases predestines students to act within 'another reality', that is in the academic field. Academic teachers are regarded as role models.

'Confronted' identity

Studies in Political Science appear in all universities involved not to prepare for a specific professional activity or career, but rather for an 'academic way of being'. The prospect of studies in Political Science is the development of a *homo academicus.* However, in case of University of Gdansk, academic values are re-defined towards a more leisure mode of learning through free-floating debates rather than acquisition of sound theoretical knowledge.

When entering the professional field, which not necessarily means the professional territory of political science, the graduates seem to construct their professional identity anew in relation to their actual occupation. A very important feature is identification with the profession, which is kept only in cases of subjects working in the public sector. The private sector, as not belonging to the domain of political science, disrupts identification with the profession. Possibly, their professional identity and previously established vision of the profession do not form any kind of continuity. Hence, the professional identity in case of political scientists is split into various stands of smaller identities (teacher, advisor, politician, salesperson). Some novices who experience the contrast between

their spontaneous concept of professionalism and their present occupation tasks feel overqualified, especially those who work within the private sector.

6.5.2. Psychology

'Projected' identity

Construction of professional identity is explicitly based on preconceptions, common understanding of 'what a psychologist is', and admiring of the social role of the psychologist (especially clinical therapist). Main motivation is oriented towards the social interest and visions of high social status of psychologists.

The sources for projected identities of all freshmen are mainly based on relatively coherent preconceptions created by media, family and friends as well as previous education in upper secondary school. They seem to believe at this stage, that theory can and must be learnt, but qualities like empathy is something 'you just have – or not ' like a 'personal trait' – however it must be trained in practical situations.

Conception of identity as a psychologist continues through the process of university education. It develops throughout the process of formal education and in (possible) interactions with the professional community (which is, like in Norway, also part of the programme).

The freshmen' identity in relation to professional field and programme is characterised by using the metaphor of *knowledge seeker* (N, S, D, PL). Freshmen see themselves as students who come to the discipline of psychology to seek knowledge and competence in order to become professional practitioners in a role characterised as an intellectual counsellor or supporter for people in their development as well functioning human beings.

'Educated' identity'

Educated' identity is presented in the feelings of students that they are members of the professional elite. The university creates the ideal of 'the elite of professionals' while – especially in Poland and Germany – it fails to fully prepare the graduates as professionals.

In Polish and German samples 'educated' identity is constructed in contrast to the commonly expressed visions (e.g.: *indispensable professionals*) widely expressed by freshmen. In the light of growing professional knowledge and critical assessment of their own professional competence, seniors clearly see how far they are, and how much work

is necessary to do for 'being psychologist'. They realise the unlimited and heavy–to–obtain range of competence required to construct a professional Self in the domain of therapy, previously a taken-for-granted field of work. Thus many of them choose 'lighter' versions of professional identity. They see themselves as prospective teachers, managers, etc.

Swedes and Norwegians construe their 'educated' identities through the process of adaptation to institutionally presented picture of profession and the professional. They agree with this and rather do not hesitate about its meaning.

The seniors' identity in relation to professional field and programme is characterised by using the metaphor of Adaptant (N, S) or Practical training seeker (PL, D). The seniors (S, N) have, through their studies, adapted themselves to the programme as it has been presented to them, to the language of the discipline and the profession, and to the professional role they experience in different parts of the programme. Most of them are, towards the end of the programme, ready to go for practical work.

The seniors in PL, D realise that their study would be futile without vocational training organised by them outside the university programme. They are oriented towards practical training and education in their places of job – or they are looking for 'alternative' workplaces (like schools).

'Confronted' identity

The experience of work heavily depends on the construction of professional programmes at the university, especially on the role and ways of integrating practical training. In this respect, the major division can be made between Polish and German novices on the one hand, and Swedish and Norwegian ones on the other.

With respect to the first group (PL, D), providing with professional skills is not exactly within the interest of the university. What makes you a professional psychologist is foremost experience gained in course of work, and academic education is an indispensable, yet insufficient condition to gain such experience. The university concentrates mostly on the scope and organisation of knowledge (in terms of theory), leaving the domain of skills to other sites of learning. This idea seems to be shared in all four universities to some degree, but it stands as a dominant feature of psychological programmes in Gdansk and Duisburg. As we have suggested before, such a construction of the programme seems to relate to "institutional pacts" between the academia and professional associations that control the market of psychological services. It results from an idea of fairly open access to psychological *education*, which means that restrictions

114

are put on the access to *professional practice.* The lack of practical training within the university serves the need of controlling the supply of services, and – in terms of identity construction – contributes to the phenomenon of changing orientation from clinical to managerial psychology or teaching.

Polish and German novices starting, as professionals cannot rely on the help of other people in their workplaces, they are mostly alone. Novices feel like interns who are not sure about their 'tomorrow', easy to be hired on permanent contracts or fired (mostly in Poland).

In contrast, Swedish and Norwegian novices feel well prepared for their professional roles and they feel they have possessed the skills needed in work. Other members of their community further support their start of professional career. They have access to regular counselling and guidance during their first year of work, they therefore feel as a being welcome members of professional communities. This difference relies both on the importance of practical training within the academic programmes, and on the *selection processes* that limit the number of graduates entering the professional field (in Sweden at the stage of entrance into the university, in Norway in course of the studies). This also seems to be a matter of "institutional pacts" between universities and professional corporations, however differently construed from those in the other two countries.

Novice psychologist loves his/her state of being employed (working) and will efficiently tackle with all the troubles in a place of work (and it does not matter what conditions of this work will be created by the employer). This could bee seen as a liaison between the personal self and the professional self – psychologists deeply internalise their profession into the conceptions of themselves as persons. Only the Swedish novices clearly express awareness about the importance of distinguishing between the personal self and the professional self, both in terms of ethical concerns and in providing for a sphere of privacy. Perhaps this difference can be explained by a the construction of academic programme – strong integration of practical work with learning theories probably makes this group of students „feel professional" sooner than in other countries, which means that by the time of completion of studies they may be better aware of the risk of sinking „private selves" into the professional roles.

The common feature of all groups is that they are strongly motivated to be psychologists. The novices' identity in relation to professional field and programme can be characterised by using the metaphors of Expert (N, S) or Intern (PL, D). The novices experience themselves as practitioners who are competent (N, S) or ready to be trained in their workplaces. They are fully capable of taking on professional responsibility in their

different roles in work life (N, S) or they are open to taking it on after additional courses, internship or in-service training (mostly PL, also D).

6.6. Strategies of transition

This section summarises the previously described results in form of a table in which the process of transition between education and work in both programmes and all four countries described in the final report can be made more visible. The phenomena described in the table should be read as resulting from complex processes of learning taking into account initial preconceptions of professions, their changes effecting from the process of studies, and their further confrontation with work experiences. The emphasis is on the transition from education to work, which means that the column called "university education" must inevitably simplify the process of passing through the academic experience.

Political Science		
	University education	**Work life**
Sweden	● From watchdog of democracy and to investigator's/evaluator´s identity ● The master thesis is an important hallmark in describing competence and professional ● identity ● Bildung project	● Vague professional identity ● Identity of a political scientist when reading political article in newspapers or when involved in private discussions on political matters ● Being defined as political scientists through work tasks - becoming positioned as responsible interpreters of legislative texts ● Squeezed between conflicting interests of individuals and the public sector ● Ritual, rational generic trajectory
Norway	● A degree in social science as a matter of security ● Awareness of the lack of a particular professional field ● Getting neutrality which is linked to being critical ● Bildung project ● The master thesis is an important hallmark in describing competence and professional identity	● The importance of societal responsibility and of being "diplomatic and neutral" ● Being put in the traditional role of an *apprentice* ● Being in a position of 'postponed' or 'latent' professionalism ● Feeling overqualified in the workplace context
Poland	● Vision of elitist role based on professional knowledge and moral competence ● Avoidance of social and political engagement, distance from politicians and the masses ● Participation in "fake" academism - studies seen as effortless and easy ● Concentration on media and common-sense knowledge, underplaying the r ole of sound theoretical knowledge is neglected	● Nomadic identity ● Provisional engagement in accessible jobs with no clear path of development ● Loyalty to the employer rather than professional independence, conforming external rules ● Making use of social and generic skills as the basis for career ● Feeling overqualified
Germany	● Having an obligation to preserve the values of a democratic society, ● acting as an intermediator between different parts in society ● Stressing the global aspects of political science ● Strong emphasis on the broad analytical competence as the hallmark of professional competence ● Emancipation processes - inmmigrant background ● Bildung project	● Work commitment on local or regional levels ● Feeling overqualified - being employed in intellectually unchallenging jobs ● Expressing sarcasm and disappointment

Psychology		
	University education	**Work life**
Sweden	• The importance of social generic skills (empathic abilities) • Identification with the professional role rather than with the field of knowledge	• Ability of reflection, both on the individual and the collective level • Feeling competent in various clinical situations • The *eclectic* or *pluralistic* approach to know ledge • Rational, substantive trajectory
Norway	• Pragmatic attitude and preference to be active participants in the programme rather than critical about it • As seniors - distancing from a "discourse of the egocentric student"	• Membership in a "selected and privileged" group • Emphasis on the collective dimension of work, appreciating working in professional community • A content novice worker • Feeling as a ccompetent practitioner
Poland	• Importance of professional jargon as identity marker • Emphasis on the development of communication skills • Apotheosis of the role of clinical therapist as a professional model • Escape to the outer world of practical experiences in search for professional training • Resistance to the stereotype of clinical work as a synonym for psychology, and thus to one's "immature" preconceptions of professionalism (seniors)	• Disappearance of clinical orientation - resistance to becoming therapists • Shift of interest to personnel management or education • Critique of the skills acquired during the studies -insufficiency of practical knowledge • Importance of the ability to use the professional jargon • Acceptance for further learning and working in a role of an *apprentice* • *Pilgrim's identity* • Identity of psychologist independent of work tasks
Germany	• Subordination theoretical and methodological competence to social and communicative competence • Missing more practical courses and training to become teachers • Conceiving psychology as experienced in the program as an ac ademic discipline rather than as qualification for professional work • Critical attitude to theoretical orientation of the program • Transforming interests (from psychology as a therapeutic v ocation to teaching)	• Identification with new professions – becoming teachers • Feeling better qualified for educational jobs than as psychologists

IV. CONCLUSIONS AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS

1. Introduction

The target of the research in this project has been the transition from higher education to work life from the perspective of the students. From this perspective we have chosen to emphasize the following three empirical questions;

1) What discources can be discerned in education and work life as significant for the students and the novices in their constructions of studies and vocations?

2) What structural/material/cultural conditions contribute to these discources?

3) What strategies do students and novices apply in order to cope with knowledge formation- learning – in studies and work?

This gives us insight into micro-level where the students' experiences become visible. We have also gathered empirical data to illuminate on the meso level e.g. what material/structural conditions are to be found in institutions of higher education. For the understanding of these two levels the micro and meso level, we do however need to move to the macro level e.g. to reflect our empirical findings against the changing relationships between higher education and society at large. Hence, the conclusions presented are situated in the relationships between these three levels of analysis.

2. Key Conclusions

The main findings from the project will be presented with regard to whether they pertain to the micro or meso level respectively. We will start with the micro level.

2.1. The Micro level

The conclusions on this level are in a sense inextricably intertwined. For this reason we will only list them initially and thereafter comment on them in an integrated form.

- Differences within as well as between institutions may impact on learners` attitudes towards knowledge, competence and their work life expectations.

- The process of learning and identity construction appears to be located *in between* academic institutions, work life experiences, individual life strategies and socio–political contexts. This means that *Journeymen* consider institutions of higher education as a *part* of the setting where professional learning takes place.

- The project has revealed spatial and temporal aspects of the students' identity construction in the sphere of the relationship between higher education and work. The extensive material gathered, as well as the ideas constructed in the course of interpretation, could not, however, be compared and generalised in a significant way. Further analyses should distinguish between spatial and temporal dimensions of identification, as well as compare discernible structures of "othering" emerging in different countries and academic settings. This theme might involve, as starting points for analysis, several problems that we have identified so far.

- The process of learning and identity construction appears to be located *in between* academic institutions, work life experiences, individual life strategies and socio-political contexts. This means that *Journeymen* consider institutions of higher education as a *part* of the setting where professional learning takes place.

2.1.1. Strength of the walls

Some of our findings (the case of political science in Duisburg and Gdansk) suggest that sometimes similar outcomes (in terms of students' attitudes and competencies) may be 'produced' in strikingly different learning environments. If the tendency has been identified correctly, it may lead to the following question: To what extent do the conceptions expressed by the students result from their academic experience, and to what extent are they *produced by the external world*? Perhaps these attitudes are 'produced' outside the Academe, and strong academic tradition only provides for *borders* that keep students in 'better' programmes isolated from 'real life experience' just for a few years longer? The question is, in other words: how isolated are the students within the borders of the academe from the external world? Plus: How effectively does that external world influence their thinking during the study courses? In this respect it is related to the question of disciplinary frameworks. They may work as means of prolonging the 'moratorium' which create a possibility to reconstruct the identities of the students in a relatively 'safe' and *disciplined* environment. This may be especially important for their *ethical* orientation (compare the role of discipline in Herbart and the dual meaning of discipline in Foucault).

2.1.2. Professionalism in mass education

Three intertwined issues seem to be important here. Firstly, 'professions' are somehow elitist by definition, and that contradicts the tendency to enrol masses of students into professional (and hence most desired) programmes in the countries that do not use the numerous clauses approach. Secondly, some students, the Polish psychology and political science students for instance, emphasize their membership in a professional elite, which

they claim to have acquired with the university degree. To them, it is not the contents of their specific subjects but a general social position and the academic jargon, which are relevant (at one point, this strategy was entitled "the faked academic identity"). Thirdly, in some cases this tension is 'solved' by postponing professional training to the post-academic stage of training. Programmes like Law in Norway, Clinical Psychology in Poland and Psychology as a subject for teacher training in Germany push the bulk of professional training outside the university. In Norway, this postponing of elaterium education resembles widespread egalitarian attitudes. How do the universities define their focus on professionalism then? What does professionalism mean – and what knowledge or competences count as foundations for workplace learning? Although it is implied that graduates learn their business as employers, it is unlikely that professors think that their work does not matter. But what is it that matters – what knowledge and skills are thought to make a person apt for learning the legal or psychological business? This question may link to that about disciplinary frameworks. This is especially interesting in those programmes, which acknowledge that their graduates have to learn a lot of the "real stuff" in the workplace.

2.1.3. 'Disciplining' the student

If the university is adopting a more open approach to learning, how does it – if it does – secure the loyalty of students to given programmes? For instance, how do the students in PBL know the limits of their field – what makes them stop asking questions when they cross the border of the discipline? How do students learn what their field is "about", and how are they kept loyal to it? What makes them continue when the studies turn out to be different from their former expectations (which is very often the case according to our data) or from what they think they will need in their professional future? These questions have some 'material', or structural aspects. How open are particular programmes? Do the students combine them with other courses? Do they follow prescribed curricula, or can they construe their own pathways? If the programmes are 'open', how are students qualified for the diploma? These relatively trivial, or technical question, may speak to broader and more serious phenomena of the construction of the fields of professions or competencies by means of discursive and disciplinary practices.

2.1.4. Autonomy, openness and educational clientele

The above mentioned dilemma might create a tension between the need of autonomy and the drive to openness that attracts a larger clientele into the university. The tension – as difficult to be mastered in explicit terms - may be displaced and 'embodied' into everyday practices if the university is trying to combine both values in the programmes

that aim at being 'disciplinary' and 'open' at the same time. For instance, some schools may maintain academic autonomy when they delegate practical training to professional corporations, which may mean that they tend to lose control over the recruitment of personnel into the professions. An interesting context of these tensions may be the strong tendency to implement market mechanisms in higher education management (probably resulting in a strong emphasis on openness), contrary to the decisions of some HE authorities interested in maintaining academic autonomy. As an example for market mechanism implementation the number of Swedish psychology students is limited by the high costs for running the programme. In Germany and Poland students report the same struggle with social and economical conditions. In some cases the tension between educational openness and academic autonomy may translate itself into very down-to-earth practices like assigning credit points to theoretical and practical courses, the management of schemes of exchange between programmes and universities, extra-curricular voluntary work of the students, etc. On other occasions, the students in Duisburg proved to be active designers of their own lives when they met the professional identity crises with one widely spread strategy: oftentimes they seek additional qualification programmes on their own and find compromises in forms of personal niches of work life. In this manner, they receive a professional specialisation, which the university cannot provide.

2.2. The meso level

Our empirical data clearly indicate differences and similarities between as well as within partner institutions. On the meso level these comprise:

- There is empirical evidence that there are "institutional pacts" (tacit and overt) between institutions of higher education and professional corporations or other stakeholders in the social environment of the university. Political reforms in higher education have to consider the existence of such pacts. Otherwise there is a risk that reforms are avoided by different strategies or are implemented as sheer rhetoric.

The relationship between professional organisations (corporations) and the university seems to be at the core of many of the problems we have tried to investigate. The ways of coping with such problems like the tension between mass enrolment and professional education are plausibly subject to many formal and informal 'pacts' between the agents involved in the production and reproduction of professional competence. Some of these 'pacts' are visible in formally endorsed documents (like ethical codes of the professions or academic curricula), some other become visible only when one of the so far invisible

parts of the pact is broken. Do the actors in the academic field *experience* any kind of influence from professional corporations or other bodies endowed with power in their profession? How do such authorities operate? What are the channels of influence – formal and informal? How do corporate values operate on the minds of students and professors, how do academic values work in the work context? The tentative answers we have reached in *Journeymen* just seem to start the process of interrogation here.

The probably most outstanding 'pact' detected in the project is an institutional alliance of universities and work life facilities in Scandinavia. As the national data from Norway and Sweden indicate the way study programs at the universities prepare students for work life and the expectations the novices are met with at their workplaces resemble each other perfectly. This congruence is not played out in the same way for the two professions however. The study programs for psychology are to a large degree focused on professional preparation and the work places expect the novices to work as professional psychologists from "day one". The political science programs are not directed at preparing students for a particular profession but rather to mediating knowledge and theory of societies and generic skills such as analytical thinking. The workplaces the novice political scientists enter do not in turn expect the novices to be trained for the particular functions they will be responsible for, but allow for an undefined period of training and socialisation.

The relatively good match between higher education and work life in the two Scandinavian countries may also be termed as a 'pact' between higher education and work life, developed in interaction between what higher education contributes and what the work places need and expect. This pact, however, is tacit in nature.

On the contrary, the data from Polish and German students of psychology and political science suggests that there is not the same comfortable match between university studies and work life. From that perspective the pact visible in Germany and Poland seems to be a broken one; we can observe the consequences of its failure.

Most German psychology students in our sample go into teaching jobs or change to the education programme; in both cases they end up in professions that do not show the same congruence of HE and work life which the Scandinavian data displays. In Poland, the psychology students have to seek activities outside the regular curriculum to meet the need for clinical training that is needed in jobs offered for psychologists. When we look at political science the German students can be described as either marked by societal over-commitment or overly pragmatic attitudes, neither of which are well suited to the work life they will enter. The relatively elitist views of Polish political science

students combined with the relatively non-professional nature of their education, does not match very well with the fact that employment rates are low for political scientists or the type of work they are expected to carry out as novices in a work place.

Taking all the information on 'pacts' into consideration, various policy implications could be concluded as well. It may be argued that the Scandinavian pact solidifies higher education and provides little pressure on work life to change their practices towards novices. Thus higher education in Scandinavia may not see the need for a gradual adaptation to the dynamics of a changing society. Since the pact is tacit it is rarely disputed or negotiated and in consequence the imperative to change may be delayed. On the other hand the very wide discrepancies between how students are educated and the challenges and demands of the work life they want to enter in Germany and Poland, provide a different set of concerns. Apart from the influence of the straining labour market, the need to adjust the educational programs seems apparent.

- The institutions and programmes studied have different ideas of education. Although they deal with the same subject, they place different approaches to education, according to their learning organisation, and follow different pedagogies and conceptions of learning.

- Such differences appear to be greater between professional programmes than between traditional liberal arts studies.

- Professional programmes in Sweden and Norway have a more vocational orientation, whereas the counterparts in Poland and Germany are more modelled on the classical ideals of higher education.

Both professional and liberal arts programme in Germany and Poland and liberal arts studies in Sweden and Norway, are typical exponents of a classical approach in teaching and learning in higher education. This means that lectures are used for structuring the students' independent studies and seminars are used for analysing students' individual contributions. This pattern is also dominating in the early stages of the psychology programme in Norway, as part of the preparatory stage of this programme.

- Programmes in higher education seem to have both a *ritual* and a *rational* relationship to demands faced by professional novices in work life. If the relationship is rational it may be substantive as well as generic. It is not evident that professional programmes have a more rational relationship to work life demands than liberal arts studies.

The relationships between education and work could also be described in a more abstract way. It is reasonable to assume that all educational programmes include knowledge and skills that are *rational* in character with regard to their relation to work life, in that they are preparing for a specific field of knowledge or professional field of work, emphasising the utility value of knowledge. It is also reasonable to assume that programmes include knowledge and skills that are rather *ritual* in character, where the connection to a specific context of application is lacking and the most important feature is instead the exchange value of knowledge. The impact of education could be claimed to encompass *substantive skills* that are content specific and contextually situated. On the other hand the impact of education may also comprise *generic skills*, which are transferable between different contexts. Such skills may likewise be acquired in various contexts and developed through different contents.

- Student centred programmes e.g. problem based learning – seem to prepare students better for entry into work life than traditional programmes.

Professional as well as liberal arts programmes seems to have both ritual as well as rational relations to work life. Even though professional programmes are conceived to be modelled on work life requirements as regards skills and knowledge among professionals it is evident that they are not in general more rational than liberal art programmes with regard to preparation for work life. The clearest exception is the Swedish psychology programme, which is the only problem based programme, where a generic as well as a substantive relationship between higher education and work life is dominating.

2.3. At the macro level of European higher education

Keeping all the fields of future research interest in mind, the relevance of *Journeymen* for European policies can be summed up as follows: the challenge of the EU enlargement calls for, among other things, a better understanding of how individuals in different political and economic situations find strategies of optimal learning. By addressing the problems set out in this study in four European countries, that share some of the political and economical features, but also show great difference between them, the study has contributed knowledge on these issues. This understanding is needed to create a basis for policy making in Europe regarding higher education and the relation between higher education and work life. Subsequently, quite a number of conclusions drawn from the *Journeymen* results are closely connected to the macro level, such as:

- The transformation of higher education towards a greater mobility of work-force in Europe, in the form of higher education for the masses, poses fundamental challenges to educational programmes and policies. Study programmes have to be

described in terms of their aims and intended impact on the students in addition to homogenising merely the "outer" framework such as grades or quantitative aspects of programmes.

- A more integrated policy in Europe in the area of Higher Education in Europe requires that tendencies to maintain academic autonomy and the ever more increasing pressure on institutions of HE to comply with market demands, are balanced against each other.

- There seems to be a politically constructed difference between knowledge and competence, the former significant in the relations between academic institutions and business ("academic capitalism" means that knowledge becomes a commodity and therefore is no longer freely transmitted in education), the latter constructing the field of learning for employment. It means that the discourse of competence that dominates the thinking of individual outcomes of higher education may deter the students from seeking knowledge, and leave the field of knowledge unchallenged and free to be capitalised. It is in the interest of European tradition to avoid such a development.

3. Future needs for research

Looking into the future, there are numerous impulses won by the *Journeymen* project. Very generally, various aspects of HE can be named which have proved to be closely connected to the project data. These aspects shape future research fields. More specifically, a list of proposed topics for further comparative studies will be given.

Fundamentally, more extensive survey studies should be conducted to assess the general nature of the conclusions drawn from the *Journeymen* data since the samples were restricted in number and varied from one university to the next of the four participating European universities. However, even if the database in the *Journeymen* project is limited the project results are of a kind that demands attention now. In parallel to the suggested survey studies in depth qualitative studies tapping conceptions and views among teachers and professionals in the field would broaden the understanding and provide an even better basis for strategies. Thus, interactions between higher education and work and between European countries might be improved in this respect. Nevertheless, many of the topics addressed in *Journeymen* produced promising results helping to understand various aspects of HE in Europe. Anyway, the ground for strong interpretations is rather limited:

Firstly, the termination of the project just after the collection of the last sets of empirical data made it impossible to develop sound theoretical interpretations. For the same reason, some ideas, which were suggested as interpretations by national teams, did not have a chance to be validated in the international, comparative context. Some of them (like the notion of "institutional pacts" and "migrants in Higher Education and Work life") emerged in the last months of analytical work and they need more effort to be turned into theoretical concepts and into politically valid conclusions.

Secondly, some ideas pertain to the complexity of relations between institutional and autonomous learning urgently need further analysis and theoretical clarifications. The following section will list those ideas and suggest possible directions of investigation.

Thirdly, hypotheses supposedly well grounded in substantial empirical material still need to be tested against a broader empirical basis. This is due to the limited sample used in the project, which is an inevitable result of the qualitative methodological approach.

Finally, the socio-political context underlines the need of further research activities. A convincing example of this may be the urgent need to focus the research in HE on migrants emerging from the German team's experience in the project. The original methodology of the project, linking phenomenography to discourse analysis and hermeneutics, seems to have proven its validity. However, it needs further testing in different research contexts derived from those conclusions mentioned before.

In sum, further research should:

- "Utilise" the obtained data base and preliminary interpretations in a way that is theoretically coherent and politically significant.

- Clarify the hypotheses emerging in the analyses and design procedures.

- Carry out empirical research based on quantitative methodology to broaden the international sample.

- Broaden the research so that more aspects of the socio-political context of HE in particular countries and in Europe in general are addressed more appropriately.

- Transfer the methodology developed in the project to other areas of social research and disseminate it in the research community of social sciences.

3.1. Proposed topics for further comparative studies

In terms of the ideas emerging from the research project, it seems worthwhile to investigate into those issues further, which have emerged in the analyses carried out particularly in the partner countries during the final phase of interpretations. Unfortunately, the termination of the project made it impossible to see whether the identified tendencies are only of specific or of a more universal character. Anyhow, it seems worthwhile to take up *Journeymen* results regarding matters of identity and ethos in individual studies. Furthermore, affairs related to disciplinary frameworks, fields of work, and fields of knowledge deserve intensified attention just like the relation between knowledge and society. Based on specific outcomes of the Duisburg interviews, the access of migrants to HE forms an additional future field of research.

a) Matters of identity

Identity has been one of the key interpretative categories in the project. The extensive material gathered, as well as the ideas constructed in the course of interpretation, could not, however, be compared and generalised in a significant way. Further analyses should distinguish between spatial and temporal dimensions of identification as well as compare discernible structures of "othering" emerging in different countries and academic settings.

Time

The temporal dimension used for analysing professional identity in ICT engineers in Poland may be relevant in research on other professional cultures and in other European countries as well. Different professions may be considered as living in different "times", and questions about possible social, educational and individual consequences of temporal diversity in work cultures may lead to a better understanding of society.

Space

This general caption may cover the issue of the scope of the field of work (expressed as flexibility of work options, the possibility of working abroad, etc), as well as that of "othering" as a tool of delimiting the space of professional identity.

This issue has been covered in *Journeymen* as an aspect of discourse analysis, but its importance asks for further investigation.

Personal identity and professionalism

There may be a difference between particular countries and professions in how they feel the relationship between personal and professional identity. We have identified that this relation may be felt as somehow problematic in Norwegian psychologists (there may be some tension between 'personal' empathy and 'professional' distance, to some extent trained by a scientific approach in education). This issue may have a form of conflicts between private lives and professional roles:

How is this constructed institutionally? Or is it resolved individually? What conditions make people feel or not feel a tension here? Is it relevant for other professions as well?

Career prospects

As the interview results have shown, vague future prospects in Poland and Germany makes professional identity formation less distinct than in Norway and Sweden. Due to the difficult labour market the Polish and German novices work in jobs they have not been particularly prepared for. They often find employments in fields of work that are not directly related to the knowledge they have acquired during the studies. Consequently, they identify with their profession to a lesser extent. In Scandinavia where job prospects are good and socialisation into the professional culture is promoted in the curriculum, the identification and satisfaction is remarkably stronger.

b) Ethos

We use the term 'ethos' in a descriptive way, referring (not only in relation to ethics but in a more general way) to habits and customs characteristic of the investigated groups. While different concepts of ethos are identified, it is important to look for their possible relations and see whether these are coherent or not, which may consequently lead towards the identification of discursive forces that shape the field of professional ethics. It is fairly easy to notice the cases of discrepancy or conflict between various concepts of ethos. If tensions or conflicts occur, they may lead – through discourse analysis – to the identification of social forces that lie behind the construction of professional self-conceptions. Exemplary problems that have emerged from our analyses so far may be the following:

Sources of responsibility

In some professions (ICT in Poland) ethical responsibility is not clearly identified in the process of developing professional identity while in some others (psychology in all samples) it remains one of the core issues. It might be interesting to try to identify the factors that 'implant' ethical responsibility into identity formations is it the direct involvement in human lives? If so, is there a difference between psychologists, lawyers and educationists?

Ethical engagement: personal or professional?

As an aspect of professional identification, ethical engagement may be analysed as an aspect of the previously described issue of the relation between personal and professional identity. This may be the case with some of our respondents in psychology who may develop a more 'technical' approach as part of their professionalism, which may divert them from their initial ethical stance (the profession identified through the need to help the others). Do we have a tension here? Being a psychologist seems to ground deeply in personal identification, and the notion of the profession has clear traits of responsibility ('being helpful'). However, most psychologists in Poland work in purely commercial organisations whereas German psychologists prefer working at school. How does it work in terms of their identity and their notion of responsibility? In more general terms, this issue is a reflection of the tendency to see the profession as stretched between "help" and "manipulation", noticed already in freshmen. Do the respondents see non-clinical (e.g. managerial) specialisations as involving some ethical issues? What are they – in what values do they ground, is it still about "helping people"?

Ethics and interest

There is a possibility that sometimes-ethical arguments may be used to cover other interests. To turn to psychology again, the issue of labelling people "patients" or "clients" might illustrate this. These notions may mark the tension between the medical and commercial approaches in the professional discourse, or between 'the mission' and 'profession' of the psychologist. In the discussed case, 'mission' may be discursively used as a legitimising tool for the commercial approach to professional issues. The notion of 'client', while empowering former 'patients' (they become individuals seeking specialised service rather than 'ill' and dependant persons), at the same time makes it far easier to accept the fact that 'clients' are dearly charged for the service. Such interplays of ethical claims and interests may be seen differently in different countries and by psychologists working in public and private sectors of psychological assistance. Can we see such cases

and such differences in the material? To extend the scope of analysis, similar questions may be asked about other 'helping' professions, more and more often called services nowadays.

c) Disciplinary frameworks, fields of work, and fields of knowledge

According to R. Barnett (1994), academic autonomy is related to the strength of disciplines. When programmes are organised as 'broad fields' curricula, part of the autonomy is lost and the university has to make concessions to the field of practice or other external forces. On the other hand, broad field curricula, somehow related to the traditional 'liberal' or 'bildung'-approach to higher education, and open structures of learning, seem to fit the expectations of employers in the time of 'flexibility' better than disciplinary programmes. It seems that this tension between

- The tradition of liberal education that serves the needs of the student,

- Autonomy of academic disciplines, and

- The pressure to meet the demands of the job market, can be clearly seen in some of our data.

The goal of research in this section would be to identify such dilemmas and see how they work as discursive formations in HE (this means: how they 'produce' semiotic structures which are, for instance, visible in incoherencies or tensions within the data). The following problems address some specific aspects of this issue:

Why do we do it?

In the context of the above questions, the relationship between higher education and work seems to be quite problematic. This observation brings about a series of fundamental questions. What makes the universities keep the disciplines while employers very often ignore them? On the other hand, if the employers tend to ignore the syllabi of the diplomas, why do universities *care*? Education seems to have escaped the borders of educational *institutions* for good; somehow, it creates an impression of omnipresence. What makes us think that university education 'counts' in work life, and how is this conviction maintained? Is it all about *rational* or *ritual* functions of higher education? Our findings as to the 'incompleteness of education', relating to the process of learning outside, and very often *in spite* of institutional ramifications, provide a good basis for asking fairly radical questions concerning the function of HE nowadays.

Strategies of coping

If we assume that these questions represent some deeper tendencies and problems, we have to imply that the actors on the educational scene are in a way aware of them. How, then, do they cope? What are the strategies of avoiding or solving these problems in institutional and individual lives? At the institutional level, they might involve tendencies of abandoning the academic 'strength' and disciplinary autonomy for the sake of practical relevance of the programme, or the tendencies to maintain high academic profile at the cost of practical competence, with an implication that it is the work life that 'really teaches' the skills professionals need. This issue is directly related to the problem of relationships between the Academe and professional organisations (corporations), which represent the 'field of practice'.

d) Knowledge-based societies: are they really based on knowledge and on what kind of knowledge are they based on?

When analysing the German material we pointed to the phenomenon of collapsing knowledge into competence in students' utterances. This may point to some very interesting, much broader, and – possibly – externally constructed discursive tensions: How do knowledge and competence operate in the public discourse? And how do they work in the university? *Who cares about knowledge* and *who cares about competence*? How are they positioned in the curricula, in job advertisements, in the criteria of professional status? We may expect some 'structured surprises' here. What we tacitly imply here as a hypothesis is that 'knowledge' may appear to be a politically constructed *link between business and research* while "competence" is what seems to connect *students and their (future) employers.* Theorists of academic capitalism (like Slaughter and Leslie) hint that knowledge – as a good capitalised by the university – is no longer the issue in academic education (it can't be *freely* transferred to students in mass higher education). Therefore the separation of knowledge production and mass education at universities may result in an emphasis on *student competence* as a way of avoiding the question of the relevance of knowledge in general *(who* cares about knowledge, again?), and of the diversification of knowledge (the 'useless core' transferable to students under the label of 'liberal education', and cutting-edge, commercially profitable knowledge protected by aggressively promoted discourse of copyrights). The meaning of *knowledge* in the so-called 'knowledge-based societies' is, anyway, far from being clear.

e) Access of migrants to HE

Closely connected to "identity" as a category of major importance, the cultural background of the students respectively novice workers has proven to influence conceptions of the professional self in an extraordinarily strong way. How this relation works in detail is a question of prior importance absolutely worthy of further scientific investigation (not only because of its political significance; see paragraph on enhancement of migrant schooling below).

Further research could primarily help to verify certain hypotheses established in the late interpretation phase of *Journeymen*. For instance, it should be clarified if young migrants really experience forms of social marginalisation, which have an impact on their attitude towards education. If so, practical programmes to balance social positions need to be designed. It seems that for migrants academic knowledge appears to be a vehicle to overcome the low social status and to get leading positions on the labour market and to attain a higher position in society. In this context knowledge becomes a powerful means and seems to support integration processes. Unfortunately, only little research has been done on specific learning biographies of migrants. Following the general notions of learner-focussed didactics, task-oriented learning and the interdependence of knowledge and identity, investigating specific migrant learner biographies on a longitudinal level seems to be very promising. This is an important outlook of *Journeymen*.

f) Equalisation of education from the European gender mainstreaming perspective

Gender issues have not been addressed in a sufficient way in *Journeymen*, mostly because the samples were meant to reflect the gender composition of particular programmes in order to make them somehow representative of particular academic cultures. From a general gender perspective, the project data have given empiric proof to widespread assumptions such as, for instance, that men mostly represent engineering programmes while psychology is a programme, which is mostly attended by women. A more gender-sensitive sampling should enable comparative research into - for instance - women in engineering and men in psychology. As gender is a most fundamental structure that can be traced in all aspects of social life, all issues mentioned above should generally be subject to contrastive analyses in terms of gender in academic and work cultures.

More specifically, the gender category deserves particular attention on a European dimension besides the somehow superficially observed unbalanced participation of the

sexes in the various study programmes. Just like children from migrant families female students represent a group, which is changing its social status. Throughout Europe, traditional concepts of the domestic role of women in the family and in society are gradually being more and more overcome. Most young women are not willing to play the outdated role of mothers and housewives only.

Apparently, a lot of them are insecure what role they want to play instead. Studying at university and planning an academic career is only one of numerous activities, which can serve as a replacement of the old conventional role. As this conflict is present for women from all European countries, it forms an essential socio-political issue on the European level. Based on the *Journeymen* results, future studies could specifically compare how female students cope with this challenging situation in the participating European countries. Hence, the outlines of a major contemporary socio-political challenge could be drawn.

3.2. Knowledge, competence and higher education

Some of the topics identified above as further research issues are of direct importance for higher education policies in Europe. Foremost, the deeper understanding of how in fact the "triple helix" of relations between education, work and politics is practically constructed, or in other words, how the persons involved in education, work and politics act at the intersection of their fields and what power relations operate there, is of crucial importance for educational policies of our time.

When, for instance, the Scandinavian pact unites university and work life, it provides only little pressure on either higher education or work life to change their practices. Thus higher education in Scandinavia may not see the need for a gradual adaptation to the dynamics of a changing society. Since the pact is tacit it is rarely disputed or negotiated and in consequence the imperative to change may be delayed. On the other hand, the very wide discrepancies between how students are educated and the challenges and demands of the work life they want to enter in Germany and Poland, provide a different set of concerns: apart from the influence of the strained labour market, the need to adjust the educational programs seems apparent.

The dynamics between higher education and work life in the four countries with their very varying characteristics, pacts and discrepancies also indicate the *very real problems students and professionals alike will meet if they attempt to move between countries when they seek education or work*. On a European policy level, the ideals of mobility and flexibility of the labour market are as yet far from easy to attain. The implication is that mobility is not just a question of intentions, agreements or structural reforms (such as

the Bologna process), but must be grounded in very concrete discussions about higher education curricula as well as in the daily workings of professional life. Such prominent discussions must be conducted in a way that respects and appreciates all existing differences as part of different cultures that make up the particular manifold of Europe.

Generally, the research results regarding HE policy suggest that the relations between education, work, and politics are very difficult to trace and to control. In fact, it seems that the crucial sector of social learning is subject to a play of interests where it is not always the public good that is at stake.

4. A final word

As the project was carried out in an international setting, all of the final results seem to have some significance in the European context. One of the highlights here is that the research teams from the countries involved closely co-operated on a daily basis not only in terms of data sharing, but also in interpretation and analysis, which has led to a deeper common understanding of the complex relations between education, work, their inter-relations and socio-political contexts in Europe.

Some evidence has been gathered as to the diversity of this sphere. In fact, the ideas concerning professional education are strongly diversified across the countries and professional fields; so are organisational structures and, of course, meaning-making strategies of the students and novice workers. However, in spite of the diversity, there is a visible common ground for the educational experiences, marked, on the one hand, by similar structural conditions (like mass enrolment to programmes aiming at somehow elitist positions in society), and by the growing inter-dependence resulting from European integration and economic globalisation on the other. On this common ground, the comparative analysis between countries, between professional and liberal programmes, and between students has contributed to new knowledge about possibilities and hindrances for increased mobility in education and work between the European countries. It has been particularly fruitful to identify significant discursive formations that shape the ways in which contemporary higher education in Europe tries to deal with the complex and conflicting tasks. Furthermore, the methodological approach can claim to have allowed a deeper understanding of cultural diversity. Its main feature is that problems, methodologies and interpretations are discussed and negotiated during the whole course of research activities in cross-national teams, and the methods applied include those making use of the lived experience of researchers as insiders in analysed cultures. Such a setting allows for hermeneutical understanding of particular cultural environments and for comparative analysis of the *meaning* of social phenomena. In our opinion, the

combination of phenomenography, discourse analysis and hermeneutics proved to be a promising research methodology for comparative qualitative studies in Europe. We therefore highly recommend this approach for future research activities in this field.

V. DISSEMINATION AND EXPLOITATION OF RESULTS

During the lifetime of the project, the four project partners have made use of several techniques of data transmission and cooperation. At various international conferences and symposia, for instance, progress reports and preliminary results have been presented and discussed. In this manner, the international co–operation was intensified and the development of common objectives was enhanced. Then, a website has been placed on the World Wide Web as a digital means of data transfer and presentation of final results. From day one, there also was an Internet forum for discussions and exchange of documents. Finally, there is a publication in print by the Polish project team and diverse efforts to establish further contacts and networks.

1. Contributions at international conferences

2002

November 20-24, American association of the Study of Higher Education (ASHE) 27th Conference. Paper presented by Berit Karseth and Tone Dyrdal Solbrekke. *Journey towards a Professional Identity*

2003

March 6-9, Nordic European Research Association, 31st Congress, Copenhagen, Denmark. Joint Symposium "*Students as Journeymen between Cultures of Higher Education and Work*".

March 6-9, Nordic European Research Association 31st Congress, Copenhagen. Presentation in the Joint symposium Normative Dimension of Higher Education: Learning the moral order of professions. Karen Jensen and Tone Dyrdal Solbrekke

March 6–9, Nordic European Research Association 31st Congress, Copenhagen, paper by Astrid Meczkowska: "Students' Conceptions of Knowledge – transnational comparison", within symposium *Students as Journeymen between Higher Education and Work* (coordinator – Linkoping University)

May 26-27, International research symposium, Technical University of Gdansk, Poland, Evaluation des savoirs et connaissances dans les formations aux métiers d'ingenieurs (Evaluation knowledge and preparation to engineering work), a presentation by Cackowska, M., Struzynska, A.: Motivations and expectations of ICT students

May 29 – 31, Polish conference "Every day reality as place and source of learning", Lower–Silesian Higher School of Education, Ladek Zdrój, paper by Astrid Meczkowska: *"The Incompleteness of Higher Education as phenomenon opening new spaces of learning*" August 26 – 30, The Norwegian team has presented a paper on "How do students conceive of learning when entering and leaving university" at the 10th EARLI international conference in Padua, Italy. September 17–20, ECER Conference in Hamburg – presentation of the national results in a symposium: *How does higher education prepare or qualify for work life?*

September 17–20, European Conference on Educational Research (ECER), University of Hamburg, Germany. Research workshop: *How does Higher Education prepare or qualify for WorkLife?*

September 17–20, European Conference on Educational Research (ECER), University of Hamburg, Germany. Paper presented at the joint symposium *Becoming a Professional – Freshmen and Senior students' notions* **Berit Karseth and Tone Dyrdal Solbrekke**

September 17–20, European Conference on Educational Research (ECER), University of Hamburg, paper by Astrid Meczkowska "*The Incompleteness of Higher Education: could weakness become powerful?*"

November 29 - December 3, NZARE AARE Conference in Auckland, New Zealand, *Freshmen's and seniors' thoughts about Education, Professional identity and Work,* Håkan Hult, Madeleine Abrandt Dahlgren, Lars Owe Dahlgren, Helene Hård af Segerstad. A paper published in the conference proceedings.

Publication: Astrid Maczkowska, "Fenomenografia jako podejscie badawcze w obszarze studiów edukacyjnych", *Kwartalnik Pedagogiczny* No. 3 (189), 2003 (paper presenting methodological issues based on the research experience in the project)

There is also a date mistake related to ECER in Hamburg in 2003. Which is right: 15-20 September or 17-20 September (in case of German participation)?

2004

March 11–13, NFPF/NERA 32nd congress in Reykavik, a presentation by Tone Dyrdal Solbrekke, *"From senior students to novice worker: The notion of professional responsibility"*

March 11– 13, NFPF/NERA's 32nd Congress, a presentation by Kristina Johansson & Lars Owe Dahlgren, *Political Science students on the move.*

May 7– 8, International research symposium, *Learning and Identity Formation in Higher Education*, University of Linköping, – A common contribution by the Swedish and German project partners: *Discourses on Higher Education and Work Life.* Johansson, K.; Abrandt Dahlgren, M.; Dahlgren, L. O.; Hult, H.; Hård af Segerstad, H.: *Some results from the Journeymen project. The Swedish scene.* Lababidi, T.: *Some results from the Journeymen project. The German scene.*

July 5–7, 7th EARLI:s conference in Istanbul, Tone Dyrdal Solbrekke, a paper *"From senior students to novice worker: The notion of professional responsibility"*

15-18 September 2004, XIIth Polish Sociological Conference, Adam Mickiewicz University, Poznan, Poland. Paper by: Szkudlarek, T., Cackowska, M., Mendel, M., Struzynska-Kujalowicz, A.: *Discourse analysis in European comparative research: between phenomenograpy and hermeneutics (disappearing clinicism in psychology - polish and germen example).*

September 16–19, 4th ESREA European Research Conference in Wroclaw, Poland,. Paper by Meczkowska, A.: *The power of education as power of gravity? (A perspective within one of many academic culture)*

September 22–25, Paper presented at European Conference Educational Research (ECER)–conference in Crete, Tone Dyrdal Solbrekke, *Towards notions of professional responsibility – the transition from senior students to novice workers*.

23-25 September, V[th] Polish Pedagogical Conference, Lower-Silesian Higher School of Education, Wroclaw, Poland. Paper by: Cackowska, M., Strunynska-Kujalowicz, A.: *Constructing of professional identity of computer scientists within technical university and workplaces*.

November 25.-27. Paper presented at the International Conference; Professional learning in a Changing Society in Oslo, Norway. Berit Karseth and Tone Dyrdal Solbrekke. *Communities of practices: Spaces for learning in higher education*

November 25.-27. Paper presented at the International Conference; Professional learning in a Changing Society in Oslo, Norway. Tone Dyrdal Solbrekke and Berit Karseth. *Educating for professional responsibility – an issue for higher education?*

November 25.-27. Paper presented at the International Conference; Professional learning in a Changing Society in Oslo, Norway. Gunnar Handal and Kirsten Hofgaard Lycke. *From higher education to Professional Practice: Learning among students and professionals.*

2005

Abrandt Dahlgren, M., Hult, H., Dahlgren, L O., Hård af Segerstad, H., Johansson, K., (2005) The transition from higher education to work life: a comparison between a problem-based learning programme and conventional programmes in higher education. NERA konferens, Oslo.

2. Digital dissemination

For further dissemination of project results a website has been developed in 2004. This website includes general background information of the project with a description of methodological ideas and the research objectives, and a presentation of the scientific reports.

Titles of scientific reports, to be found on the *Higher Education to Work Life* – homepage (www.hewl.net):

- State of the Art Report (March 2002)

- Freshmen Students on Education and Work (December 2002)

- Senior Students on Higher Education and Work Life (January 2003)

- National Comparison of Freshmen and Senior Students (April 2003)

- Education and Work: Discourse Analysis of Liberal and Professional

- Programmes at the University (June 2003)

- Developing Professional Identity (January 2004)

- Understanding the Transition from Higher Education to Work Life (May 2004)

3. Publication of results (in printed form):

Cackowska, M.; Kopciewicz, L.; Mendel, M.; Meczkowska, A.; Struzynska, A.; Szkudlarek, T. (2003): *Freshmen students on education and work – Work package one report: Poland*, Gdansk: University press

Mendel, M., (2003). Być pomiedzy. Tendencje zmian na styku swiata uc-zelni i pracy z perspektywy ich uczestnika. [In:] R. Gerlach (eds.), Edukacja wobec rynku pracy. Realia – mozliwosci – perspektywy (p. 210-224). Bydgoszcz: Wydawnictwo Akademii Bydgoskiej im. Kazimierza Wielkiego.

Solbrekke, T.D. and Karseth. B. (in press). Professional responsibility - an issue for higher education? Higher Education

Johansson, K., Hård af Segerstad, H., Hult, H., Abrandt Dahlgren, M., Dahlgren, L O., (2005) *The Janus Face of Political Science Studies. Junior and senior students´ thoughts about their education and their coming profession*. Manuscript submitted for publication.

Abrandt Dahlgren, M., Hult, H., Dahlgren, L O., Hård af Segerstad, H., Johansson, K., (2005) From senior student to novice worker: learning trajectories in political science, psychology and mechanical engineering. *Manuscript submitted for publication.*

Abrandt Dahlgren, M., Hult, H., Dahlgren, L O., Hård af Segerstad, H., Johansson, K.,(2005) *The transition from higher education to work life: the outcomes of a PBL programme and a conventional programme,* in Poikela, E. & Poikela, S.,(eds), PBL in Context – Bridging Work and Education, Tampere University Press.

4. Internal communication platform

The four project partners used an internet–based blackboard in order to collect and exchange relevant documents: http://blackboard.liu.se

5. Cooperation with national and international institutions

Each partner has contacted national or local institutions for providing further information about the research project: Transfer of project results to university teachers in order to optimize the quality of study guidance and counselling; recommendation for curriculum development Counselling agency "Akzent" at the University of Duisburg–Essen (affiliated to the German "Bundesagentur für Arbeit") Summary of specific results regarding migrants in Higher Education and Work Life sent to the German Ministerial Office for Migrant Issues (Zuwanderungsrat) Conceptionalisation of a comparative follow–up project with two Australian university programmes in Sydney. Intensified cooperation with Assoc.prof. Peter Petocz (University of Technbology, Sydney) & Dr. Anna Reid (Macquarie University, Sydney)

VI. REFERENCES AND BIBLIOGRAPHY

Aamodt, P.O.& Arnesen,C.A. (1995): The relationship between expansion in higher education and the labour market in Norway. *European Journal of Education*. Vol. 30, 1, p 65.

Abrandt, M. (1997) Learning Physiotherapy: The impact of formal education and professional experience. Linköping Studies in Education and Psychology No. 50.

Abrandt Dahlgren, M., & Öberg, G. (2001). Questioning to learn and learning to question: Structure and function of PBL scenarios in environmental science education. *Higher Education*, 41:263–282.

Abrandt Dahlgren, M. & Dahlgren, L.O. (2002). Portraits of PBL: Students' experiences of the characteristics of problem-based learning in physiotherapy, computer engineering and psychology. *Instructional Science, 30, 111-127.*

Abrandt Dahlgren, M, (2003). PBL through the looking glass: Comparing applications in computer engineering, psychology and physiotherapy. *International Journal of Engineering Education, 19,. 672-681.*

Albanese, M.A. & Mitchell, S. (1993) Problem–based learning. A review of literature on its outcomes and implementation issues. *Academic Medicine*, 68: 52–81.

Alexandersson, C. (1985). *Stabilitet och förändring.* [Stability and change]. Göteborg: Acta Universitatis Gothoburgensis. Studies in Educational Sciences. 53.

Antepohl, W., Domeij, E., Forsberg, P., & Ludvigsson, J. (2003). A follow up of medical graduates of a problem-based learning curriculum. *Medical Education, 37, 155-162.*

Auleytner J. (1998): Kwestia edukacyjna w polityce spo?ecznej, tekst wyg?oszony na III Ogólnopolskim Zjez´dzie Pedagogicznym, 21–23 wrzes´nia, Poznan´.

Barnett, R. (1994) The limits of competence. Knowledge, higher education and society. Buckingham: SRHE and Open University Press.

Bauman, Z. (1991). *Modernity and ambivalence*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd.

Baumann Z. (2000): Globalizacja i co z tego dla ludzi wynika, Warszawa.

Becker, H. S., Geer, B., & Hughes, E. C. (1968). *Making the grade: the academic side of college life.* New York: Wiley.

Becket, D., (1996) Critical judgement and professional practice. *Educational theory*, 46(2), 138–150.

Beckett, D. & Morris, G., (2000). Ontology at Work: Constructing the Learner/Worker. Adult Education Research Conference. June, 2–4, 2000. Vancouver, British Columbia.

Bendz, M. (1995). *Kunskap i praktik.* [Knowledge in practice]. Peda gogiska institutionen, Lunds Universitet.

Bowden, J. & Marton, F. (1998). *The university of learning: Beyond quality and competence in higher education.* London: Kogan Page.

Brennan, J. Kogan, M. & Teichler, U. (1996). Higher Education and Work I: Higher Education Policy Series 23, Jessica Kingsley Publisjhers, London and Bristol, Pensylvania.

Brown P., & Lauder H. (Eds.) (1991). *Educational and Economic Survival: From Fordism to Post–Fordism*, London.

Brumby, M. N. (1979). Students' perceptions and learning styles associated with the concept of evolution by natural selection. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Surrey.

Buchner – Jeziorska A. (1996): System edukacji a potencjal modernizacyjny spoleczen´stwa, Nauka i Szkolnictwo Wyz?sze, nr 7.

Colliver, J.A. (2000). Effectiveness of Problem–based learning curricula: Research and Theory. *Academic Medicine*, 75:259–266.

Czezowski T. (1994): O ideale uniwersytetu [W:] Toz?samos´c´ uniwersytetu, W.Winc?awski (red.), Torun´.

Dahlgren, L. O. (1978). Effects of university education on the conception of reality. Göteborg: Reports from the Department of Education, University of Gothenburg. No 65.

Dahlgren, L. O. (1989a). Fragments of an economic habitus. Conceptions of economic phenomena in freshmen and seniors. *European Journal of Psychology of Education,* I V (4), 547–558.

Delors (1996) Uczenie sie nasz ukryty skarb, Raport UNESCO – Edukacja w XXI wieku, J.Delors (red.) Paris 1996, UMK Torun [W:] Kultura i Edukacja nr 2/98.

Denek K. (1998): Ku szkolnictwu wyz?szemu XXI wieku, Kultura i Edukacja, nr 2.

Dewey, J. (1933). *How we think: A restatement of the relation of reflective thinking to the educative process.* Boston: D.C. Heath & Company.

Dunai L., Hufnagl L., Ivanyi M. (1998): University–Enterprise Co–operation in the Education of Steel Structures, *J. Construct. Steel Res.* Vol. 46, 1–3, no. 151, pp.271–272. Edwards, R. & Usher,?. (1998)

Edukacja 1997–2001. Raport. Ministerstwo Edukacji Narodowej, Warszawa 2001

Etzkowitz H., Webster A., Gebhardt C., Cantisano Terra B.R. (2000): The future of the university and the university of the future: evolution of ivory tower to entrepreneurial paradigm. Research Policy, no. 29, pp. 313–330

Farrell, L. (2000). Negotiating knowledge in the knowledge economy: workplace educators and the politics of codification.

Feldman, K., & Newcomb, T. (1969). *The impact of college on students.* San Francisco: Jossey–Bass.

Fenwick, T., (1998). Boldly solving the world. A critical analysis of problem–based learning as a method of professional education. Studies in the education of adults 30: 53–66.

Gee, James Paul. (1999). An Introduction to Discourse Analysis. Theory and Method. Routledge: London and New York.

Gardner, J., (1999) The Senior Year Experience: A Primer, University of South Carolina. www.sc.edu.

Geldermann B. (1999): Self–Assessment and Self–Evaluation in New Forms of Training Near the Workplace (In). P.Alheit, J.Beck, E.Kammler, R.Taylor.

Giroux H (1983): Theories of Reproduction and Resistance in the New Sociology of Education. *Harvard Educational Review* vol. 53, No.3.

Godin B. & Gingras Y. (2000): The place of universities in the system of knowledge production. Research Policy, no. 29 (2000), pp. 273–278.

Hasselgren, B. (1981). *Ways of apprehending children at play: a study of pre–school teachers' development.* Göteborg: Acta Universitatis Gothoburgensis. Studies in Educational Sciences. 38.

Hård af Segerstad, H., (1998) The outcome of generic and transferable skills in relation to professional practice, in Rust, C., (ed) Proceedings The Improving Student Learning Conference, Oxford Brookes University, England.

Husén, T. (1950) *Testresultatens prognosvärde.* [The prognostic value of test results]. Lund: Gebers.

Härnquist, K. (1968) Relative changes in intelligence from 13 to 18. II Results. *Scandinavian Journal of Psychology,* (9).

Inkster R. (1994): Internships and Refletive Practice: Informing the Workplace, Informing the Academy. ERIC Digest, No. ED376459; ERIC Clearinghouse on Reading, English, and Communication, Indiana University, Bloomington.

Johansson, B., Marton, F., & Svensson, L. (1985). An approach to describing learning as a change between qualitatively different conceptions. In A.L. Pines and T.H. West (Eds.) *Cognitive structure and conceptual change*. New York: Academic Press.

Johnston, B. (2003). The shape of research in the field of higher education and graduate employment: some issues. *Studies in Higher Education, 28, (4), 414-426.*

Jones, A., McArdle, P.J., & O'Neill, P. (2002). Perceptions of how well graduates are prepared for the role of pre-registration house officer: a comparison of outcomes from a traditional and integrated PBL curriculum. *Medical Education, 36,16-25.*

Kaufman, P. & Feldman, K.A. (2004) "Forming identities in college. A sociological approach", Research in Higher Education, Vol. 45, No. 5, pp. 463-496.

Kogan, M. (1996): The Institutional Aspects. In: Brennan, J., Kogan, M, & Teichler, U: *Higher Education and Work* In: Higher Education Policy Series 23.

Kubota C. (1993): Education–Business Partnerships: Scientific Work Experience Programs. ERIC/CSMEE Digest, ED359045.

Marton, F., Dahlgren, L.–O., & Säljö, R. (1977). *Inlärning och omvärldsuppfattning.* [Learning and conceptions of reality]. Stockholm: Almqvist &Wiksell.

Marton, F. (1981). Phenomenography – describing conceptions of the world around us. *Instructional Science, 10*, 177–200.

Marton, F. (1994). Phenomenography. In T. Husén & T. N. Postlethwaite (Eds.), *The International Encyclopedia of Education.* London: Pergamon Press.

Marton, F. (1995). Cognosco ergo sum. Reflections on reflections. *Nordisk pedagogik,15* (3), 165–180.

Marton, F., Booth, S. (1997) *Learning and awareness*. Mahwah, N.J.: Erlbaum Associates.

McIntyre, J. & Solomon, N., (2000). Questioning Research as a contextual Practice. Paper presented at the Adult Education Research Conference June 2–4, 2000, Vancouver, British Columbia.

Miller, C. M. L., & Parlett, M. (1974). *Up to the mark: A study of the examination game.* London: SHRE.

Mrówka B. (1999): Ksztaƒcenie ustawiczne a doskonalenie umiejeƒtnos´ci profesjonalnych, Studia Europejskie, nr 3.

Mumby Dennis K, Robin P.Clair (1997): Organizational discourse. In: Van Dijk Teun A, ed..: Discourse as Social Interaction. Vol.2 of *Discourse Studies: A Multidisciplinarty Introduction.* SAGE Publications, London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi.

Naylor M. (1985): Organized Labour Education and Training Programs. Overview. ERIC Digest no. 43, ED259213.

Pace, C. (1979). *Measuring outcomes of college: Fifty years of findings and recommendations for the future*. San Francisco: Jossey–Bass.

Pascarella, E. T., & Terenzini, P. T. (1991). *How college affects students.* San Francisco and Oxford: Jossey–Bass.

Perry, W. (1970). *Forms of intellectual and ethical development in the college years: A scheme*. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston.

PISA Studies (2000): Chapter 5, Familiäre Lebensverhältnisse, Bildungsbeteiligung und Kompetenzerwerb, p.33–40.

Plumb D., (2000) Postmodern Morality in Adult Education: A Cross–Cultural Study. Adult Educational Research Conference 2000.

Rahimi, A. (1995) Problem–based and conventional medical education from a student perspective. A qualitative analysis comparing students' experience of medical education, approach to learning and reading comprehension. Linköping: Studies in Education and Psychology Dissertations No. 45.

Ramm, M. & Bargel, T. (1995) Studium, Beruf und Arbeitsmarkt. Orientierungen von Studierenden in West– und Ostdeutschland, Nürnberg.

Reeve, F. & Gallacher, J. (2000) Researching the implementation of work–based learning within Higher Education:Questioning collusion and resistance, Adult Education Research Conference.

Saarinen–Rahiika, H., & Binkley, J.M. (1998) Problem–based learning in physical therapy: A review of the literature and overview of the McMaster University experience. *Physical therapy*, 78:195–207.

Savin–Baden, M. (2000). *Problem–based learning in higher education: Untold stories*. Buckingham: SRHE & Open University Press.

Slaughter S., Leslie L.L. (1997): *Academic Capitalism. Politics, Policies, and the Entrepreneurial University,* Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Slembrouck, Stef (2001): Explanation, Interpretation and Critique in the Analysis of Discourse. *Critique of Anthropology* Vol. 21 (1), 33–57.

Snyder, B. R. (1971). *The hidden curriculum.* New York: Knopf.

Stiwne, D., Abrandt, M & Holmqvist R. (1996) Psychological dilemmas of PBL. Learning from a full scale implementation of PBL in a MSc Psychology programme. Paper presented at 24th. NFPF–congress 1996 in Lillehammer, Norway, March, 7–10 1996.

Svensson, L. (1976) *Study skill and learning*. Göteborg: Studies in Educational Sciences. 19.

Svensson, L. (1989). The conceptualization of cases of physical motion. *European Journal of Psychology of Education*, 4, 529–545.

Säljö, R. (1975). *Qualitative differences in learning as a function of the learner´s conception of the task*. Göteborg: Studies in Educational Sciences. 14.

Tadeusiewicz G.(1997): Edukacja w Europie, PWN, Warszawa–Lódz´.

Talja, Sanna (1999): Analyzing Qualitative Interview Data: The Discourse Analytic Method. *Library & Information Science Research,* Vol. 21, Number 4, 459–477.

Teichler U., Kehm B. (1996): Ku nowemu rozumieniu relacji mie?dzy szkolnictwem wyz?szym a s´wiatem pracy, Nauka i Szkolnictwo Wyz?sze, nr 7.

The World Bank (1994): Higher Education, the Lessons of Experience, Washington, D.C.

Tunnermann C. (1996): A New Vision of Higher Education, Higher Education, Paris UNESCO (1995): Policy Paper for Change and Development in Higher Education, Paris UNESCO (1999).

Van Dijk Teun A, ed. (1997 a).: Discourse as Social Interaction. Vol.2 of *Discourse Studies: A Multidisciplinarty Introduction.* SAGE Publications, London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi.

Van Dijk Teun A, ed..(1997 b): Discourse as Structure and Process. Vol. 1 of *Discourse Studies: A Multidisciplinarty Introduction.* SAGE Publications, London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi.

Veblen, T (1998), Teoria klasy prozniaczej. Warszawa: Muza S.A.

Webler, Wolff–Dietrich (1990): Externe Einflüsse auf die Hochschulen, in Teichler, U. (Hrsg.): Das Hochschulwesen in der Bundesrepublik Deutschland, Weinheim, p. 64 ff.

Wenger, E. (1998) Communities of Practice. Learning, Meaning, and Identity. Cambridge University Press.

Vernon, D.T.A. & Blake, R.L. (1993) Does problem–based learning work? A metaanalysis of evaluative work. *Academic Medicine*, 68:550–563.

Veen, van der R. (2000): The Deeper Layers of Learning. Paper presented at the Adult Education Research Conference, June 2–4, 2000. Vancouver, British Columbia.

Webler, W–D. (1988). Forschungsfelder und Perspektiven der Hochschulforschung. In: Christoph Oehler und Wolff–Dietrich Webler (Hrsg.): Forschungspotentiale sozialwissenschaftlicher Hochschulforschung, Weinheim.

Willis, S.C., Jones, A. & O'Neill, P. (2002) "Can undergraduate education have an effect on the ways in which pre-registration house officers conceptualise communication?" Medical Education, Vol. 37, pp. 603-608.

How to obtain EU publications

Our priced publications are available from EU Bookshop (http://bookshop.europa.eu/), where you can place an order with the sales agent of your choice.

The Publications Office has a worldwide network of sales agents. You can obtain their contact details by sending a fax to (352) 29 29-42758.

Publications Office

Publications.europa.eu